The Dominance of Established Equivalent
in the Metaphor Translation

Dwi Aji Prajoko[1]
{dwiaji.prajoko@gmail.com[1]}
Universitas Katolik Widya Mandala Surabaya[1]

Abstract. This study aimed to describe the techniques used in the translation of the conceptual metaphor expressions. The data were linguistic units in the form of words, phrases, or clauses about the American dream expressed in conceptual metaphor. The sources of the data were the original novel entitled *The Great Gatsby* and its Indonesian versions translated successively by Nataresmi (2010) and Verawaty (2010). Data collection was carried out by document analysis and focus group discussions (FGD). The result of the study showed that the most dominant techniques were established equivalent. The dominance is caused by the availability of similar metaphorical expressions in the target language as the equivalent and the stock of similar metaphorical concepts in the target language that make the translators create new expressions. Modulation in the third position is also interesting since metaphors with different expressions and concepts are possible to be translated.

Keywords: translation, conceptual metaphor, technique, established equivalent

1. Introduction

A translation technique called established equivalent can be used only if a term or expression used in the source language (SL) is recognized by dictionaries or language in use as an equivalent in the target language (TL) [1]. Recognized by dictionaries and language in use implies that both languages have similar expressions. Since it is about metaphor translation, the similarities are against some experts saying that Thai and Japanese are close in term of using metaphorical concept; those two Asian countries share a monistic character; they do not rigidly separate between head and heart. Emotive and rational aspects are integrated in their interpersonal relationship reflected in their metaphor. On the contrary, English is dualistic so there is a sharp dichotomy between emotions (heart) and rationality (head/mind) [2]. If Indonesian is similar to the other two Asian languages, metaphor translation from English into Indonesian does not enjoy any facilitation. This is strengthened by the standpoint that readers will be difficult to understand metaphorical expressions based on different conceptual metaphors (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003) [3].

Mccune (1985) [4], however, empirically proves that English and Indonesian have similarities; he finds nine similar metaphorical concepts, namely CORRECTNES IS STRAIGHTNESS, THOUGHTS ARE MOTIONS, TIME IS SPACE, CHANGE IS MOTION, HEARING IS TOUCHING, UNPLEASANTNESS IS SHARPNESS, INTERELATING IS TOUCHING, SOUND IS A SUBSTANCE, CONCIOUSNESS IS A FLUID. He investigates that the similarities are caused by human cognition and borrowing. All humans are very likely to have a common understanding for certain things because of their belonging to the same race: human beings. The notion of borrowing is analogous to the case of English which also borrows a lot of metaphors from Hebrew culture through the Bible.

The dominance of establised equivalent may make moniistic-dualistic approach causing the differences insignificant. Nevertheless, the dominance may refer to something more than

strengthening the human cognition and borrowing thesis. Hopefully, this research finds some new perspectives on metaphor translation and triggers the other researchers to find more.

2. Methodology

2.1 The design of the study

This research is qualitative; accordingly, it is descriptive because the data are mostly in the form of words. Numbers used are not the formulas of quantitative research. Furthermore, this qualitative research includes content analysis, case studies, and comparative studies, which are actually research methods. This confirms that, "Qualitative research is an umbrella term under which a variety of research methods that use languaged data are clustered" (Polkinghorne, 2005) [5].

2.2 Subjects of the research

Subjects of the researh are a data validater, raters, and the researcher. A data validater is an expert who decides whether the data about American dream expressed in metaphors gathered by the researcher are valid. Raters are translation experts who determine translation techniques; the raters are a translation proffesor and three senior doctorate students majoring in translation including the researcher.

2.3 Data collection procedures

The data were American dream metaphorical expressions found in the novel The Great Gatsby (TGG) witten by Fitzgerald [6] and in its two Indonesian versions in which one was translated by Nataresmi (TGG-N) [7] and the other by Verawaty (TGG-V) [8]. The data about American dream metaphorical expressions and their translations were collected by analizing documents, namely the original novel and the two translations. The data were also about the translations techniques used by the two translators. These ones were obtained through focus group discussions (FGD).

2.4 Data analysis techniques

The research data analysis techniques were domain analysis, taxonomic analysis, componential analysis, and cultural theme analysis (Spradley, 2007) [9]. The domain analysis was used to include the data about the American dream metaphorical expressions and to exclude the others. The taxonomic analysis was to analyze all of the data based on predefined domains, namely the translation techniques. The componential analysis was to compare between the translation techniques of TGG-N and that of TGG-V. The cultural theme analysis was to conclude the relationship patterns between the domains and how they were linked to the culture as a whole.

3. Findings and Discussion

3.1 Translation techniques of metaphor in TGG

Molina & Albir (2002) have 18 techniques of translation [1]. Nevertheless, this research integrates word to word translation to literal; but explicitation, addition, paraphrase, and footnote are counted individually. Similarly, pure borrowing and naturalized borrowing are counted two and so are implicitation and deletion. Accordingly, they are 22 techniques alltogether. The ones used in TGG-N and TGG-V are thirdteen, namely adaptation, addition, deletion, discursive creation, explicitation, established equivalent, generalisation, literal, modulation, particularisation, pure borrowing, reduction, transposition. It can be seen in the Table 1

Table 1
Translation technique of American dream metaphor

No	Translation technique	TGG-N (Sum / Percentage)	TGG-V (Sum / Percentage)	Percentage average
1.	Established equivalent	100 / 41,67	147 / 61,25	51,46
2.	Explicitation	38 / 15,83	45 / 18,75	17,29
3.	Modulation	40 / 16,67	13 / 5,42	11,04
4.	Discursive creation	36 / 15,00	13 / 5,42	10,20
5.	Deletion	9 / 3,75	4 / 1,67	2,70
6.	Transposition	4 / 1,67	3 / 1,25	1,46
7.	Literal	1 / 0,42	4 / 1,67	1,04
8.	Established equivalent + Reduction	2 / 0,83	2 / 0,83	0,83
9.	Generalisation	2 / 0,83	1 / 0,42	0,64
10.	Pure borrowing	1 / 0,42	1 / 0,42	0,42
11.	Established equivalent + Pure borrowing	1 / 0,42	1 / 0,42	0,42
12.	Established equivalent + Discursive creation	1 / 0,42	1 / 0,42	0,42
13.	Particularisation	1 / 0,42	0 / 0	0,21
14.	Established equivalent + Explicitation	1 / 0,42	0 / 0	0,21
15.	Explicitation + Discursive creation	1 / 0,42	0 / 0	0,21
16.	Modulation + Pure borrowing	1 / 0,42	0 / 0	0,21
17.	Established equivalent + Addition	1 / 0,42	0 / 0	0,21
18.	Adaptation	0 / 0	1 / 0,42	0,21
19.	Established equivalent + Adaptation	0 / 0	1 / 0,42	0,21
20.	Transposition + Pure borrowing	0 / 0	1 / 0,42	0,21
21.	Literal + Deletion	0 / 0	1 / 0,42	0,21
	Total	240 / 100	240 / 100	100

American dream expressed in metaphor are the criteria of data inclusion. American dream cannot be separated from happiness (the goal), wealth (the means to reach the goal), and conducive situation: optimism, opportumity, and hardworking [10]. Metaphorical expressions are linguistic manivestation of the metaphorical concept; metaphor itself is just about saying

one thing in terms of another [3]. Some data in the following are elaborated based on the notions while their techniques are categorized with Molina and Albir's ideas [1].

3.1.1 Established equivalent

Established equivalent is a translation technique using terms or expressions or commonly known as equivalents in the TL. They are recognized by dictionaries or language in use [1].

Table 2. Translating with established equivalent

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
104/TGG/64 But I am slow-thinking and full of interior rules that act as *brakes* on my desires	DESIRES ARE A SPEEDING CAR / Conducive situation	104/TGG/64 But I am slow-thinking and full of interior rules that act as *brakes* on my desires	Established equivalent

Nick is often referred to as the personification of an unspoiled American dream; this is because, among other things, his adherence to various regulations for him serves as a brake on certain desires that can disrupt the focus or pollute the process of achieving his American dreams. Accordingly, this attitude belongs to the conducive situation of the American dream. The word *brakes* in "*brakes* on my desires" is the datum because it is a metaphor based on the metaphorical concept DESIRES ARE A SPEEDING CAR.

Established equivalent is the technique used in translating the word *brakes* into *rem* due to two reasons. Firstly, the word *rem* is the equivalent of *brake* in English-Indonesian dictionary (Echols & Shadily, 2010) [11]. Secondly, the metaphorical expression *rem* based on DESIRES ARE A SPEEDING CAR is widely used in Indonesian such as "*rem* atas hasrat/keinginan/ambisi/hawa nafsu" (brake on desire/want/ambition/lust) et cetera.

3.1.2. Explicitation

Explicitation is a translation technique that converts implicit information in the SL into detailed or explicit information in the TL [1].

Table 3. Translating with explicitation

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
023/TGG/8 ... but now he'd left Chicago and come east in a fashion that rather *took your breath away*	WONDER IS A BREATH TAKER/ Wealth	023/TGG-V/15 ... dan sekarang dia telah meninggalkan Chicago dan datang ke East dengan gaya yang akan *membuatmu tercengang*.	Explicitation

Tom Buchanan's wealth, exemplified by his carrying along with many expensive ponies when moving from Lake Forest to East, surprises many people; this astonishment is expressed metaphorically with *took your breath away* based on the metaphorical concept WONDER IS A BREATH TAKER. Therefore, the phrase *took your breath away* becomes the datum.

Explicitation causes the metaphorical expression *took your breath away* to be translated into *membuatmu tercengang* (make you get amazed). The reason is that the TL phrase whose meaning is implied by metaphorical expression becomes the SL phrase whose meaning is explicit. The SL metaphor, whose meaning is implicit, is not retained. The same thing happens

when *enormously* in "His family were *enormously* wealthy" (022 / TGG / 8) is translated as *sangat* (very) in "Keluarganya *sangat* kaya" (022/TGG-N/7).

3.1.3 Modulation

Modulation is a translation technique that changes the point of view, focus, or cognitive categories [1].

Table 4. Translating with modulation

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
018/TGG/7 To the wingless a more *arresting* phenomenon is their dissimilarity in every particular except shape and size.	A PHENOMENON IS A HOLDER / Happiness	018/TGG-N/6-7 Sedangkan bagi makhluk tanpa sayap, manusia, fenomena paling *menarik* adalah ketidaksamaan dalam setiap hal, kecuali bentuk dan ukuran.	Modulation

Living in the same neighborhood as Gatsby in West Egg, Nick Carraway admires the beauty of the natural surroundings such as the birds loving to fly above him; the positive emotion is included in the most important domain of American dreams: happiness. Nick consideres the natural beauty that makes him happy as an *arresting* phenomenon based on the metaphorical concept A PHENOMENON IS A HOLDER. Therefore, the word *arresting* is the datum.

There is a debate among the raters regarding the translation technique used. First, the two raters classify it as established equivalent; the reason is that in this context *menarik* is seen in the dictionary and in the language use as the equivalent of *arresting*. Secondly, the other two raters identify it as modulation because there is a change in perspective. The word *arresting* meaning *catching* has a cognitive category which is different from its translation, namely *menarik* (pulling) although both have the same metaphorical concept. Because both arguments are strong while the decision must be made, it is stated that the technique is modulation merely because the writer is on the side of such an opinion.

3.1.4 Discursive creation

Discursive creation is a translation technique that establishes a temporary equivalence that is totally unpredictable out of context [1].

Table 5. Translating with discursive creation

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
044/TGG/16 He reads *deep* books with long words in them.	BOOKS ARE DEPTH / Conducive situation	044/TGG-N/18-9 Ia membaca *dengan tekun* buku-buku yang berisi tulisan panjang."	Discursive creation

Quality books that have a high level of difficulty metaphorically in English are often referred to as *deep* books. It is based on the metaphorical concept BOOKS ARE DEPTH. Nick expresses his appreciation to Gatsby who has a positive view on books by studying such books. Gatsby's attitude belongs to the domain of the conducive situation in achieving the American dream. Therefore, *deep* becomes the datum.

When *Kucumbui Tubuh Indahku* (I fondle my beautiful body), a drama film directed by Garin Nugroho, is translated into *Memories of My Body* (*Kenangan Tubuhku*), the translation can be justified in certain contexts, namely for eye catching so as to attract people to watch the movie. This creative creation is called discursive creation. Similarly, the phrase *dengan tekun* (diligently) in the discourse is also clear and natural. However, it is against the translation techniques working for the equivalent. This is, therefore, classified as discursive creation. The word *deep* in *deep* book which means quality and difficult explaining the book, while the word *diligently* modifies *reading*. Besides, it is not the equivalent of *deep*.

3.1.5 Deletion

Deletion is a translation technique that eliminates the SL words in the TL; the words are deleted, not reduced, not implied, or others [1].

Table 6. Translating with deletion

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
020/TGG/8 Across the courtesy bay the white palaces of *fashionable* East Egg glittered along the water.	MODERN IS FASHIONABLE / Wealth	020/TGG-N/7 Di seberang teluk kecil, bangunan-bangunan berwarna putih berjejer di tepian air sepanjang East Egg yang gemerlapan.	Deletion

Portraits of America in the 1920s are recorded by Fitzgerald in the novel The Great Gatsby published in 1926. In those days, the term *flappers* appears to refer to the style of American women in that era. They have changed a lot. It can be traced in various mass media that their thoughts and attitudes are more open and prominent. Their makeup, hair styles, and manners of dress also look more fashionable. Not surprisingly, the phrase *fashionable* is adopted to represent that era. The phrase *fasionable* East Egg refers to various buildings in the region inhabited by very wealthy persons. This becomes the datum since it is an American dream domain and a linguistic manifestation of the metaphorical concept MODERN IS FASHIONABLE.

The word *fashionable* characterizes East Egg like a person who always follows the era progress so that they are beautiful. However, the metaphor is omitted in the translation. Deletion translation technique is used. Deletion also occurs when *flower-like way* (058/TGG/23) explaining Daisy is also lost in translation. The translated text loses information about Daisy's manner who is beautiful like a flower.

3.1.6 Transposition

Transposition is a translation technique that changes the SL grammatical categories into the TL ones [1].

Table 7. Translating with transposition

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
007/TGG/4 ... some heightened sensitivity to the *promises* of life ...	LIFE IS A GENEROUS PERSON / Conducive situation	007/TGG-N/3 ... sesuatu yang menunjukkan kepekaan tinggi pada kehidupan yang *menjanjikan* ...	Transposition

Gatsby has a high sensitivity to the promises of life; this shows the optimistic attitude which is included in the domain of the American dream. Therefore, the word *promises* in "*promises* of life" is data because it is also a linguistic metaphor based on the metaphorical concept LIFE IS A GENEROUS PERSON.

According to the word class, *promises* is a noun while *promising* is an adjective so that the word class has changed. The translation technique that changes grammatical category is transposition. This also happens when the noun *burst* in "vacuous *bursts* of laughter" (090 / TGG / 51) is translated into the adjective *pecah* (broken) in "gelak tawa terus *pecah*" (090/TGG-N/64).

3.1.7 Literal

Literal is a translation technique that includes the word-for-word translation technique ignoring TL structures to the literal translation that obeying the TL structures; however, this technique produces a context-out translation [1].

Table 8. Translating with literal

Source language	Metaphorical concept / American dream domain	Target language	Translation technique
105/TGG/65 Every one suspects himself of at least one of *the cardinal virtues*, and this is mine	PERSONS ARE GOODNESS / Conducive situation	105/TGG-V/95 Setiap orang mengira-ngira dirinya memiliki sesuatu atau setidaknya salah satu *kardinal kebajikan*, dan inilah kebajikanku	Literal

Nick believes he is taking part in making a better world; he claims to do at least one of the main virtues. This positive attitude towards oneself is encompassed by the domain of the conducive situation of the American dream. Next, the phrase *the cardinal virtues* becomes the datum because the metaphorical expression is based on the metaphorical concept PERSONS ARE GOODNESS.

The cardinal is the main official in the Roman Catholic Church who is hierarchically positioned only under the Pope. Therefore, *cardinal virtues* should be translated into *kebajikan kardinal* if you want to retain the metaphor or *kebijakan utama* if you want to make it explicit. The phrase *kardinal kebajikan* is literal since it is word-to-word translation that is out of context. It can be seen that the SL and TL phrases use the same structure, namely modifier (*cardinal*/*kardinal*) followed by modified (*virtue*/*kebajikan*) in which they do not adjust Indonesian structure.

3.2 Metaphor translation technique similarities

TGG-N and TGG-V have some similarities. Firstly, both versions manipulate target language-oriented techniques TGG-N gets 98,32 % and TGG-V 96,65 %. The TL oriented techniques used by TGG-N are established equivalent, explicitation, modulation, discursive creation, deletion, transposition, established equivalent + reduction, generalisation, established equivalent + discursive creation, particularisation, established equivalent + explicitation, explicitation + discursive creation, established equivalent + addition. The SL oriented techniques are only literal, pure borrowing, established equivalent + pure borrowing, modulation + pure borrowing. The TL oriented techniques used by TGG-V are established equivalent, explicitation, modulation, discursive creation, deletion, transposition, established equivalent + reduction, generalisation, established equivalent + discursive creation, adaptation,

established equivalent + adaptation. The SL oriented techniques used by TGG-V are only literal, pure borrowing, established equivalent + pure borrowing, transposition + pure borrowing, literal + deletion. Deletetion is used after considering that the expression is not important in the TL. Similarly, discursive creation is to attract the TL readers. Thus, both are TL techniques. Some data translated by the combination of TL and SL oriented techniques are grouped into SL oriented techniques. Secondly, the target language-oriented techniques are dominated by established equivalent; TGG-N 41,67 % and TGG-V 61,9%. Thirdly, the gaps between established equivalent and the other techniques are very large. The difference between established equivalent and the second rank technique is 25,83 % in the TGG-N and 42,5 % in the TGG-V.

3.3 Reasons for the dominance

Estabished equivalent techniques are dominant for two reasons. For one thing, metaphorical expression similarities can cause the data to be translated with established equivalent techniques since the expressions are found in dictionaries or in language use. For example, *advantage* in "all the people in this world haven't had the *advantages* that you've had" (001/TGG/3) is translated into *keberuntungan* in "tidak semua orang di dunia ini memiliki *keberuntungan* sepertimu." Another, metaphorical concept similarities can also cause the translators to create new expressions as the equivalent because they sound familiar eventhough they are not found on any dictionaries and language use. For example, *full of money* in "Her voice is *full of money*" (190/TGG/128) is translated into *dipenuhi harta* in "Suaranya *dipenuhi harta*" (190/TGG-N/171). Both expressions are based on the same metaphorical concept GOOD QUALITY IS WEALTH which also breeds very familiar Indonesian phrase, namely "suara *emas*."

Besides the dominance of establised equivalent, modulation techniques in the third rank show Indonesian language flexibility. English and Indonesian metaphors can be totally different. However, the translation is still possible. For example, the metaphorical expression *had* in "I *had* that familiar conviction" (012/TGG/6) based on the metaphorical concept CONFIDENCE IS POSSESION is translated with the different expression *merasakan* in "aku *merasakan* sebuah keyakinan yang telah akrab" (012/TGG-N/5) based on the different metaphorical concept CONFIDENCE IS SENSUALITY.

3.4 Implications of the dominance

Three new perpectives can be generated from this research. Firstly, gone is the foreshadowing that translating English metaphor into Indonesian would find a lot of difficulties. Berendt & Tanita (2011) [2] have highlighted the valuable differences between Eropean and Asian metaphors. This research, however, finds a lot of similarities not only between English and Indonesian metaphorical concepts but also between those two language metaphorical expressions. This also means that nine English and Indonesian similarities in terms of metaphorical concepts found by McCune (1985) [4] is an iceberg phenomenon. Secondly, the definition of established equivalent must be wider. It should not only cover the finding of words in dictionaries or in language use as the equivalent (Molina & Albir 2002) [1] but also include the establishment of metaphorical concepts that their linguistic manivestations called metaphorical expressions have not found in dictionaries or language use. Thirdly, the notion that any conceptual metaphor cannot be understood by readers having different conceptual metaphor (Lakoff & Johnson, 2003) [3] can be broken by translation. Modulation technique can be a bridge for that gap.

4. Conclusion

The most commonly used translation techniques for the American dream metaphor of The Great Gatsby translated by Nataresmi and The Great Gatsby translated by Verawaty are the established equivalent, followed by the other three techniques with considerably wide gap, namely modulation, exploitation, and discursive creation. The dominance of the established equivalent technique in the translation of the American dream metaphor is influenced by two things. For one thing, metaphorical expressions in the source language are found in dictionaries or language in use in the target language. Another, authentic metaphorical expressions in the source language are not found in dictionaries or language in use in the target language, but new metaphorical expressions are created on the basis of the similar metaphorical concepts. Besides, modulation techniques in the third rank show the possibility of translating expressions eventhough the source and target languages have different metaphorical concepts.

This research, therefore, raises three new perspectives. Firstly, the foreshadowing of the difficulties in translating English metaphor into Indonesian is gone; a lot of similarities between English and Indonesian metaphors facilitate their translation. Secondly, the definition of established equivalent in metaphor translation may include the similar metaphorical concepts that very possibly produce familiar equivalent. Thirdly, the notion that any expressions cannot be understood by readers because of having different conceptual metaphors can be broken by translation especially by using a modulation technique.

References

[1] L. Molina and A. H. Albir, "Translation technique revisited: A dynamic and funcsionalist approach," *Meta: Translators' Journal,* vol. 47, no. 4, pp. 498-512, 2002.

[2] E. A. Berendt and K. Tanita, "The 'heart' of things: A conceptual metaphoric analysis of *heart* and related body parts in Thai, Japanese and English," *Intercultural Communication Studies,* vol. 20, no. 1, pp. 65-78, 2011.

[3]. G. Lakoff and M. Johnson, *Metaphors We Live by.* London, England: The University of Chicago Press, 2003.

[4] K. M. McCune, "The internal structure of Indonesian roots," part 1. *Nusa, Linguistic Studies of Indonesian and Other Languages in Indonesia,* vol. 21/22, pp. 87-121, 1985.

[5] D. E. Polkinghorne, "Language and meaning: Data collection in qualitative research," *Journal of Counseling Psychology,* vol. 52, no. 2, pp. 137-145, 2005.

[6] F. S. Fitzgerald, *The Great Gatsby.* (1925). Accessed [Online]: Apr. 13, 2014. Available: http://ebooks.adelaide.edu.au/

[7] F. S. Fitzgerald, *The Great Gatsby,* trans.: Sri Nur Verawati, Jakarta, Indonesia: Serambi (in Indonesian), 2010.

[8] F. S. Fitzgerald, *The Great Gatsby*, trans.: Ulya Nataresmi, Surabaya, Indonesia: Selazar (in Indonesian), 2010.

[9] J. P. Spradley, *The Etnographic Interview,* 2nd ed., trans.: Misbah Zulfa Elizabeth. Yogyakarta, Indonesia: Tiara Wacana, (in Indonesian) 2007.

[10] H. B. Johnson, *The American Dream and the Power of Wealth*. New York: Routledge, 2006.

[11] J. M. Echols and H. Shadily, *Kamus Inggris Indonesia*. Jakarta, Indonesia: Gramedia, 2010.