

Accessibility of Public Service Programs and Infrastructure for Disability Inclusive Development in Malang City (Study at Dinas Sosial, Pemberdayaan Perempuan, Perlindungan Anak, Pengendalian Penduduk, and Keluarga Berencana Kota Malang)

Mochamad Chazienul Ulum¹, Nisrina Nasithah^{2*}, Izzatul Maulidiyah³, Intan Ardhehliya⁴, Intan Yoviranita Putri⁵, Arina Bintang Lubya⁶, Putrianti Adinda Salsabila⁷, Chindy Martha Chairutullah⁸, Arum Melani Putri⁹
{nasithah29@gmail.com}

Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia

Abstract. The state's obligation includes providing public services that meet the needs of its people, including infrastructure and human resources development. Public facilities need to be accessible to all, including people with disabilities. However, awareness of the needs and rights of people with disabilities remains low among local government officials and the public. This research focuses on the Public Service Accessibility Process for Disability Inclusive Development by Dinas Sosial P3AP2KB Malang City, based on the Disability Inclusion Guideline (2020), which emphasizes non-discrimination, awareness, accessibility, participation, and stakeholder participation. The research method applied in this study is Systematic Literature Review (SLR); it was concluded that Malang City aims to create an inclusive environment for persons with disabilities by applying these principles despite ongoing infrastructure challenges. The government seeks to improve accessibility, encourage public awareness, and foster collaboration to empower persons with disabilities.

Keywords: Disability, Accessibility, Public services

1 Introduction

One way to assess the welfare of Indonesian society is through the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which are based on universality, integration, and inclusivity to ensure no one is left behind. Goal 11 of the SDGs focuses on creating inclusive, safe, resilient, and sustainable cities, with a particular aim to provide accessible and affordable infrastructure, including transportation systems for people with disabilities by 2030 [1]. The state is obliged to provide public facilities and infrastructure to meet the needs of all citizens, including people with disabilities. Facilities are tools that facilitate goal achievement, while infrastructure supports the process, whether in education, economy, or public services [2]. However, in many Indonesian cities, such as Malang, these public facilities are not designed to meet the needs of people with disabilities, such as the lack of ramps or other accessibility features [3]. Additionally, awareness about the rights and needs of people with disabilities is low among government officials and the public [4].

Indonesia ratified the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) with Law No. 19/2011, which ensures the rights of disabled people, particularly in areas like transportation, health, and education [5]. However, its implementation, especially regarding

accessibility, remains challenging. Law No. 8/2016 introduced additional policies, including Government Regulation No. 70/2019, which addresses the planning, execution, and evaluation of accessibility rights for people with disabilities [6]. In Malang, a city with a large population of 2,035 people with disabilities, public infrastructure remains inadequate [7]. Public facilities often fail to meet universal design standards, such as the city's guiding blocks leading to hazardous places like ditches or trees [8]. The Malang City Government has made some efforts, including social rehabilitation via home visits, but the overall public infrastructure is still lacking [9]. This situation highlights the need for comprehensive improvements in infrastructure to meet the needs of people with disabilities.

This study aims to critically examine and analyze the accessibility of public services for inclusive development targeting individuals with disabilities, specifically as administered by the P3AP2KB Malang City. The research seeks to investigate the processes and mechanisms through which these services are provided, with a focus on evaluating the extent to which accessibility is integrated into the department's policies and operational frameworks. Additionally, the study aims to explore the key factors that either support or hinder the effective implementation of accessible infrastructure and services for individuals with disabilities. By identifying these enablers and barriers, the research seeks to provide actionable insights into how accessibility for persons with disabilities can be improved within public service delivery systems.

The significance of this research lies in its potential to contribute to the development of a comprehensive model for inclusive development that can be adopted not only in Malang City but also in other regions facing similar challenges. This model will emphasize the importance of multi-sectoral collaboration between government entities, civil society organizations, and the local community to ensure that the needs of people with disabilities are prioritized in public service planning and implementation. Moreover, the study aims to raise awareness about the importance of accessibility for individuals with disabilities, helping to promote more inclusive attitudes and encouraging practical actions to enhance accessibility at all levels of service provision. The publication of the study's findings could serve as a catalyst for policy reforms and public discourse, promoting greater social inclusivity. Additionally, the research could have a direct impact on local communities, such as Omah Gembira, by providing them with a deeper understanding of the specific needs and aspirations of disabled individuals, thus contributing to the creation of more supportive and inclusive environments for all community members.

2 Literature Review

2.1 Public Services

A wide variety of actions performed by civil society organizations to address the needs of users is referred to as public service [10]. In order to satisfy every citizen and resident's need for goods, services, and/or administrative services offered by public service providers in compliance with laws and regulations, public service is an action or a sequence of actions [11].

2.2 Responsiveness

A concept related to the ability of institutions to face and respond to aspirations, developments, demands, and new insights [12]. This is important so that a state institution can continue to act as an effective service provider without being left behind. To assess the level of public service quality, responsiveness is among the important dimensions that indicate awareness or desire to help consumers and provide efficient services [12].

2.3 Inclusive Development

The achievement of development that is inclusive is characterized by several factors, the availability of procedures to accomplish development that is inclusive and the achievement of development that is inclusive itself. This is demonstrated by making sure that things are accessible, encouraging active and inclusive involvement, treating everyone equally and without discrimination, respecting diversity, and upholding the intrinsic worth of every human being [13].

2.4 People with Disability

Disability is the limitation or inability of an individual to perform activities in a manner and measure commonly considered normal for humans in general, largely due to an impairment or impairment of the individual's abilities [14]. Limitations These limitations are created by a process of interaction between health conditions (diseases/disorders), environmental conditions (such as behavior, physical access, and availability of technology), and individual circumstances (such as self-assurance and Personal inspiration).

3 Methodology

This study employs a systematic literature review methodology and is qualitative in nature. In this research, the Systematic Literature Review aims to identify, evaluate, and interpret the findings from key studies [15]. By using this method, the researchers systematically reviewed and identified journals, following the established steps at each stage of the process [16]. A Systematic Literature Review has a clear purpose, with specific questions and approaches to search for studies, establish criteria, and produce qualitative research [17]. This research focuses on the extent of feasibility and availability of public service access provided for persons with disabilities in public spaces, as well as the role of relevant stakeholders in enhancing and developing public service access for persons with disabilities in efforts to support the development of an inclusive disability environment.

The data source in this research utilizes secondary data, which the researcher obtained from various official sources, meaning the researcher is not the first to use this data [18]. The data sources in this study can be obtained through documents or archives, events, and locations where the research is conducted [19]. The researcher in this study analyzes secondary data sources, such as records or archives, to learn more about how accessible public services are for inclusive people with disabilities in Malang. The data collection technique used in this research is the documentation technique. According to Arikunto in Abdussamad (2021), the documentation technique involves searching for and collecting data regarding the necessary elements in the research as books, journals, notes, articles, and other documents that contain information and come from reliable sources [20]. Various written sources provide benefits for researchers, such as data collection, as well as offering a range of information and knowledge regarding the issues being studied.

The research instrument used in this study is documentation, which is a method employed to obtain data and information from books, archives, documents, numerical writings, and images that consist of reports and descriptions that can support the research [21]. The process of searching, reading, defining the scope, and revisiting is a continuous cycle. After exploring various databases, studies, and journals, the researchers have identified key issues and findings relevant to this research. Next, the researchers will focus on documenting the themes as well as the similarities and differences found in the studies and journals.

4 Results and Discussion

4.1 Process Definition

The systematic literature review (SLR) process involves several key steps. First, researchers establish inclusion and exclusion criteria to select relevant studies, such as journal articles and government reports on accessibility and inclusion of people with disabilities in the public sector. Next, data is collected from various sources and the quality of the studies is analyzed to identify patterns, gaps, and recommendations related to the development of infrastructure for people with disabilities in Malang City [22]. In this review, the data collected includes annual reports from the Department of Social Affairs, case studies, news articles, and academic publications. This process also includes an assessment of the effectiveness of policies and their impact on people with disabilities. With the SLR method, researchers can provide a comprehensive picture of the effectiveness of strategies and recommend improvements (Higgins & Green, 2011), ensuring evidence-based analysis that contributes to the development of inclusive policies in Malang City [23].

4.2 Search Stage

The journal search process was carried out using systematic steps. First, the researcher set clear criteria for selecting journals that were relevant to the research topic, such as disability accessibility policy and public infrastructure evaluation, and excluded studies that did not fit the local context or methodological standards [24]. The researcher then searched for literature through academic databases such as PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar, using keywords related to disability accessibility and inclusion policies in Indonesia. With this strategy, 17 relevant journals were successfully identified. Next, the researcher assessed the quality of the journals through a critical review of the methodology and findings, evaluating relevance, data quality, and contribution to the understanding of disability accessibility in Malang City. The results of this synthesis provide a comprehensive and evidence-based picture of the effectiveness of existing programs and infrastructure and support the development of better inclusive policies and practices [25].

4.3 Data Presentation

4.3.1 Public Service Accessibility Process for Inclusive Development of Disabilities by Dinas Sosial, Pemberdayaan Perempuan, Perlindungan Anak, Pengendalian Penduduk, dan Keluarga Berencana Kota Malang

4.3.1.1 Non-Discrimination

Non-discrimination promotes equality without bias based on religion, race, or other identities, as defined in international contexts [26]. In Malang City, this principle is applied through programs designed to empower people with disabilities, enhancing their skills and fostering independence, enabling them to lead quality lives without relying solely on government support. This aligns with utilitarianism, which views discrimination as unjust due to the suffering it causes [27]. Additionally, the Integrated Information Theory (IIT) suggests that awareness arises from complex information integration. The Malang City Social Service has implemented a talent show for people with disabilities to promote social awareness and tolerance, engaging both the disabled community and the public. These efforts aim to foster understanding and acceptance of societal differences.

4.3.1.2 Awareness

Based on the Integrated Information Theory (IIT) proposed by Giulio Tononi, it is proposed that awareness is the result of a highly integrated and complex information system. IIT measures awareness based on the level of information integration in a system, where awareness is a subjective experience related to an integrated information pattern. The Social Service which is P3AP2KB has implemented a program to increase social awareness in the community. This program is in the form of a talent show from people with disabilities which was held on International Disability Day in 2023. This program was not only attended by people with disabilities, but also the public. Of course, this program is very good to be carried out as an effort to increase tolerance for differences in society through complex experiences and information in the sense of involving feelings.

4.3.1.3 Accessibility

Accessibility based on Penchansky and Thomas (1981) in Ngui and Vanasse (2012) can also be explained in terms of affordability, acceptability, availability and adequacy [28]. According to Black (1981) in Tamin (2000), accessibility is a measure of the comfort or ease of land use locations interacting with each other and the ease or difficulty of the location being reached through the transportation network system [29]. The implementation of accessibility for people with disabilities in Malang City is regulated in Malang City Regional Regulation No. 2 of 2014 concerning the Protection and Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities. This regulation aims to protect and empower people with disabilities, overcome various challenges faced by people with disabilities, including discrimination and lack of accessible public accommodation. This regulation emphasizes the importance of providing accessibility in various aspects of life, including public transportation, public buildings, and green open spaces. This is reflected in the opinion according to the statement of the Head of the Social Service P3AP2KB Malang City, stating that in Malang City there are already special schools for autism so that they can get a decent education. They also get job training so that they have soft skills as the main support in the world of work.

4.3.1.4 Participation

Participation refers to the involvement of an individual or community group in the development process, either through statements or activities, by providing input in the form of thoughts, energy, time, expertise, capital, or materials, as well as participating in utilizing and enjoying the results of development [30]. In its implementation, in order to increase the accessibility of public services for inclusive development of disabilities in Malang City, especially the Social Service, Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control, and Family Planning of Malang City) has organized a program to increase community participation, namely through the commemoration of International Day of Persons with Disabilities. Through this activity, it is hoped that the participation of people with disabilities can be more meaningful and support sustainable inclusion to strengthen their independence. In addition, this activity aims to increase awareness, concern, partisanship and support from all elements of society towards the existence of people with disabilities in particular.

4.3.2 Supporting and Inhibiting Factors of Accessibility of Public Services for Inclusive Development of Disabilities by Dinas Sosial, Pemberdayaan Perempuan, Perlindungan Anak, Pengendalian Penduduk, dan Keluarga Berencana Kota Malang

4.3.2.1 Supporting Factors

a. Family Members

Families of people with disabilities in Malang City showed high enthusiasm for the government's rehabilitation program, reflected in the formation of various associations in five sub-districts, such as the Lentera Kasih Association and the Mutiara Kasih Association. This enthusiasm has a major influence on the success of the rehabilitation program provided by the P3AP2KB Social Service (Sakinah et al., 2020) [31]. The "Asset-Based Community Development (ABCD)" theory by John L. McKnight and John P. Kretzmann (1993) supports this approach by emphasizing the importance of local assets and resources, such as skills and social networks, in community development [32]. The existence of associations strengthens social support and gives voice to people with disabilities and their families, allowing for more inclusive program planning. The active involvement of families also helps the Social Service design programs that are in accordance with the real needs of people with disabilities, increasing the responsiveness of services and strengthening support networks to accelerate rehabilitation and empowerment.

b. Social Service Innovation

Innovation is a novelty that shows social change and progress in society, as explained in the Diffusion of Innovation theory by Everett M. Rogers. Innovation becomes an important indicator when it is widely adopted, indicating that society has implemented changes to improve efficiency or quality of life. The Malang City Government supports disability programs and services through innovation, such as the implementation of monthly therapy at the sub-district office to expand access for people with disabilities and improve their interaction with the local government. This aims to reduce the gap between people with disabilities and public services, as well as increase their visibility in government structures.

The Social Service P3AP2KB also provides special attention through training programs to improve the skills of people with disabilities, in line with Peni Indriani's statement regarding the importance of their independence. In addition to training, routine social assistance is also provided every month (Anggraeni, 2020) [33]. The Social Service involves people with special needs in development planning meetings (Musrenbang) to optimize their welfare, ensuring that the aspirations collected focus on projects that increase accessibility and empowerment of people with disabilities.

c. Cooperation

The Social Service P3AP2KB of Malang City is open to collaboration with various institutions and individuals in empowering people with disabilities, especially autism, with the aim of increasing the effectiveness of rehabilitation programs (Communication and Public Information Division, 2024). The theory of "Asset-Based Community Development (ABCD)" by John L. McKnight and John P. Kretzmann (1993) emphasizes the importance of local assets, such as skills and social networks, for sustainable development [33]. The Social Service has collaborated with various institutions to provide training to people with disabilities, which has yielded positive results in job placement.

The Social Service's commitment to collaboration with other parties is a major supporting factor, expanding the reach of services and improving the quality of social rehabilitation. The involvement of people with disabilities in development planning since 2018 through thematic Musrenbang shows that disability issues need to be addressed comprehensively, not only through social assistance. Dewi Anggraini Piculima noted that coordinated collaboration

between various parties, including the government and the community, is very important in addressing disability issues [34]. Openness to feedback from the community also plays a role in creating programs that are more inclusive and responsive to the needs of people with disabilities in Malang City. Overall, this collaboration supports the development of better disability services.

4.3.2.2 Inhibiting Factors

According to Law Number 8 of 2016, persons with disabilities are defined as any individual who has physical, intellectual/intellectual, mental, and/or sensory limitations for a long period of time, so that in their interactions with the environment, they may face obstacles and difficulties to participate fully and equally with other citizens. At the same time, those who are given the gift of normal conditions have an obligation to pay attention to the rights of persons with disabilities so that they can be fulfilled properly. However, there are obstacles found by researchers in a literature study at the Malang City Social Service. Based on Edward III's Theory as a standard for identifying factors in the implementation of service programs, it can be interpreted as follows:

a. Communication Between Program Implementers

Communication is the process of conveying information from the communicator to the recipient. Policy communication, in particular, is the delivery of information about policies from policymakers to implementers [34]. It is important for implementers to understand the content and objectives of the policy in order to implement it effectively. However, in the practice of social rehabilitation for people with disabilities in Malang City, good communication between implementers has not been achieved. Ideally, therapy should be carried out every day, but currently it only takes place once a month, which hinders the achievement of rehabilitation goals. This problem is caused by the high workload of the Social Welfare Handling Program (PMKS), which limits the ability of implementers to provide optimal services. Therefore, better communication and coordination are needed to identify obstacles, plan solutions, and set priorities to meet the needs of people with disabilities more effectively [35].

b. Resource

Resource factors are very important in policy implementation (Edward III in Widodo, 2010). Although the rules and policy implementers are clear, lack of resources such as human resources, budget, equipment, and authority can hinder successful implementation. In the Malang City Social Service, inadequate quantity and quality of human resources make it difficult for employees to understand directions and carry out tasks properly, which results in ineffective coordination and communication. In addition, the limited budget for the rehabilitation of people with disabilities hinders the effectiveness of the program. It is important for the P3AP2KB Service to improve internal communication, increase employee training, and manage budget allocations wisely, including seeking cooperation with the private sector. The problem of accessibility for people with disabilities in Malang City also reflects the lack of government attention, where public facilities are still limited. The P3AP2KB Service needs to conduct an in-depth evaluation and increase attention to the needs of people with disabilities so that the program can run more effectively.

c. Disposition

Disposition is the willingness and tendency of policymakers to implement policies seriously so that goals are achieved (Edward III in Widodo, 2010). The positive attitude of

implementers greatly influences the success of implementation. However, in the disability program at the P3AP2KB Social Service, the lack of information from village officials to the community hinders the delivery of the necessary information. To overcome this, Donny, the Head of the Service, delegated the authority to provide a public discussion space. This space allows families of people with disabilities to share experiences, support each other, and improve the handling and support provided. This effort also strengthens a positive disposition towards the Social Service program, ensures that services are in accordance with the real needs of people with disabilities and helps design more effective programs based on family experiences, thereby increasing the relevance and success of social rehabilitation.

d. Structure

Organizational structure is a formal system that regulates responsibilities and relationships between individuals to achieve organizational goals (Wisnu, 2019). In the Social Service P3AP2KB Malang City, an inefficient bureaucratic structure and uneven distribution of power hamper the implementation of disability programs, so that people with disabilities do not feel the benefits of the program. This problem can be seen from the lack of synchronization of data on disability data collection due to lack of coordination between agencies, especially with Dispendukcapil. To overcome this, good coordination is needed between RT/RW, sub-districts, and Dispendukcapil, as well as clear socialization regarding disability programs and services. The integration of easily accessible administrative and social services is also important to provide more comprehensive and effective support for people with disabilities.

5 Conclusion

The Public Service Accessibility Process for Disability Inclusive Development by the Malang City Social, Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control, and Family Planning Office is that public services in Malang City strive to create an inclusive environment for persons with disabilities by applying the principle of non-discrimination, increasing public awareness, improving the accessibility of public facilities, and encouraging the active participation of persons with disabilities and the community. However, despite the existence of various programs and initiatives, implementation on the ground still requires improvement, especially in ensuring more significant participation of persons with disabilities in decision-making processes and public policies. Collaboration with various stakeholders has also been carried out to support the empowerment and employment skills of persons with disabilities.

Supporting and inhibiting factors for accessibility of public services for disability-inclusive development by the Dinas Sosial P3AP2KB Malang City show that strong support from families of persons with disabilities, innovation of rehabilitation programs, and cooperation with various parties are key elements that strengthen service implementation. However, challenges such as lack of communication, limited resources, implementer disposition, and inefficient bureaucratic structure are still significant barriers. Therefore, there is a need to improve coordination, budget allocation, and coordination.

References

- [1] United Nations. (2020). Sustainable Development Goals. Retrieved from

<https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal11>

- [2] Republic of Indonesia. (2016). *Law No. 8 of 2016 on Persons with Disabilities*. Jakarta: Ministry of Law and Human Rights.
- [3] Fatimah, S. & Apsari, N. (2020). Accessibility for People with Disabilities in Malang City Public Spaces. *Journal of Urban Studies*, 5(3), 120-133.
- [4] Hadari Nawawi. (2005). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- [5] Law No. 19/2011. Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Government of Indonesia.
- [6] Law No. 8/2016. Protection and Fulfillment of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Government of Indonesia.
- [7] BPS Kota Malang. (2023). Data Penyandang Disabilitas di Kota Malang. Retrieved from <https://malangkota.bps.go.id/>
- [8] Ratnanggani, A. R. (2022). "Komisi D DPRD Kota Malang's Efforts in Improving Disability Infrastructure." *Malang City Government Report*.
- [9] Malang City Government. (2023). *Rencana Kerja Pemerintah Daerah (RKPD) Kota Malang*.
- [10] Barricelli, B. R., & Fogli, D. (2024). Digital Twins in Human-Computer Interaction: A Systematic Review. *International Journal of Human-Computer Interaction*, 40(2), 79-97.
- [11] Sri Maulidiah, "Pelayanan Publik, Pelayanan Terpadu Administrasi Kecamatan (PATEN)." Cetakan Pertama. Bandung: CV. Indra Prahasta, 2014.
- [12] R. A. Wiranata, and M. E. Kristhy, "Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 2009 Tentang Pelayanan Publik Sebagai Values Of Law Atas Pelayanan Publik Terhadap Penyandang Disabilitas," *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (JKH)*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 208-218, 2022.
- [13] R. P. Anjasgoro, and D. G. Manar, "Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Jakarta Smart City Dalam Mewujudkan Pelayanan Publik Responsif Melalui Aplikasi Citizen Relation Management Tahun 2023," *Journal of Politic and Government Studies*, vol. 13, no. 3, pp. 94-108, 2024.
- [14] R. K Dewi., R. P. Pramana, H. Sadaly, R. K. Dewi, R. P. Pramana, & H. Sadaly, "Kendala Mewujudkan Pembangunan Inklusif Penyandang disabilitas." Cetakan Pertama. Jakarta: The SMERU Research Institute, 2020.
- [15] Pasciana, R., "Pelayanan Publik Inovatif Bagi Penyandang Disabilitas," *Sawala: Jurnal Administrasi Negara*, vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 192-204, 2020.
- [16] Triandini dkk. (2019). Metode Systemic Literature Review untuk Identifikasi Platform dan Metode Pengembangan Sistem Informasi di Indonesia. 1 (2): 63-77
- [17] Sugiyono. (2008). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: ALFABETA.
- [18] Barricelli, B. R., & Fogli, D. (2024). Digital Twins in Human-Computer Interaction: A Systematic Review. *International Journal of Human-Computer Interaction*, 40(2), 79-97.
- [19] Triandini et al. (2019). Metode Systemic Literature Review untuk Identifikasi Platform dan Metode Pengembangan Sistem Informasi di Indonesia. 1 (2): 63-77.
- [20] Hadi, Abdul. (2021). *Penelitian Kualitatif Studi Fenomenologi, Case Study, Grounded Theory, Etnografi, Biografi*. Banyumas: CV. Pena Persada.
- [21] Seran, Sirilius. (2020). *Metodologi Penelitian Ekonomi dan Sosial*. Yogyakarta: Deepublish.
- [22] Siswono. (2014). *Teori dan Praktik (Diksi, Gaya Bahasa dan Pencitraan)*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Deepublish.
- [23] Abdussamad, H. Z., & Sik, M. S. (2021). *Metode penelitian kualitatif*. CV. Syakir Media Press.
- [24] Sugiyono. 2015. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung : ALFABETA.
- [25] Kitchenham, B. (2004). Procedures for Performing Systematic Reviews. Software Engineering Group Department of Computer Science Keele University Keele, Staffs, 33
- [26] Higgins, JPT dan Green, S. (2011) *Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions*. Versi 5.1.0. Kolaborasi Cochrane.
- [27] Liberati A, Altman DG, Tetzlaff J, Mulrow C, Gøtzsche PC, Ioannidis JP, Clarke M, Devereaux PJ, Kleijnen J, Moher D. The PRISMA statement for reporting systematic reviews and meta-analyses of studies that evaluate health care interventions: explanation and elaboration. *PLoS Med*. 2009 Jul 21;6(7):e1000100. doi: 10.1371/journal.pmed.1000100. Epub 2009 Jul 21. PMID: 19621070; PMCID: PMC2707010.

- [28] Moher D, Shamseer L, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, Shekelle P, Stewart LA; PRISMA-P Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015 statement. *Syst Rev.* 2015 Jan 1;4(1):1. doi: 10.1186/2046-4053-4-1. PMID: 25554246; PMCID: PMC4320440.
- [29] Kholis, Nur (2019) Asas Non Diskriminasi Dalam Contempt Of Court , *Jurnal Legality*, 26(2)
- [30] Taufik, A.D., Wahyuni F., & Gunawan, H. (2024) “ANALISIS SEJARAH DAN PERKEMBANGAN TEORI UTILITARIANISME TERHADAP HUKUM INDONESIA,” *Jurnal Hukum Ekonomi*, 10(1).
- [31] Ngui, André Ngamini. dan Vanasse, Alain. 2012. Assessing spatial accessibility to mental health facilities in an urban environment. *Spatial and Spatio- temporal Epidemiology* 3, 195 – 203.
- [32] Tamin, OZ (2000), *Perencanaan & Permodelan Transportasi*, Penerbit ITB, Bandung.
- [33] Sumaryadi.2005. *Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Otonom dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat*. Jakarta: CV Citra Utama