

The Workability and Sustainability of Vocational School Graduates as Contract Workers

Samidjo¹, Setuju², Suparmin³, Bayu Rahmat Setiadi⁴
E-mail : Samijompust@gmail.com¹

Universitas Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa Yogyakarta, Jl. Kusumanegara 157
Yogyakarta^{1,2,3}
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Kampus Karang Malang Yogyakarta⁴

Abstract. The research aimed to describe the workability and sustainability of vocational school graduates as contract workers. The population was terminated workers, and the sample drawn by using snow ball technique amounted to 90 respondents. The data was collected by questionnaire. The results show: (1) 78% of respondents got job less than 6 months after graduation, 13% less than 12 months, and 5% more than 12 months; (2) 66% of the graduates got job facilitated by BKK, 15% by friend/family, 19% by self; (3) 86% of the workers left job because of contract termination, 14% to find other job; (4) 46% did not extend contract, 54% extended one times. (5) 42% of the workers got the first contract for 2 years, 33% for 12 months, 25% for less than 6 months. (6) 70% of the workers extended contract for 12 months, 25% for less than 6 months, and 5% for 2 years. After the contract termination, 20% doing uncertain jobs, 27% helping parents, 26% as enterpreneur, 27% as jobless.

Keywords: terminated worker, revitalization, company, special job recruitment

1 Introduction

The revitalization of vocational education by the government cq. the Ministry of Education and Culture aimed to support the development of human resources of the country, because competitive and skill work force produced by high quality of education and training needed by the world of industry [1]. The program of revitalization of Vocational School based on the Presidential Instruction No 9 Tahun 2016 to upgrade the quality of man power to face the 4.0 technology development. There is a need to stress again the spirit of link and match, the iconic of vocational education in order that the graduates of vocational school ready to enter the world of work soon after their graduation. The link and match spirit now enforced by the spirit of 'vocational school can be excellence' which is always brought in every event of skill competition among vocational school students. The programs that will be affected in the revitalization among others maritime, textile, automotive, mechatronics, electronics and creative industries [2].

But a concern exists during the last view years because there is the fact that vocational school graduates contributes to the highest proportion of open unemployment in

the country compared to other level of school graduates. The data from the Statistic Board Centre shows that during the 2017 the unemployment of vocational school graduates was 11,41%, the highest among the other level of school graduates. On February 2019 the unemployment of vocational school graduates was 8,63% it was lower than the data of February 2018 which was 8,92%, though it was still the highest percentage compare to other level of school graduates.

Having a job soon after graduation of a school is the willing of every school graduate and his parent, including vocational school graduates, but having a job match with the competence is very important for the sustainability of the job. Working without exercising competence faces a big chance of losing the job as caused by reorganization of the work/industry or modernization of machinery. Modernization of machinery in industry to be more efficient in production process can cause in reducing 40% to 75% workers [3]. Unskilled or low skilled workers, or even with no skill at all will be the first of losing their jobs. As long as the worker is poorly trained, as long as he is an inefficient factor in production and his place is easily filled, he can be dominated through fear of losing a poor job [4].

Man power is a crucial component in the process of production system. Competent worker can give significant influence in producing high quality of products or services for the advantages of company. Watching from the other side, workers having high skill in his/her area of competence will have a power to influence in determining hours, wages and working conditions. Therefore, let the worker become a skilled partisan or let him having a combination of cooperation gain control of the supply of the product that he has to sell, then he becomes a potent factor in determining hours, wages and working conditions. Moreover, as soon as he becomes a skilled worker, his power and importance as a citizen are enhanced and he begins to tamper with the machinery at the source of his master's political strength [4].

The cost of conducting vocational school is higher than general school ,[5-7] On the other hand, students of vocational school generally come from low income families [7, 8]. Students enter the vocational school in order to have job soon after graduation to avoid the dependence to their parents and society. The tuition fee from the student of vocational school can not cover the spending of operational budget of vocational school. Therefore, vocational school need to be supported politically and financially by the government in order the students of low income families to have good training, so that they can enter the world of work soon after graduation and can be productive workers. It is ironic whenever the high cost of schooling can not produce high skill graduates, this is a wasting time, money and man power. In the situation in which the number of professional teachers for vocational schools running down, the teachers who are in working should be optimized. Vocational schools in the country need more than 119 thousands professional vocational school's teachers, and specifically for public vocational schools needs 71.830 teachers to operate normally [9]

Open unemployment of vocational school graduates can be divided into two groups. The first group is the graduates of vocational school who never have a job or never work, and the second group is the graduates of vocational school who have ever been a worker in company as a contract worker and then terminated. While the first group usually including fresh graduates and the graduates of a view years before but do not have a job that mostly in the age of around 18-20, the age of the second group usually over 20 and under 24 years old.

2 Research Method

The goals of the research was to describe the workability of vocational school graduates, whether the graduates can get job soon after the graduation, and whether the job match with the competence the graduates training in vocational high school. The highly match between the competence of the worker and the skill required for handling a job is very crucial for the sustainability the job by the graduates to be an efficient worker until the age of retirement.

The study used a quantitative approach, and this was a survey research. A survey research can be descriptive to get data from the past or the present. The research took place in Yogyakarta and some cities of southern Central Java. The subjects of the research were vocational high school graduates who worked in industry/company as contract workers, and then terminated,. The graduates don't work anymore because the contract with the company is expire. The sample of the study withdrew by using snowball sampling technique amounted to 90 respondents. A questionnaire was used to collect data from respondents and completed by interview. The data was statistically analyzed using percentage formula, and to capture the deep meaning, the data also qualitatively analyzed.

3 Results and Discussion

Accounted to 52% of the respondents got their first job less than 3 months after their graduation, 29% respondents got their job after three months of their graduation but less than 6 months, 9% respondents got their first job after six months of their graduation but less than nine months, and 10% of the respondents got their first job after 9 and 12 months after their graduation. This result shows that the goal of vocational education in order the graduates to get job soon after their graduation is relatively realized. Even most of the 52% of the respondents who got job less than 3 months after their graduation actually they got job in the event of job fair held by the Association of Special Job Recruitment (ABKK) before their graduation. This finding parallel to the result of a research conducted by Kartika Sari and Putu Sudira [10], that waiting time for vocational school graduates range from three to six months after graduation, but to the researchers the waiting time depends on the activeness of the graduates of seeing job market.

Accounted to 43% of the respondents got their first job not match with the skill the graduates learned in vocational school, 24% perceive low matching, 28% match enough and 5% perceive highly match. This result shows that just 28% and 5% of the respondents get a job that really match to their skill that can insurance the sustainability of having the job by the workers. Working in job not exercising competence will take a risk of losing the job, because the workers can not exercise their competence as the skills that enable them to perform successfully in specific tasks, and therefore would be an inefficient factor in production [11]. Consequently the worker would be dominated through fear of losing a poor job. The proportion of 43% and 24% of the respondents

have the risk of low wage, uncomfortable of job facility and have no power to bargain their position in making decision in the work place.

A match between the competence of the worker and the skill required by the job is necessary but it is not enough to sustain the job for the worker. There should be a match the level of the skill between the two in order for the worker to stay in his/her position. The development of science and technology may cause unskilled workers losing of their jobs. The result of the research shows that 26% of the respondents who perceive a match between their competence and the skill needed to handle a job, stated that the level of the skill between the two is not match, 28% stated less match, 36% said there is enough match, and 5% said highly match. From this result it can be infer that to handle a job effectively, the skill level of the respondents need to be upgrade to higher level as required. This result indicate the need to synchronize the curriculum contents to the need of employers, or companies [12-14]. This result also can figure that 54% of the respondents who perceive the matching between the skill they have and the required skill by the job is facing the risk of losing their job, unless there would be a training to advance the work capacity of the workers.

The problem exists whenever the graduates take the job that in fact not match with their competence. A competence is a skill that enable a person to successfully perform specific tasks in a work environment. The concept of competence also include practical and theoretical knowledge, attitudes, and personal and social skills [11]. The graduates put the first priority of getting job soon rather than waiting for a job that match to their competence to show their best performance in work in order to get the best pay. The concern from the beginning when the students and their parent decided to choose vocational school for schooling is to have job soon after the schooling. Both the graduates and their parents proud of having a job in big city, no meter that the job not match with the training skill of the graduates, and what ever the salary that would be earned. The graduates do not consider the importance of job satisfaction that includes good payment, interesting tasks, a safe employment, good social surrounding, enough leisure time, low achievement pressure, and enough freedom of choice [15]. The graduates also do not think the future of the job, whether it will be sustainable or not.

Accounted to 66% of the vocational school graduates got their first job through job fair facilitated by the board of special job recruitment (BKK), appointed by every vocational school to market their graduates. The special job recruitment in vocational high school was founded on the basis of the Decree of the Director General of Binapenta No. Kep.131/DPPTKN/XI/2004, specifically article (1) and (2). The work scope of the special job recruitment including registration and data collection of job opportunities vacancies; giving guidance to graduates, offering to users of labor, carrying out verification as a follow up to the delivery and placement that has been done; and the implementation of job fair and similar activities[16].

Three parties have the advantages from the job fair conducted by ABKK. The first party is the graduates who have easier to get a job because it is facilitated by the BKK/ABKK. The graduates were assisted in writing proposal to companies, getting a yellow card from the government as a job seeker, assisted by the BKK/ABKK in correspondence with companies, and before leaving to the work place, the BKK gives orientation to the worker candidates on work culture, regulations of the company,

discipline, etc. The second party is the companies with the advantage of easier to recruit workers through job fair facilitated by BKK/ABKK, especially in test administration in order to find qualified workers, either oral test or written test. The ABKK assists the companies in correspondence with the worker candidates, in handling documents from the worker candidates. The third party is the schools, the vocational school has a medium in marketing the graduates as the responsibility to the community and the parents of the students in conducting schooling. It is also a form of responsibility of vocational school to help the graduates to get a job soon after their graduation.

Accounted to 86% respondents get their first job after graduation as contract worker. The appointment of the contract workers based on the Constitution No. 13 Tahun 2013 and the Ministry of Man Power and Transmigration Regulation No. 07/Men/IV/2008 on Placement of workforce (man power). In article no. 52 of the Constitution it is stated that work contract can be extended to the second contract for one times. After the second contract, that is after the contract had been extended, if the company still need the worker, the company should appoint as a permanent worker.

The hope of the respondents who were the vocational school graduates and their parent to be appointed/assigned as permanent workers after the contract finish can not be a reality. Most of the contract workers as the respondent of this research, were terminated as workers and were not appointed as permanent workers. It means the workers can not sustain their job. As illustrated by the Head of the Association of Special Job Recruitment that there was a company hired 137 vocational high school graduates as contract workers, and at the end of the contract there were only two persons appointed as permanent workers. Other informant as a head of a company said that it is very rare contract workers assigned as permanent workers after they work for 2 to 3 years. The company prefer to recruit new workers from fresh graduates of vocational high school.

There are two factors hinder the respondents to be assigned as permanent workers after their 2 to 3 years in work. The first factor is the unmatched between the skill the workers training in school and the skill required for the job. The workers can be categorised as unskilled workers, so their position can be easily filled by other workers with the same condition. In this situation, the respondents as semi-skills workers finding themselves in lower ranking jobs because the number of graduates in the labor force outpace the number of graduates jobs [17]. This argument can be justified by the fact that after the termination of the workers, the company hires fresh graduates from the same vocational schools as the substitution of the terminated workers. The second factor hinders the contract workers to be assigned as permanent is the appointment/hiring the worker as contract worker in a limited time, from 3 months to 24 months for the bases of appointment. Although the contract can be extended, there is only for one times with the maximum extension of 24 months, and then terminated.

The result of the research shows that companies prefer to hire workers having good work habits and attitudes, discipline, honest, and other good characteristics. Sometimes this skill is called general skills which consists of soft skills, social skills and communication skills [18]. The companies rather put aside the technical capability of the candidates because this technical skill can be learned on the job. This is one of the reasons the companies trace the record of the graduates to the school to make sure the soft skill mastered by the graduates [19]. It is similar situation to the West, especially Great

Britain two decade ago that the qualities which employers want in school leavers are the ability to learn, the ability to get on well with other people, the ability to communicate, reliability, and an understanding of how the community's wealth is created. The employers tend to favor applicants with academic rather than vocational educational backgrounds, and place premium not on technical skill but on good work habits and attitudes [5, 14, 20]. There should be a good collaboration between companies and vocational school in order the school to produce graduates who are ready to enter the world of work. But even in Germany this kind of collaboration does not running well in maso level, just about 30% of companies involved in the collaboration [21]. To serve the need of workforce in companies, the curriculum of vocational education shpould be made relevan to the need of employers, a curriculum is needed in which practical work is the base, and subjects are integrated with students practical work experience[22].

4 Conclusion

The goal of vocational high school of having the graduates to get job soon after the graduation relatively can be realized. It shown by more than 50% of the graduates get job within three months after their graduation, even the graduates get their first job before the national final examination is conducted by the government. But not all of the graduates who get job soon after graduation match with their skill, on the contrary that almost 66% of the graduates get job not match between their training skill and the skill required by the job.

Because the low matching between the skill/competence of the graduates and the skill required by the job, most of the graduates terminated from the job after their contract expire. The vocational high school graduates who ever been a contract workers cannot sustain their job, and to be jobless by the age before 24 years old. The terminated contract workers need to upgrade their skill in order to sustain their job, or in order to get other job.

Acknowledgement

The research was funded by DRPM (The Directorate of Research and Community Service) the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education the Republic of Indonesia.

References

1. Kompas, Pacu Kinerja Revitalisasi Vokasi, Tingkatkan Kualitas Lulusan SMK Indonesia, in Kompas. 2019, Kompas: Jakarta.
2. Gufron, A., Suwarna, Sudiyatno, S. Sunaryo, A. Sri, F. Noor, and I. Ketut Ima. Design of 21st Century Vocational School Workshop: Nawacita Study of the Vocational School Revitaliation Program. in 1st International Conference on Science & Technology for Internet of Things 'A New Round of IoT in Digitizing Science and Technology in the 4.0 era'. 2018.
3. Swasono, Y., Kualitas Alumni Perguruan Tinggi dan Kemampuan Daya Serapnya di Dunia Kerja. 1996, Malang: Universitas Merdeka.
4. Giddens, A., *The Third Way*. 2000, Jakarta: PT GRamedia Pustaka Utama.
5. Lauglo, J. and K. Lillis, *Vocationalizing Education. An International Perspective*. 1998, New York: Pergamon Press.
6. Bank, W., *Indonesia Education in Indonesia From Crisis to Recovery*. 1998, Education Sector Unit East Asia and Pasific Region.
7. Sugiyono, *Perbandingan Perkembangan Kemampuan Kerja antara Lulusan SMK dan SMU*, in Fakultas Teknik 2001, UNY: Yogyakarta.
8. Psacharopoulos, G. and M. Woodhall, *Education for Development: An Analysis of Investment Choices*. 1985, Washington D.C.: Oxford University Press.
9. Khurniawan, A.W. and G. Erda, *Darurat Guru Kejuruan di Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan (SMK) Vocational Education Policy White Paper. Vol. 1*. 2019. 1-24.
10. Sari, A.K. and P. Sudira. Transition of Graduates of Vocational High Schools in The Digital Era. in 1st International Conference on Science & Technology for Internet of Things. 'A New Round of IoT in Digitizing Science and Technology in the 4.0 era'. Yogyakarta.
11. van Griethuijsen, R.A.L.F., E.M. Kunst, M. van Woerkom, R. Wesselink, and R.F. Poell, Does implementation of competence-based education mediate the impact of team learning on student satisfaction? *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 2019: p. 1-20.
12. Ichsanudin, I., I. Abdulhak, R. Hasan, and D. Sukirman. The Implementation of Link & Match Program in Improving Competency Alignment with DU/DI on Vocational Curriculum of Agriculture. in *he Implementation of Link & Match Program in Improving Competency Alignment with DU/DI on Vocational Curriculum of Agriculture*. 2018.
13. Subagyo, S. Rasdi Eko, Soesanto, R. Maman, and N. Heri, The Development of Curriculum School Model Based on the Internet of Things. *International Journal of Engineering & Technology*, 2018. 7(2.5): p. 96-99.
14. Freeburg, B.W. and S.E. Arnett, The Impact of Appearance Management Training, Work Status, and Plans After High School on Opinions Regarding Appearance at Work and School. *Journal of Career and Technical Education*, 2010. 25(2): p. 109-119.
15. Diedrich, J., A.C. Neubauer, and A. Ortner, The Prediction of Professional Success in Apprenticeship: The Role of Cognitive and Non-Cognitive Abilities, of Interests and Personality. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 2018. 5(2): p. 82-110.
16. Transmigrasi, K.t.K.d., Keputusan Direktur Jendral Pembinaan dan Penempatan Tenaga Kerja Dalam Negeri No. Kep- 131/DPPTKDN/XI/2004 tentang Petunjukan Teknis Bursa Kerja Khusus. . 2004.
17. Avis, J., *Crossing Boundaries: VET, the Labour Market and Social Justice*. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training* 2018. 5(3): p. 178-190.
18. Schwendimann, B.A., B. De Wever, R. Hamalainen, and A.A.P. Cattaneo, The State-of-the-Art of Collaborative Technologies for Initial Vocational Education: A Systematic Literature Review. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training* 2018. 5(1): p. 19-41.

19. Samidjo, The Profile of Special Job Market of Vocational School in Kebumen Regency. *Jurnal Taman Vokasi*, 2018. **6**(2): p. 218-223.
20. Madni, A., E.L. Baker, K.A. Chow, G.C. Delacruz, and N.C. Griffin, Assessment of Teachers From a Social Psychological Perspective. *Review of Research in Education*, 2015. **39**(1): p. 54-86.
21. Gessler, M., The Lack of Collaboration Between Companies and Schools in the German Dual Apprenticeship System: Historical Background and Recent Data. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training (IJRVET)*, 2017. **4**(2): p. 164-195.
22. Hiim, H., Ensuring Curriculum Relevance in Vocational Education and Training: Epistemological Perspectives in a Curriculum Research Project. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training*, 2017. **4**(1): p. 1-19.