The Editor's Decisions in Editing Translation of Novel
By The Time You Read This I'll Be Dead

Arini Syahadah, M.R. Nababan, Riyadi Santosa, Djatmika
{arinsya@student.uns.ac.id, amantaradja.nababan_2017@staff.uns.ac.id, riyadisantosa@staff.uns.ac.id, djatmika@staff.uns.ac.id}

Postgraduate Program in Linguistics, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia 57126

Abstract – A published translation is not a translator's original work. Many studies that have investigated the published translation give their suggestions only to the translator. In fact, there is an editor who handles the translator's work and be the last decision maker of the work. The study of editor's decision becomes crucial considering a few studies have investigated this topic. Hence, this article reveals the editor's decision in editing the translator's work (draft). The study was done by identifying the clauses edited by the editor, including the source text, draft (translator) version, and edited (editor) version; then classifying them into the terms of the editor's decisions. The data were collected through purposive sampling from Julie Anne Peters' novel entitled *By The Time You Read This I'll Be Dead*. Meanwhile, the classification of editor's decisions was done along with raters in focus group discussion. The results show that the editor changes the language style from informal to formal and conversely; changes the dictions; implies, explicates, and paraphrases the clauses; reduces and deletes the information; changes the target language into source language; adds, deletes, and changes the punctuation; and changes the word order. The editor's decision that is significant is change the informal language style into the formal one. Furthermore, the editor is not consistent in editing the language style.

Keywords: editor's decision, translator, published translation, draft, editing

1   Introduction

Before published, a draft of novel translation translated by translator will be edited by an editor. Both translator and editor are working with the same aim – to produce a high-quality novel translation that does justice to the original text while being accessible and compelling for the target readers [1]. Both translator and editor have their important roles. A good translator should be creative and imaginative yet maintain the author's style, message or uniqueness [1]. Meanwhile, an editor has to check and edit it as an original book. The editor is playing the important part in translation [2] since he is someone in charge of the translation work [3]. The editor is someone who takes decisions on translator's translation (draft) before being printed and published.

Many studies have been discussed the novel translation as if it is an original work of the translator. Most of them have been offered suggestions regarding the translation techniques to the translators in order to produce a good quality translation. Whereas, the translation quality is

not only the translator's responsibility, it is the editor's as well. They do not discuss the editor's decisions in editing stage of the translation. The study of comparing the translation before and after editing is still limited since the data source of the draft before editing is difficult to obtain and the translator or editor is not willing to get involved within. The only study that has been discussed the published translation before and after editing is done on children's science book [4]. It, however, just limited on the scientific terms.

The present study investigates the editor's decisions in editing the draft of novel translation. The editor's decisions are visible through the differences of novel translation before and after editing stage. This study focuses on those differences on the conversation of all characters in the novel and its narration as well. The translation is from English into Indonesian. Specifically, this study aims to identify the decisions made by the editor in editing the draft of novel translation translated by the translator.

One of interesting literary works to be analyzed is novel entitled *By the Time You Read this I'll be Dead* by Julie Anne Peters (2010). This novel is interesting to be studied as it provides the data regarding the editor's decisions in editing stage. First, this novel is targeted for teenagers with informal language style but the editor changes the language style into formal one, especially when it comes from the online conversation among the characters. Then, this novel tells about bullying and bullycide (commit suicide because of being targeted of bullying). The bullycide is done with the intention of removing all burdens in mind. This happens for various reasons, from depression to uncontrolled emotions. Some kids being bullied are so tormented that suicide has become an alternative for them [5]. Daelyn, the main character of the novel, is a bullying target from her friends at school. She experiences three kinds of bullying, that are physical bullying, verbal bullying, and social bullying. The writer of the novel shows how tormented her life for many years so she really wants to end her life. In fact, the editor makes some deletions on the important parts of Daelyn's bullying. This novel tries to prevent bullying that often occurs among teenagers, both at school, the environment, and on social media.

The involvement of editor in producing translation work aims to produce a good translation work along with the translator. In this case, an editor plays two editorial roles – editor of the translation and editor of the book, since he brings a fresh pair of eyes and will spot anomalies that translators may have missed on even a third or fourth reading [1]. Therefore, the editor's role becomes crucial since he checks and corrects the errors of the translator's work until it is proper to be printed and published. However, the good editor has to treat translator's voice as the voice of the author and make that voice consistent and does not try to rewrite a book in their own new voice or over-correct language [1].

The editor is charged for being accurate of the errors regarding the grammar, punctuation, fact, and style. This is in line with Paul's statement [1] that some aims of editing stage are producing a work that is free from typographical, grammatical errors and unacceptable usage; and well punctuated; consistent in facts, spelling and usage; factually accurate; written well in appropriate style regarding its subject matter. In this case, the appropriate style for novel is informal style, since it is a literary work and the target readers are teenagers or young adult readers.

The language style is one of interesting cases in this study for it has an important effect for literary study [6]. The language style is the literary element that shows the ways of the author uses words to describes events, objects, and ideas. The style represented by the author influences how we interpret the facts and characters that are presented in the text. This study distinguishes the language style into two types – formal or standard language and informal language. Formal and informal languages have different purposes. Formal language is used when writing for professional or academic purposes [7]. While informal language is usually used for daily conversation and literary works. The characteristics of formal language is that it does not use colloquialisms, contractions or first person pronouns such as 'I' or 'We' [7], on the contrary, informal language does. Jones in Baker & Saldanha [8] states that a literary work is a text with typical characteristic of language style, such as ambiguous and/or indeterminable meanings, 'poetic' language use and heteroglossia, and minoritized styles – styles outside the dominant standard language such as slang.

2   Research Method

This study uses the qualitative research method in describing the editor's decision in editing translation of novel *By the Time You Read this I'll be Dead*. The novel is a novel for young adult readers. Therefore, the genre is targeted to teenagers from 12 to 18 years of age, approximately half of young adult readers are adults. The sources of data are novel *by the Time You Read this I'll be Dead* by Julie Anne Peters (2010), its Indonesian translation by translator, and its edited translation by editor. Julie Anne Peters has published 20 novels and they have been published in numerous countries according to National Book Foundation [9]. The novel was selected as the edited translation of this novel contains interesting cases to be analyzed. They are changing from formal language into non-formal language conversely, reducing even deleting the translation, overcorrecting the translation, changing the style into formal language without paying attention to the context, and changing the translation (from target text back into source text). By comparing both texts (translation before editing or draft and translation after editing or edited), it is hoped that this research provides information about editing decision made by editor before the translation is being published.

The data obtained in this study were 362 data. The data include the conversation of all characters in the novel and its narration as well. The characters in the novel are Daelyn as the main character, her father (Chip), her mother (Kim), Santana, her friends and teachers, and Santana's mother. The data were collected by using content analysis, questionnaire, and focus group discussion (FGD). The content analysis was used to compare the translation work before and after editing process. The content analysis was done by identifying all clauses in novel *By the Time You Read this I'll be Dead* on which the translation (draft) changed by the editor; and classifying the changes into the terms of the editor's decisions. The identification involved three texts, that are the source text, its translation (draft by the translator), and its edited version (the work of the editor). Meanwhile, the classification was done with raters in focus-group discussion by using the questionnaire. As there are few studies investigated this topic, the researcher

extracted the term of editing decision along with raters. The raters involved in this study are three translation experts who are professional in this field.

3   Result and Discussion

By the Time You Read this I'll be Dead is a novel about bullying that makes the victims eager to attempt suicide and end their lives. The main character of the novel is Daelyn Rice, a young girl who went through many years of bullying that makes her attempt many trials of suicide.

From the identification, there are 362 data that shows the change in editing stage. The result of the study showed that there are 16 decisions made by the editor in editing the novel entitled *by the Time You Read this I'll be Dead*. The Table 1 below shows the distribution of editor's decisions in editing the draft of the translation.

Table 1. Distribution of editor's decisions

No.	Decisions	Total	Percentage
1.	Changing into informal	117	31,45
2.	Deleting the translation	83	22,31
3.	Correcting	49	13,17
4.	Changing into formal	44	11,83
5.	Making the meaning implicit	29	7,79
6.	Adding punctuation	9	2,42
7.	Making the meaning explicit	8	2,15
8.	Reducing the translation	6	1,61
9.	Modulating	5	1,34
10.	Changing the diction	5	1,34
11.	Changing into formal without noticing the context	4	1,08
12.	Hyper correcting	4	1,08
13.	Reducing the punctuation	3	0,81
14.	Changing into source language	3	0,81
15.	Establishing the equivalence	2	0,54
16.	Adding the translation	1	0,27
	Total	372	100

Table 1 shows that from 16 decisions, the most decision made by editor is changing the language style into informal with the percentage of 31,45% and the least decision made by editor is adding the translation with the percentage of 0,27%.

Changing into informal

The informal style is commonly used in novel as it is a literary work. Jones in Baker & Saldanha [8] states that a literary work is a text with typical characteristic of language style, such as

ambiguous and/or indeterminable meanings, 'poetic' language use and heteroglossia, and minoritized styles – styles outside the dominant standard language such as slang. It is showed in Example 1 below how the editor changes the style of the translation draft.

Example 1:
ST   : For a minute I think he's here to contact me, *but* that would be stupid. (p. 3)
Draft   : Untuk beberapa saat, kupikir dia ada di sini untuk mengontakku, *tetapi* itu pikiran bodoh.
Edited   : Untuk beberapa saat, kupikir dia ada di sini untuk mengontakku, *tapi* itu pikiran bodoh. (p. 1)

In the example above, the word *but* is translated by translator into *tetapi* then it is changed by the editor into *tapi*. The word *tetapi* and *tapi* have the same meaning – used to introduce a phrase or clause contrasting with what has already been mentioned. However, they have different usage regarding the language style. *Tetapi* is used in formal situation or standard language, while *tapi* is used in informal situation or non-standard language. The style shift in the form of elevated formality is considered commendable for teen readers.

Another example of changing the language style from formal into informal is shown in the following example – the use of word *orang tua* and *orangtua* in the target language.

Example 2:
ST   : But we will restrict your usage with *parental* controls and traces, the way we did before.
Draft   : Namun, kami akan membatasi penggunaanmu dengan kontrol dan penelusuran *orang tua*; seperti yang mereka lakukan sebelumnya.
Edited   : Namun, kami akan membatasi penggunaanmu dengan kontrol dan penelusuran *orangtua*; seperti yang mereka lakukan sebelumnya.

In the example 2, the word *parental* is translated by the translator into *orang tua* then it is edited by the editor into *orangtua*. The word *orang tua* is a formal or standard form in the target language. The translator uses word *orang tua* adhering to the Indonesian dictionary. Meanwhile, the word *orangtua* is non-standard form used by the editor to elevated formality considering that the language style of literary work is spoken language.

Deleting the translation

The study finds that the editor deletes a lot of translations of the draft (22,31%). As a result, the edited translation loses the novel author's messages as they are not conveyed in the translation. This decision also results in the lowest level of accuracy, acceptability and readability.

Example 3:
ST   : *His lips touch mine*. (p.179)
Draft   : *Bibirnya menyentuh bibirku*.
Edited   : - (p. 278)

The situational context is that Daelyn is at Santana's house and they are alone at his house. She experienced the shock that makes her tense as suddenly Santana kisses her on the lips. This situation is important to be conveyed as it can describe Daelyn's feeling. The editor, however, deletes that translation because it sounds vulgar for the teen readers of the target language. It results in losing the important message of what makes Daelyn feel shocked. The deleting decision decreases the translation quality as well.

Correcting

Correcting decision in this study means that the editor corrects a word, phrase, or clause of the translation draft as the meaning is not equivalent. The study shows that editor managed to correct the draft of translation to be more equivalent to the source text as much 13,17%. The correcting decision results in increasing the translation quality.

Example 4:
ST   : 'Rat us out and we'll kill you, *p*ig.' (p. 99)
Draft   : 'Adukan kami, dan kami akan membunuhmu, *b*abi.
Edited : 'Adukan kami, dan kami akan membunuhmu, *B*abi. (p. 156)

The situational context is that Daelyn experienced sexual assault by her school friends who made her as bullying target. The example above is the utterance said by Toomey who is threatening her. He addresses Daelyn as *pig*. In Indonesian, the addressing term used in conversation has to be written in capital letter. Therefore, the editor corrects the letter *b* from *babi* into *Babi* to adjust with the Indonesian spelling system.

Changing into formal

The formal language style is usually used in writing for professional or academic purposes. This study recognized that the editor is inconsistent in editing the style of the translation draft. As we could see in the Example 1 and Example 2, the editor changes the language style from formal into informal style. However, this study finds that in some cases (11,83% of the data) the editor changes the language style in the opposite way as well, see Example 5 below.

Example 5:
ST   : When your waffles and strawberries are pureed and *sip*ped through a straw? (p. 37)
Draft   : Bila wafel dan stroberimu ditumbuk dan di*hisap* lewat sedotan?
Edited : Bila wafel dan stroberimu ditumbuk dan di*isap* lewat sedotan? (p. 59)

In the example above, the word *sip* is translated by translator into *hisap* then it is changed by the editor into *isap*. The word *hisap* and *isap* refer to one meaning – drink something by taking small amount. However, they have different usage regarding the language style. The word *hisap* is informal form of *isap*. In other word, *isap* is the formal form – adhering to the Indonesian dictionary. However, the formal language is used when writing for professional or academic purposes [7].

Furthermore, in novel *By the Time You Read this I'll be Dead*, the author represents informal language style in the novel since it is literary work that has teenagers as the target reader. The informal

style represented by the author is shown in numerous usage of contraction form such as I'll, can't, doesn't, don't, didn't, they're, shoulda, and so on. The informal style of the novel, then, is changed into formal style even inconsistent style of language in the edited translation. However, Christina in Paul [1] argues that an editor has to treat the voice of the translator as the voice of the author and try to make that voice consistent.

Making the meaning implicit

Implicitation means hiding information that is explicit in the source text. Using this decision, the editor allows the target readers to indicate information from the context or situation. The study finds that the editor makes the meaning implicit in the edited translation as much 7,79%.

Example 6:
ST   : Since *I* can't move my head, I watch him out of the corner of my eye. (p. 3)
Draft   : Karena *aku* tidak dapat menoleh, aku mengawasinya lewat sudut mataku.
Edited   : Karena tidak dapat menoleh, aku mengawasinya lewat sudut mataku. (p. 1)

In the example above, there is a repetition of word *I* used by the writer. The translator maintains the repetition by translating the first and the second *I*. However, to make the sentence more effective, the editor decides to make the first *I* implicit. Using this decision, the editor allows the target readers to get the meaning by themselves. This decision does not have negative effect on the translation since the meaning is conveyed completely, in a brief yet clear way.

Adding punctuation

In this study, adding punctuation means the editor adds one or more punctuation marks in the translation draft. This study shows that the editor decides to add punctuation as much 2,42%.

Example 7:
ST   : She said *a few*. (p. 4)
Draft   : Dia mengatakan *beberapa*.
Edited   : Dia mengatakan *"beberapa"*. (p. 3)

The situational context of the example above is Daelyn is alone in her car, waiting for her mother who picks up groceries. Her mother says that she will be back in a few minutes but Daelyn is waiting for her so long. The editor adds the punctuation that is double quotation marks. The double quotation marks in this situation are used to emphasize the word and make the word stand out [10]. The editor's decision of adding punctuation is in line with Paul's statement [1] that one of aims of editing stage are producing a work that is punctuated.

Making the meaning explicit

Making the meaning explicit means the editor introduces or shows information from the source text that is implicit from the context or situation of the source text and the draft. This study shows that the editor uses this decision as much 2,15%.

Example 8:
ST   : My mom's *not athletic like the Pope's not Muslim*. (p. 38)

Draft   : Ibuku *tidak atletis seperti Paus bukan muslim*.
Edited   : Ibuku *jelas-jelas tidak atletis*. (p. 60)

From example above, it can be seen that both the source text and the translation draft convey their meanings by using similes. The translator maintains the usage of simile in the draft toward the word "seperti". However, the editor makes a change of the draft from simile to non-simile. The editor introduces the implicit meaning of the text to make it easier for the target readers to understand the meaning. Therefore, this decision is used by the editor to help the target readers to understand the meaning in a quick and easy way.

Reducing the translation

In this study, reducing the translation means that the editor deletes a word or some words in the translation draft. The editor made this decision as much 1,61%.

Example 9:
ST   : *I showed one to my bff and the next day it was on MySpace and everyone's calling me a whore.* (p.82)
Draft   : *Aku menunjukkan satu ke sahabat terbaikku, dan hari berikutnya, foto itu ada di MySpace, dan setiap orang memanggilku sundal.*
               ⁵ Salah satu media sosial
Edited   : Aku menunjukkan satu ke sahabat terbaikku, dan hari berikutnya, foto itu ada di MySpace, dan *setiap* orang memanggilku sundal. (p.130)

In the example above, the translator maintains the term *MySpace* that is one of the largest American social networking services. Moreover, to make the target readers easier in understanding the term, the translator gives an annotation in the margin of the page. But, the editor decides to delete the annotation given by the translator. It seems that the annotation is deleted because of the term is widely known. However, in Indonesia, *MySpace* is less popular compared to *Friendster* and *Facebook*. So there is a possibility that the target readers are not familiar with that social media.

4   Conclusion

The findings of this study answer the question outlined at the beginning of this paper regarding the editor decisions in editing the translation work. The editor makes 16 decisions in editing the translation draft – changing into informal, deleting the translation, correcting, changing into formal, making the meaning implicit, adding punctuation, making the meaning explicit, reducing the translation, modulating, changing the diction, changing into formal without noticing the context, hyper correcting, reducing the punctuation, changing into source language, establishing the equivalence, and adding the translation. This study indicates that on the one hand the editor makes the translation draft informal, but on the other the editor also changes it into formal. It makes the language style of the novel translation is inconsistent. Moreover, the changes of the language style in the target language may change the novel characteristic that

has been intentionally outlined by the novel author. This study shows that the editor should be aware of the language style used by the author in the source language to deliver and maintain it in the target language and make it consistent. Besides, the editor should be aware of deleting the translation since it could lose important messages conveyed by the author and result in lowest level of accuracy, acceptability and readability.

References

[1] G. Paul, Ed. *Translation in Practice*. Champaign and London, England: Dalkey Archive Press, 2009.

[2] D. S. Cunningham, "Translation and editing," *Meta*, vol.16, no.3, pp. 135-152. Sept., 1971, doi: 10.7202/002443ar.

[3] K. Fordonski, "The art of translation and the art of editing," *Komunikacja Specjalistyczna*, vol. *7*, pp.167-173. 2014, doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.17613/M6W34R.

[4] C. A. Amantasari, "Analisis perbandingan teknik penerjemahan istilah ilmiah pada terjemahan yang dihasilkan oleh penerjemah dan suntingan terjemahan pada buku terjemahan sains untuk anak book of life seri tumbuhan serta dampaknya terhadap kualitas terjemahan yang dihasilkan," Thesis, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia, 2016.

[5] Stomp Out Bullying, 2005 – 2020. [Online]. Available: https://www.stompoutbullying.org/get-help/about-bullying-and-cyberbullying/issue-bullying

[6] J. M. Ellis, "Linguistics, literature, and the concept of style," *Word*, vol. 26, no. 1, pp. 65-78. June, 2015, doi: 10.1080/00437956.1970.11435581.

[7] UTS HELPS. [Online]. Available: https://www.uts.edu.au/sites/default/files/HELPS%20Formal%20and%20Informal%20Language.pdf

[8] Baker, M., & Saldanha, G. (2009). *Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies* (2nd ed.). Abingdon, England: Routledge.

[9] National Book Foundation. [Online]. Available: https://www.nationalbook.org/people/julie-anne-peters/

[10] Akademia. Quotation marks – definition and uses with examples. [Online]. Available: https:// akademia.com.ng/quotation-marks/