

Humanity in the Civic Education: Martha C. Nussbaum Perspectives on Emotion

Rika Febriani
{rikafebriani@fis.unp.ac.id}

Pancasila and Civic Education Study Program, Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang, Indonesia

Abstract. Emotions is complex reaction pattern that influence by experiential, behavioral and physiological elements. Emotions response by behavior or attitude differ for everyone and that makes person as human. Emotions as the basis for humanity is important for Pancasila and civic education in Indonesia. The humanity perspectives in Pancasila stated in the second principle, just and civilized humanity. The implementations of humanism in Indonesian society are not fully articulated because rarely discussed. Some argumentations are stated that humanism is western oriented and can be conflict with first principle, the religious principle. Though the humanism is the universal principle and enables man to do good things in their wider social scope. The type of emotions, such as affection and compassion are formed in a growing period of time. The emotions do not require formal education but needs to be developed in the long term. Developing emotions must be seen as an entry point to makes good human development. This role can be done in the family and especially woman play an important role to cultivate it. Woman's role should be supported also by institutional design, especially in education's sector. But the problem is that social construction makes women unnecessary to fully implement their role in society. The patriarchal perspective is still dominated in Indonesian society. This article will be discussed how emotions as basis for humanity can support civic education and importance without having to collide with the principles of the state such as respect for pluralism and individual autonomy. This is a theoretical study using Martha C. Nussbaum theory on Emotions. Her works on "Upheavals of Thought" and "Hiding from Humanity" are using a framework to understand the problem of civic education. The conclusion of this article will specifically address the importance of humanity in civic education in Indonesia.

Keywords: women; emotions; civic education; family; humanity

1 Introduction

Pancasila as an ideological system of Indonesia contains humanity, stated on second principle: just and civilized humanity. These human values must be seen as a whole unitary concept which means at the same time, humanity also contain the values of the belief of One and only God, unity, democracy, and social justice. This is what distinguishes the concept of humanity used in Pancasila compared to the humanity in the Western perspective. Human philosophy, as part of a philosophical system presupposes a metaphysical anthropology that specifically highlights the essence and existence of humans (Purwosaputro, 2015). The subject in each of the basic principle of Pancasila is a monopluralist human (Notonagoro, 1975). It

means that Indonesian people are individuals who can live alone and at the same time can live in society.

The philosophical discourse of Pancasila is needed nowadays in Indonesia, because in the past, Pancasila has been treated as doctrinaire in New Order era. The philosophy of Pancasila is not a political dogma, but a rational discourse that treated with a certain theme, that is life together politically (Hardiman, 2018). Humanity is a concept that contains emotions in it. This type of emotion can be found in attitude such as: empathy, tolerance, solidarity and mutual respect in state life. This trait is a prerequisite for Indonesian people who live in diversity. Education about tolerance which has been formalized in Pancasila and Citizenship education is often seen as only a tool and not a goal in the Indonesian state. So, in its implementation, this education rarely touches the psychological side in shaping the characteristics of citizens based on Pancasila.

Pancasila education in the formal realm can be supported by non-formal education in the family and environment. Education carried out in the family is proven to have an effect on character building compared to school (Wening, 2012). The family as the smallest base in society can initiate education to teach values and norms and women are able to carry out this role (Gade, 2012). The cultivation of these humanity are in line with education of religion and the environment which children are raised. This will affect the formation of mental characteristics of children in the long term before they are entering the society and the wider life of the nation and state.

But the problem is the role of women in family education which tends to be marginalized, especially in urban communities. Men are considered as people who have to work to provide a living for the family and women carry out the nurturing role. This work specialization is theorized in terms of the functional division between instrumental and expressive roles (Parsons et al. 1955). In industrial society, women are identified with home and children, thus marginalizing their economic activities.

A contemporary political thinker, Martha C. Nussbaum sees the importance of emotion in shaping the perspective of justice. He sees the emotional stereotype of women as a common feature in society so that they are considered unable to make rational decisions. The state also finally formed moral education based on male rationality. The attitudes such as: generous, cheerful, forgiving and gentle are considered a weakness for women as human beings.

This article wants to analyze the importance of emotion in the liberal tradition based on the perspective of Martha C. Nussbaum. In line with this view, women can take on social roles in civics education with a humanitarian perspective in Indonesia. The hypothesis offered in this article is that Pancasila and Citizenship Education in Indonesia must emphasize the humanitarian perspective in order to create a tolerant society, democracy knowledge, human rights and respect for minorities. This is in accordance with the purpose of Pancasila and Civic Education which is to promote social cohesion (Rusmin, 2020). The perspective of author is that civics education with a humanitarian perspective can serve the goals of each person to create a social justice country.

Indonesia is a multicultural country consisting of various religions, races and ethnicity, so that PPKn plays a strategic role to shape citizen's character. Civics is formally taught from elementary school to university level. Various approaches in Civics education are applied such as: project-based learning, question and answer, playing, the use of multimedia, etc but the understanding of civic education is only theoretical and not substantial. The study on civic education says that in a society that adheres to a liberal democratic system, if you want a more humane education, it is necessary to reform education through homeschooling (Glanzer, 2013).

2 Method

This research is qualitative by using literature review, especially integrative review. This type of research is a common in social science where the author concludes the current state of knowledge by displaying his agreement and disagreement (Neuman, 2014). A literature review can broadly be described as a more or less systematic way of collecting and synthesizing previous research (Tranfield, Denyer, & Smart, 2003). An effective and well-conducted review as a research method creates a firm foundation for advancing knowledge and facilitating theory development (Webster & Watson, 2002). By integrating findings and perspectives from many empirical findings, the benefit using literature review are can address research questions with a power that no single study has (Snyder, 2019).

The type of data used in this article is primary data, that is the work of Martha C. Nussbaum in her books "Upheavals of Thought" and "Hiding from Humanity". Nussbaum is contemporary feminist academician who have mastered various fields from Aristotelian thought to international development, from Charles Dickens to feminism. Her works mostly on gender and politics and using in some university in United States. Secondary data is from journal articles about humanity in Pancasila and Civic Education in Indonesia. The research phase is carried out starting from determining topics, designing research and evaluating research articles.

3 Result and Discussion

In this section, I will argue that the role of women to cultivate emotions in family is important to support Pancasila and civic education in Indonesia. The data that I used as source of analysis are the position of women universally in Indonesia. Women in Indonesia is dominate by man and this view are strengthen by religious value such as in Islam. Women found it difficult to enter the public political arena to articulate their needs to the state (Blackburn, 2004).

The women's role is important to cultivate empathy and tolerance which can be useful for children before they enter public life and society. However, this role is marginalized by the community because of the patriarchal culture as we can see from the law on marriage in Indonesia. Based on this law, Article 31 no. 1 of 1974 states that the husband is the head of the family and the wife is a housewife. This law is in line with the provisions in the Holy Scriptures, such as Al-Qur'an (Prihatinah, 2013). The state through legal products becomes an agent of gender bias socialization. The subordination in the 1974 marriage law prevents women from getting equal opportunities in their involvement in the public sphere (Sumiyatiningsih, 2014).

Various social problems in Indonesia nowadays reflect the loss of humanity in society. For example, at the beginning of the pandemic, people seemed to be suspicious of each other, lack of tolerance for other people affected by COVID-19. Another problem is the persecution or hunting of someone that happen in 2017. Based on data from the Southeast Asia Freedom of Expression Network, there were 59 victims of religious-based persecution in 2017 (SAFENet, 2017). This incident reflects that the humanity is loss and society is not ready to accept people who have different beliefs with themselves.

The role of women in the family to fosters humanity in the early stages of human life is very important. Women can cultivate emotions, guide the mental well-being of a children

before they enter into the wider nation's life. Nussbaum saw that children learn symbolic before they understand abstract ideas. Meanwhile for adults, this can be done through festivals, both tragic and comical. The experience moves from the particular to the more general which becomes the recognition of the common.

The problem is the role of women who use emotional side is considered a weakness by modern society. Stereotypes that are attached to emotional traits are common characteristics attached to women. So that women are excluded from community membership or public activities because they are considered unable to make rational decisions. The state also finally formed moral education based on male rationality.

Women's emotions are for most people described as traits that prevent them from making rational decisions. Traits such as: generous, cheerful, forgiving and gentle are considered as his weaknesses. Meanwhile, Nussbaum saw that emotions are very important in shaping one's humanity and should be explained through the Stoic Greek view. Based on this view, emotions are a using to evaluative decisions that beyond self-control but are important for human self-flourishing. Emotions are related to what I value, however good or bad it is (Nussbaum, 2003). So, there is a connection between decision making (what I value) and emotional life itself. This is very important in shaping the democratic society.

Indonesia embrace Pancasila as democratic system where the highest power in the hands of the people, based on one God, just and civilized humanity, Indonesian unity, democracy led by wisdom in deliberation/representation and social justice for all Indonesian people. This is what distinguishes Pancasila democracy from other types of democracy in the world, such as: liberal, socialist and guided.

Democracy in a pluralistic society such as in Indonesia does not require unity of belief and culture, because the sociological realities of Indonesian are indeed different. If there are differences of opinion, then what is really needed is tolerance. However, this attitude of tolerance tends to be misinterpreted as a tool to create a peaceful society so as to avoid criticism. In fact, tolerance should not prevent criticism and conflict, but there is a limit to the extent to which conflict can continue.

Nussbaum developed a capability approach where several items in it can be associated with the nature of women, such as: cognitive capabilities related to feeling, imagining and thinking. Practical reason related to the act of evaluating, choosing, planning and executing the good life. A person has the opportunity to plan his life through the freedom to choose and organize the achievements of various other capabilities. This can be done if humans take advantage of their practical reasoning capabilities (Nussbaum, 2009).

In a democracy, tolerance is needed among the citizens in it. However, many people confuse relativism with tolerance for diversity, and find relativism more interesting because it can show a way of respecting others. This has resulted in most cultures showing a lack of tolerance for diversity. By making each tradition the final word, according to Nussbaum, we have actually distanced ourselves from the general norms of tolerance or respect that can help us limit an intolerant culture (Nussbaum, 2001).

Nussbaum gave an example of India as a country that has a high level of plurality. The same example, according to the author, can also be used to look at the problems in Indonesia where the state guarantees the fulfillment of the fundamental rights and freedoms of its citizens. At the same time, however, this level of freedom is at risk for some of its citizens. Thus, we must choose a universal normative idea that allows humans to choose the concept of value that they believe in, with limits that are governed by the equally valuable protection of the freedom of others. We must be able to protect the freedom and opportunity of each human being as the ultimate goal, not just as agents or supporters of other things (Nussbaum, 2001).

The liberal principle which is the context of Nussbaum's thought presupposes that citizens are rational in making choices. Emotions are often associated with women's traits that hinder decision-making which is claimed to be rational by the liberal tradition. Emotions are often confronted with reason not only by many traditions but also by Western views of rationality that dominate public life such as the economic view of utilitarianism. For utilitarianism, reasoning is independent and calculative, so it has its own way of building preferences into norms. This kind of thinking has an impact on public culture, not only in the economic field but also in the legal field.

The liberal tradition of equality and mutual respect should be extended to respect for women and also the relationship between women and men in the family (Nussbaum, 2003). The advantage of the liberal tradition according to Nussbaum compared to other political traditions is the separation of one's life from others. Each human being should be seen as an ultimate goal rather than as a means to the end of another. This is beneficial for women who have often been seen not as an end goal but as a means to achieve an ultimate goal for others, women must be seen as reproducers and caregivers (Nussbaum, 2003).

The natural state of women related to emotions is in fact used to carry out social functions only (Nussbaum, 1995). The attitudes such as: raising children, serving the husband's needs in the domestic sphere are considered important because there are social interests in them. In the modern era, Nussbaum sees that it has become a mainstream in Rousseau's thought to deny women an education that is compatible with men's public life. Sociologists also have a patriarchal view of the family. In the family there is a division of roles, namely women play an expressive role (emotional, nurturing), while men play an instrumental role (rational, practical and calculating) (Parsons, 1949). This has implications for restricting women from getting full-time jobs.

Women in developing countries are vulnerable to arguments like this, for them the point of intersection of emotions comes from traditional gender views in the colonial period which are used as arguments for people in developing countries in general. This then becomes a stereotype for women who are intuitive, irrational and emotional. Whereas in the philosophical tradition, emotion is not an irrational brute force. However, intelligence and personality elements are closely related to perception and decision making. So we cannot say that women are emotional compared to men. This difference is not a natural state but rather socialization and way of life.

The main key is the value of autonomy. We cannot assume that a woman really understands the purpose of her role in the family. So there is a transfer of ideas through feelings of self-hood and mental awareness. According to Nussbaum, the universal value of practical reason and choice has little meaning if we look at it abstractly, so to make sense of it, it must come from a concrete situation in the story told by the woman herself and her life (Nussbaum, 1999).

The ideology of liberalism aims at equality of capabilities. This goal is not only the distribution of resources but also actually promotes a person's ability to be able to choose his life according to his own thinking (Nussbaum, 1999). For the liberal tradition, choice becomes important and through politics this role can be taken. It is the liberal approach that can speak of human dignity in a very general way.

Herein lies the difference with Pancasila democracy in Indonesia. The basis of Indonesian education is the Panca Dharma, (five basics) Ki Hadjar Dewantara, namely: independence, nature, culture, nationality and humanity. Arts, humanity and philosophy education are taken for granted in Indonesia. In fact, this kind of education is very useful for the formation of a democratic society. Citizenship education cannot be used as the only medium in strengthening

democracy in Indonesia (Sirajuddin, 2012). So, it must be supported by other elements, namely education in the family.

So, the ideal concept of liberalism is emphasizing love and compassion because this aspect has social origins. This means that love and affection can be relied on as social norms that can be developed. The general tendency for women to subordinate themselves to others and sacrifice their good lives for the larger unit is in most cases morally admirable, but this is by no means taken for granted. Such arrangements have been formed due to unfair conditions and reflect a society that does not value a good life for women.

A fairly familiar example regarding freedom is really given to women by men is found in Indonesia society. When a man doesn't want to worry about what to eat, what clothes to wear, and other household chores, they expect his wife to make all the choices. This shows that it turns out that the husband has given "freedom" to his wife. According to Marglin, we have actually become victims of universalist thinkers who have failed to respect differences (Appfel-Marglin, 1999; Doi T, 2001). In this story we assume that the application of the concept of capabilities given to women and claimed to be universal will find challenges from intellectuals in the East, especially Asia.

The freedom given by the husband to his wife has actually indirectly shown that he is dependent on women by asking women to take care of the details of his life. So the problem is not giving women "freedom" but whether these women have the same degree of freedom to plan their lives and execute those plans (Nussbaum, 1999).

The view of liberalism that sees the importance of freedom and choice is the right concept in the application of capabilities. Nussbaum's ideas of freedom are closely related to the ideas of equality and respect. In line with this, the choice that must be protected by liberal politics is one that considers the importance of developing and expressing one's self. Liberalism according to Nussbaum must take a position on what is good for a person and this requires an extensive concept of human function and capacity. The goal should always be to put people in positions of agency and choice, not to force them to achieve in the desired way (Nussbaum, 1999).

The debate between rationality and emotion is a complex issue. Both the history of philosophy and contemporary psychology argue on this point. The dominant view, both the Western philosophical tradition and cognitive psychology, sees that the form of emotions such as: fear, anger, feelings of emotion and grief involves evaluative judgments in which humans conduct a review of objects in the world (Nussbaum, 1999).

So, Civics education in Indonesia, with reference to Nussbaum's view, should include emotions to shape of humanity for several reasons: first, to guide moral and civic education as well as norms between family and political life. If we don't teach equality to citizens, then we automatically support the forms of prejudice. According to Nussbaum, ideal rationality will shape children's education and the structure of family relations in various ways that will have an impact on the concept of gender and gender relations in society (Nussbaum, 1995).

Second, to secure the conditions for human functioning in all major areas of human progress. The concept of ideal rationality which includes emotions is an important part of human progress. This affects the results of institutional design, especially in the field of education and family policy.

Third, there will always be areas in public life where we really need fully rational individuals, for example in the justice system. The draft law should allow for flexibility, individual interpretation and normative reasoning.

Fourth, the design of public institutions itself is bound in the ideal concept of rationality. We need ideal reasons to design institutions equitably to include emotion in them (Nussbaum, 1995).

Emotion according to Nussbaum cannot be understood as blind and rude, but emotion is a form of intelligence from evaluative perception that is closely related to decision making (Nussbaum, 1995). Emotions are formed in the family environment, for example through love and feelings of gratitude, the home allows the prerequisites for the formation of caring. Emotions always focus on the particular but in practice emotions can show the main purpose of class action. Thus, emotions can make a major contribution to private and public life (Nussbaum, 1999).

Emotions, such as sadness, love, fear, anger and hope, and bodily stimuli that push in that direction are directed at the object. It must be seen in the frame of an intentional explanation. My anger is not merely a stimulus but is directed at the person who blamed me. The way I view the person is intrinsically the nature of my emotions, and of their role in action. Emotions conflict with one another (Fear struggles with hope, anger against gratitude, love versus panic) but not blindly. They differ from each other in that perception is at the center. So emotion is really a way of receiving and if one does not bring one's "intentional content" into this, then it is impossible to understand how one acts. Emotions are not irrational pushes and pulls but are a way of looking at the world and an overarching ethical vision (Nussbaum, 1999).

This vision of an ethical life stems from human experience and cannot be resolved by rejecting tradition or imposing it on the institutionalization of male prejudice that is not reflective of emotion. The moral vision of emotion begins with the idea of the vulnerability of human life and things beyond itself.

Answering the doubts of feminists who see that we cannot use individual benchmarks in political decisions because there is a male bias in it and thus ignore the value of caring, the claim to gender-related emotions is used only for social reasons in certain cases. This separation is used only to take a position in an area of debate. So the universal fact that "women in all cultures love their children" is used only as a legitimacy that there is a separation of women's nature (which is intuitive and emotional with calculative and intellectual) is no longer relevant.

Emotions in this case are very important and we cannot be eliminated in social life. This norm is not only a dubious basis for the idea of good reasoning, but also an empty world that cannot support the agent's interests to fulfill his quest for meaning (Nussbaum, 1999). Emotions that are particularistic in nature must be checked through law enforcement and a strong culture of criticism. Rules that are based on morality and are not accompanied by a source of imagination can be easily fooled by people who have power (Nussbaum, 2003). This is what happens with a culture that oppresses women. The inner world must be relevant to normative judgments and that is what shapes our concept as citizens (Admirand, 2014).

This bond of love and gratitude is formed at a time of growth that is indispensable to an adult's ability to do good in society. Such early affection does not require education but must be present if a good education is to be desired. So this emotional politics can be applied through government policies such as in the field of education without having to clash with liberal principles such as pluralism and individual autonomy.

Emotions influence ideas about objects that involve judgment (Nussbaum, 2003). His cognitive view in this case relates to receiving and processing information. So that emotion is a reflexive self-awareness. Emotions are also related to values. Emotional judgments are a sub-class of value decisions. They intersect with objects that are seen as not being completely

controlled by a person. Then there will be value decisions that do not involve emotions, and there will be other decisions that involve the idea of the human good.

The concept of emotional politics put forward by Nussbaum is not totalizing in the sense that it still provides space for citizens to have a particular relationship with the people and causes they like because of the form of society. Political liberalism is particular in nature and requires a deep approach to one's personality (Amirand, 2014). The capabilities approach encourages us to see the same needs, problems and capacities, and also encourages us to see that each person and group faces a concrete problem. Good public reasoning on the list will provide a rich sensitivity to the concrete context of each agent's character and social situation.

The view of capabilities shows that choices are not spontaneous but run independently of material and social conditions. If someone cares about autonomy, then at the same time that person must care about the factors that support it. The ideal society is one that encourages its citizens to feel and inhabit public spaces differently according to their age, gender, goals, values and personality. Political emotions are useful for humanity because humans are heterogeneous creatures, have different opinions, histories, and personalities. This results in people wanting specific and personal justice, especially if freedom of expression is protected (Amirand, 2014).

Various cultural practices and values in religion treat women unfairly. Cases such as child marriage, female genital mutilation are common in Islamic countries as a result of conservative interpretations of religion. We do not have to choose between a society that has an "embedded life" or eliminates individualism. Universal values will build its own community, a rich community, value friendship, agency, bond in the local atmosphere while also connecting in complex ways with groups of women in various parts of the world.

Regarding to civics education as forming a humane citizen, we must see it as something that goes beyond moral education itself by not only analyzing the contents of textbooks and Civics Subjects at various levels of education. If we look at each of the precepts in Pancasila, all of them are interconnected. The first precept of God Almighty, teaches citizens to tolerate each other. The second precept of Pancasila Humanity is just and civilized, the goal is to respect humanity to learn compassion and help each other. Meanwhile, the third principle, "Indonesian unity" aims to foster love for the nation and the people of Indonesia based on the national ideal of "Bhinneka Tunggal Ika". Meanwhile, the fourth precept, the aim is to understand and practice democracy based on the principles of deliberation (musyawarah) and mutual agreement (mufakat). The goal in the fifth principle, social justice, is to acquire the values of justice, perseverance, frugal and simple life based on the principles of kinship and mutual cooperation.

The purpose of Pancasila moral education is to cultivate moral feelings and attitudes, on the other hand, also to provide students with political, economic, social, religious and cultural knowledge. Civics teaching methods are generally applied in various ways according to several aspects of this goal (Nishimura, 1995). However, the traditional method of PPKn formal education has a weakness to guide students according to their capabilities. So that additional methods are needed in guiding students' behavior and morals, that is in the family.

4 Conclusion

Various social problems that occur in society today require civics education that emphasizes on the humanity perspective. This perspective is closely related to the cultivate

emotional that can be done by women in the family. Women in her roles in family can support Pancasila and Civic Education by giving education in early education of her children. Through political emotions is must see as part of civic education in Indonesia.

But women's role tends to be marginalized by modern society because it is considered as weakness. Emotions are often countered by rational attitudes. Emotions, such as sadness, love, fear, anger and hope, and bodily stimuli are directed at the object. These characteristics are needed in a democracy so that society are more tolerance and have empathy. Politics and Culture Citizenship as a way to live together requires an emotional aspect in it. This means that love and affection can be relied on as social norms that can be developed in state life.

References

- Admirand, P. (2014). Martha Nussbaum, " Political Emotions: Why Love Matters for Justice.". *Philosophy in Review*, 34(3-4), 101-103.
- Apffel-Marglin, F., & Marglin, S. A. (Eds.). (1996). *Decolonizing knowledge: From development to dialogue*. Clarendon Press.
- Blackburn, S. (2004). *Women and the state in modern Indonesia*. Cambridge University Press.
- D. Tranfield, D. Denyer, P. Smart. Towards a methodology for developing evidence-informed management knowledge by means of systematic review. *British Journal of Management*, 14 (2003), pp. 207-222, 10.1111/1467-8551.00375
- Doi, T. (2001). *The anatomy of dependence*. Kodansha USA Incorporated.
- Gade, F. (2012). Ibu sebagai madrasah dalam pendidikan anak. *JURNAL ILMIAH DIDAKTIKA: Media Ilmiah Pendidikan dan Pengajaran*, 13(1).
- Hannah Snyder, Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines, *Journal of Business Research*, Volume 104, 2019, Pages 333-339, ISSN 0148-2963, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039>.
- Hardiman, F. B. (2018). Menggali Pancasila sebagai Filsafat Politik. *Jurnal Prisma*. Vol. 37. *Jakarta: LP3ES*.
- Glanzer, P. (2013). Saving Democratic Education from Itself: Why We Need Homeschooling. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 88(3), 342-354. Retrieved August 5, 2021, from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/42001767>
- Nishimura, S. (1995). The development of Pancasila moral education in Indonesia. *Japanese Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 33(3), 303-316.
- Notonagoro, S. (1975). *Pancasila secara ilmiah populer*. Pantjuran Tudjuh.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (2009). Creating capabilities: The human development approach and its implementation. *Hypatia*, 24(3), 211-215.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (2003). *Upheavals of thought: The intelligence of emotions*. Cambridge University Press.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (2001). *Women and human development: The capabilities approach* (No. 3). Cambridge University Press.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (1995). Emotions and women's capabilities. *Women, culture and development: A study of human capabilities*, 1995, 360-395.
- Nussbaum, M. C. (1999). *Sex and social justice*. Oxford University Press.
- Neuman, W. L., & Robson, K. (2014). *Basics of social research*. Toronto: Pearson Canada.
- Parsons, T., R. F. Bales, J. O'Idis, M. Zelditch, P. E. Slater 1955. *Family, socialization, and interaction process*. New York: The Free Press.
- Parsons, T. (1949). *The social structure of the family*.
- Purwosaputro, S. (2015). Aku Dalam Pancasila (Refleksi Metafisika Pancasila). *CIVIS*, 5(1).
- Prihatinah, T. L. (2013). Tinjauan Filosofis Undang-Undang Nomor 1 Tahun 1974. *Jurnal Dinamika Hukum*, 8(2), 166-172.
- Rusmin, L., Hasan, S., La Rabani, M. M., & Suardika, I. K. (2020). The Role of Civic Education in the Student Moral Development in Elementary School: A Descriptive Study. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(12), 6405-6414.

- Sumiyatiningsih, D. (2014). Pergeseran peran laki-laki dan perempuan dalam kajian feminis. *WASKITA, Jurnal Studi Agama dan Masyarakat*, 4, 139-154.
- J. Webster, R.T. Watson. Analyzing the past to prepare for the future: Writing a literature review. *Management Information Systems Quarterly*, 26 (2002), p. 3
- Wening, S. (2012). Pembentukan karakter bangsa melalui pendidikan nilai. *Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter*, (1).
- Koalisi Anti Persekusi Bentuk Crisis Center Lindungi Korban Teror,
<https://nasional.tempo.co/read/news/2017/06/01/078880717/koalisi-anti-persekusi-bentuk-crisis-center-lindungi-korban-teror>