

State Civil Apparatus Reform in Realizing Good Governance

Sartono

{sartonos1969@gmail.com}

Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Halu Oleo University, Indonesia

Abstract. Human resources are one of the areas of change that are the focus of bureaucratic reform in Indonesia that can facilitate the realization of good governance in local governments. This study aims to describe and analyze bureaucratic reforms to develop the capacity of government apparatus resources. This research was carried out within the framework of the Kendari City Government of Southeast Sulawesi Province using an interactive model qualitative analysis approach which includes data collection, data condensation, data presentation, and conclusion/verification by interview. The results showed that structural mutations and promotions often occur with high intensity and on a broad scale, causing high personal instability. However, the use of open and competitive selection in promotion by political leaders as regional civil service coaches has not thoroughly followed the principle of meritocracy. This selection is still influenced by subjective judgments based on discretionary power, which obscure the principle of loyalty. In addition, employee development is carried out through competency development programs and learning culture, but administrative and political support is still lacking. The result is a significant gap in technical, managerial, and socio-cultural competence at all levels of management.

Keywords: Bureaucratic reform; Good Governance; Human Resources; State Civil Apparatus.

1 Introduction

Bureaucratic reform and good governance are two main concepts within the framework of the state system aimed at improving living conditions together in Indonesia. These two concepts are closely related and are not new to the debate (Wahyurudhanto, 2020). Good Governance is one of the main pillars in the development of a country. This is because the government must organize good governance, ensure the achievement of sustainable development, and provide quality public services as demands that must be met (Nadjib et al., 2022), which covers various aspects of life in both formal and informal realms where humans interact (Prakasa et al., 2022).

The term good governance first emerged in the 1980s through World Bank publications in response to the new conditions faced by developing countries (Radaideh, 2022). The concept of good governance involves the decision-making process and management of resources and public affairs in a way that is considered better or desirable (Ofori et al., 2023). The World Bank recognizes that a lack of good governance leads to poverty and hinders the development process (Radaideh, 2022). Sustainability, achievement, and resilience of success have become key issues in governance due to declining government capacity over the past few decades (Meier et al., 2019).

The government needs to focus efforts on good governance that has a dynamic role and influence on human development (Radaideh, 2022). To realize good governance, one of the crucial aspects is a state civil apparatus that is professional, with integrity, and able to provide effective and efficient public services to the community. The quality of services provided to the community plays a very important role in determining the success of services (Setyowati & Hakim, 2022).

In the past, the state civil apparatus was often associated with a bureaucracy that was corrupt, slow, and unresponsive to the needs of the people. The practice of nepotism, collusion, and nepotism has become commonplace, undermining public trust in the government, and hindering the growth and development of a country. When institutions experience weaknesses, this can lead to corruption in society and bureaucracy (Chen et al., 2023). Corruption is one of the major social problems faced by many countries in the world (Zigo & Vincent, 2021). However, realizing the importance of changes and improvements in the state civil apparatus, reforms have been carried out in many countries of the world. This reform aims to change the paradigm, work culture, and management system that exists in the state civil apparatus. Bureaucratic Reform is a series of steps taken to improve the performance of government and public services, as well as develop a more effective and efficient organization (Setyowati & Hakim, 2022).

Bureaucratic reform is an effort to realize a more professional, flexible, integrity, high-performance government system, free from corrupt practices, and avoid the influence of nepotism. Bureaucratic reform can also increase public satisfaction (Pribadi, 2021). The goal is that the bureaucracy can provide good services to the community, be neutral in carrying out its duties, create welfare, have high dedication, and uphold the basic values and codes of ethics that apply to the state apparatus (Indriastuti & Fachrunnisa, 2020). Bureaucrats are an important factor in improving the nation's competitiveness which is characterized by high competence and performance in achieving goals and professionalism which ultimately contributes to building a good public service image (Setyowati & Hakim, 2022).

The reform of the state civil apparatus aims to realize good governance through several strategic steps. First, it is necessary to refine regulations and policies governing the recruitment, appointment, and performance appraisal of civil servants. The recruitment process must be transparent, based on qualifications and competencies, and free from nepotism. Competency-based recruitment and promotion can create a quality bureaucracy (Nadjib et al., 2022). If the bureaucracy relies on political officials in its personnel recruitment process, this can result in the election of less competent officials. Their primary focus tends to be more on service to their superiors than to the general public (Indiahono, 2022). The recruitment and selection process is varied and complicated (Usunier, 2022).

Secondly, education and training are required. To achieve a common understanding, training programs that are run regularly and intensively by local governments are needed (Hardiningsih et al., 2020). The training program is structured with the organization's values of service to individuals in mind (Delisle et al., 2021). Training programs are carried out as a great responsibility in employee training (Fredriksen et al., 2021).

Third, reform of the state civil apparatus must involve the application of information and communication technology in public services. The use of information and communication technology can speed up administrative processes, increase transparency, and reduce

opportunities for corruption. The government must provide diverse and quality e-government services to the people (Guo, 2022). Citizen-focused e-government has become a major focus in developing new technologies (Quintana et al., 2022).

The reform of the state civil apparatus is not an easy process, but it is a very important step in realizing good governance. Research results (Tauhid et al., 2023) indicate that bureaucratic reform efforts that are being carried out to improve the quality of the State Civil Apparatus at the Bima City Human Resources Development Agency have not yet produced significant results and have not succeeded in optimizing the capabilities that should be possessed by civil servants. This is in line with research (Vincent Simandjorang & Kurniawan, 2022) that efforts to improve public services in the context of bureaucratic reform of the State Civil Apparatus have several obstacles. Therefore, implementing reforms in Kendari City requires strong political commitment, active community participation, and close cooperation between the government and the community. Only by carrying out these reforms on an ongoing basis can the government build a professional, transparent, and accountable state civil apparatus to realize good governance for the welfare and progress of the country. In this context, Kendari City as the center of government in its region, also feels the urgency to carry out Reform of The State Civil Apparatus to achieve a more transparent, accountable, and efficient government.

In this context, Kendari City as the center of government in its region, also feels the urgency to carry out Reform of The State Civil Apparatus to achieve a more transparent, accountable, and efficient government. In a broader view, bureaucratic reform is not only about structural change but also about changing the culture and paradigm of running an effective and community-oriented government. Thus, bureaucratic reform measures in Kendari City will open the door to a brighter and more competitive future, and present good governance as a solid foundation in dynamic city management.

2 Method

This research uses a descriptive qualitative approach by exploring the phenomenon of apparatus resource reform in representing good governance in Kendari City. Data collection was conducted through in-depth interviews and observations. Data processing and analysis techniques are carried out in three stages, namely: data reduction, presentation, and conclusion drawing (Miles dan Huberman, 1992). The data is categorized and classified based on similarities and differences and then shows certain patterns that explain these strategies. The informant in this study is a primary data source that provides information about the conditions and realities directly involved in the reform of apparatus resources in Kendari City, Southeast Sulawesi. Meanwhile, 9 research pieces of information were taken from the leaders of regional apparatus organizations purposively.

3 Results and Discussion

Selection and Placement of Structural Officers

Structural officials are one component of employees who are continuously encouraged to improve their productivity and performance (Wahyudi et al., 2021). The purpose of appointing structural officials is to create fair and healthy competition, apply objective criteria, and secure

a highly competent and professional apparatus workforce (Atmojo, 2019). The placement of officials in the public personnel management literature is often used in conjunction with selection because there is a continuity of activity in the office process where candidates who have passed the selection need to be immediately placed in a position. Selection is the final stage of the recruitment process in which decisions are made regarding who will be appointed to vacant positions.

The Kendari City Government, when the field research for this study was carried out, had 915 structural position units, including 715 echelon IV position units, 166 echelon III position units, and 34 echelon II position units. Echelon II positions are all found in regional apparatus organizations, while echelon III and IV positions are not only found in regional apparatus organizations but also 11 sub-districts and 65 villages. The inauguration of structural officials has been considered an ordinary civil service event by bureaucrats in the Kendari City Government. This is due to frequent instances of the inauguration of structural officials by the Mayor or by officials who represent. The period of inauguration and the positions covered can be seen in Table 1 below.

Table 1. The frequency and scope of the inauguration of structural officials within the scope of the Kendari City Government from January 2020 to June 2022.

Inauguration Date	Inauguration Scope	
January 3, 2020	1. 9 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. Administrator officer, lurah, supervisory officer, school principal, head of puskesmas (not specified)	
June 16, 2020	1. 4 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. 64 administrators (echelon III) 3. 206 supervisors (echelon IV)	
October 28, 2020	1. 3 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. 3 administrators (echelon III) 3. 7 supervisors (echelon IV)	
January 11, 2021	1. 4 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. 5 administrators (echelon III) 3. 11 supervisors (echelon IV)	
May 31, 2021	1. 8 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. 36 administrators (echelon III) 3. 59 supervisors (echelon IV)	
June 21, 2021	1. 2 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. 6 administrators (echelon III) 3. 1 supervisor (echelon IV)	
November 30, 2021	1. 3 PTP officials (echelon II)	
January 1, 2022	1. Equalization of 323 structural officials into functional positions	

March 24, 2022	1. 4 PTP officials (echelon II)	
April 16, 2022	1. 2 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. administrative officers, supervisors, lurah, heads of UPTD, principals and school supervisors (not specified)	
April 28, 2022	1. 4 PTP officials (echelon II)	
June 8, 2022	1. 1 PTP official (echelon IIa)	
June 29, 2022	1. 5 PTP officials (echelon II) 2. 8 administrators (echelon III) 3. 19 supervisors (echelon IV) 4. Head of field, section head in OPD (not specified).	

Data sources: Various online news sources.

For other echelon II structural positions, the inauguration is only inaugural because the official concerned has previously occupied the position but participated in an open position auction by the provisions of the legislation in the field of personnel and was also declared graduated for the position. However, most of these appointments included mutations and promotions, including echelon II posts. This mutational inauguration is often termed by the inaugurating official as a process of refreshment and strengthening, while for promotional inaugurations it is referred to as capacity building. The results of the study (Purwaningsih & Supriyanto, 2020) indicates that the development of a decision support system for the structural promotion process can serve as a database for long-term useful employee performance appraisals.

The inauguration signifies the formalization of the placement of structural officials. The initial stage of the inauguration of structural officials within the scope of the Kendari City Government is the position selection process. It is important to apply evaluation in an open selection based on objective criteria, to reduce or eliminate as much as possible the element of subjectivity that can have a negative impact (Atmojo, 2019). Based on the results of this study, the selection of positions for primary high leadership officials (echelon II) during the period January 2020 to June 2022 is partly in the form of open selection by laws and regulations, the other part is in the form of closed selection based on the discretion of regional civil service officials.

The placement of echelon III and IV structural positions in the Kendari City Government has not applied the principle of open and competitive selection as in echelon II positions. This is because there are no implementation provisions from the central government while these processes must refer to legal and clear rules of the game. (Vincent Simandjorang & Kurniawan, 2022) argues that constant improvement in the selection tools for candidates for Apparatus Sipil Nis is important to accurately measure the quality of candidates, especially in terms of integrity, technical skills, and social-cultural alignment.

The placement of echelon III and IV structural officials, based on the results of this study, was carried out based on the results of evaluations conducted by authorized officials in regional civil service institutions. Related to this, in Kendari City Government there is a shift in the evaluation criteria used. Until the end of 2021, performance and loyalty are two main criteria.

The essence of the data presented above is that: (1) the selection and placement of structural officials in the Kendari City Government organization take place massively, on average the inauguration of officials occurs once in 2.5 months and covers all levels of office from echelon IV to echelon II; (2) officials who are appointed definitively and who have confirmed in echelon II structural positions are all through open and competitive position selection according to government regulations, while for echelon III and IV, positions are generally based on the results of performance evaluations, loyalty and innovation carried out by officials in regional civil service institutions according to their authority; and (3) the conduct of performance evaluations and official loyalty has no visible legal-formal basis, giving rise to issues of power relations and maneuvering in organizational politics. This is in line with research (Vincent Simandjorang & Kurniawan, 2022) that there are several obstacles in the procurement or recruitment system of the State Civil Apparatus in Indonesia. These constraints cover various aspects, such as the number of formations available, the availability of infrastructure, the types of tests applied, as well as the lack of interest from various groups such as diaspora communities, people with disabilities, and other talented individuals to take on the role of Civil Servants in serving the country. In addition, the current policies related to employee management are less effective (Rosyida et al., 2020).

Employee Development

Employee development is often referred to as education and training, training and development, or learning and development. Employee development is carried out to improve the efficiency of employee performance in achieving predetermined work results (Dachner et al., 2021; Hardiningsih et al., 2020).

Competency development through education and/or training is important for the Kendari City Government to adapt employee competencies to position competency requirements. This is important because there are frequent job mutations as previously described. The results of the document analysis that the author conducted, there are often mutations that are not linear, namely from the core positions of public services, such as fields and sections, to internal service positions, such as secretariat and subdivisions. This non-linear position mutation can have an impact on employee competency gaps with position competency requirements and for that, the employees concerned need new development to close the competency gap.

Competency improvement is carried out through learning tasks and programs that aim to improve understanding, skills, and capabilities, as well as strengthen the ability to think through changes in moral and behavioral aspects (Tauhid et al., 2023). The types of position

competencies that require development for employees in the Kendari City Government consist of technical competencies, managerial competencies, and sociocultural competencies. These types of competencies have been specified in the Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 38 of 2017 concerning Competency Standards for State Civil Apparatus Positions. (Latukha et al., 2019) argues that competency-based human resource management is strongly associated with a sustainable competitive advantage within an organization.

The possession of technical, managerial, and socio-cultural competencies by bureaucrats in the Kendari City Government has not been by the established position competency requirements. Most employees, staff, and officials especially at the secondary and secondary levels, lack the necessary job competencies. Education and training for organizationally supported positions are very limited, while employees, staff, and officials are reluctant to incur their expenses to attend education and training outside the agency.

The constraints on competency development originating from individual employees in the Kendari City Government concern the absence of individual career planning. As a result of the document analysis that the author did, each civil servant is obliged to make a career plan. This stage of preparing a career plan begins with identifying careers, gathering basic information about each position, and making choices in which field he will pursue a career in the long term ahead. The results of this study show that most civil servants in the Kendari City Government have not made career plans. In addition, employees who have made career plans generally do not carry out the stages of long-term career identification but fill out only the existing format to meet the leader's request

Human resource capacity development through the creation of a learning culture implemented in Kendari City Government takes various forms but all of them are based on policies that provide a conducive climate for learning. The second effort in encouraging a learning culture in Kendari City Government is to empower employees, by applying a facilitative management style, so that employees can manage work. The author sees that in various regional devices and at all levels, leaders act as facilitators, namely facilitating ideas, initiatives, and implementation by subordinates to achieve the planned goals. However, not all leaders apply a facilitative management style.

From the observations, the author sees that efforts to develop a learning culture through the application of facilitative management styles tend to occur in leaders who are relatively young and have Masters and Doctoral education. Leaders with qualifications of this nature give assignments to subordinates, always give examples, show references, and even provide literature and so on that allow subordinate employees to get new information that can facilitate the completion of their duties.

The development of learning culture through a facilitation process within the Kendari City Government also takes another form, namely the provision of networks with other agencies that have similar tasks both in other regions and at the Southeast Sulawesi Province level. The inauguration of structural officials has been considered an ordinary civil service event by bureaucrats in the Kendari City Government because of the frequent inauguration of structural officials by the Mayor or by representative officials. The appointment of this official includes mutations/transfers as well as promotions. Frequent mutations/transfers of officials indicate high personnel instability. The inauguration of structural officials in the Kendari City Government in the last two years, on average, occurs every 2.5 months. This fact reflects the idea of personnel instability from structural contingency theory, which is the idea of uncertainty in the continuity of employee work.

The results of this study show that the Kendari City Government has carried out employee development. The development carried out includes competency development through education and training, and the development of a learning culture through the application of facilitative management styles, requests for *feedback*, and *role models*. Both forms of development are very relevant, both to anticipate competency gaps caused by employee transfer and mutation practices that occur very often and are not linear, rapid changes in the task environment, and to encourage organizational learning based on employee independence on an ongoing basis. The types of position competencies developed for employees in the Kendari City Government consist of technical competencies, managerial competencies, and sociocultural competencies. This is by the types of competencies specified in the Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 38 of 2017 concerning Competency Standards for State Civil Apparatus Positions. Previous research (Nazara, 2020) also shows that the use of competency standards has encouraged state civil servants to continue to improve their capabilities through education and training programs for state civil servants at the Nias Regency Regional Civil Service Agency.

Although it has carried out employee development, the findings of this study also show that there is still a gap in competence between the required position and the required position competencies. Employees at the lower and middle levels lack the necessary position competencies. This is because education and training for positions that are supported organizationally are very limited and this is related to the lack of budget availability for education. This fact can be interpreted as the Kendari City Government has not paid attention to the superiority of resources as assumed in the resource-based theory (Almarri & Gardiner, 2014; Barney, 1991). Supposedly, the Kendari City Government needs to pay greater attention to employee development because employees are humanitarian-based resources that enable the Kendari City Local Government organization to achieve a sustainable competitive advantage. This is in line with research (Rosyida et al., 2020) that the mismatch between the ability of employees and the demands of their positions and placement is still the main issue faced by the State Civil Apparatus. This study also found that the development of position competencies is constrained by administrative technical problems, namely the unbuilt career development

database and position competency map, and the unprepared career development plans for individual employees in each regional apparatus organization.

4 Conclusion

In the context of the selection and placement of structural officials, the main objective of the appointment of structural officials is to achieve fair and fair competition, while ensuring that the workforce within the bureaucracy has high competence and professionalism. The process of inaugurating structural officials within the Kendari City Government takes place continuously, involving various levels of positions from echelon IV to echelon II. Selection for echelon II positions is carried out through an open and competitive selection process by applicable laws and regulations. On the other hand, the placement of officials in echelon III and IV positions still depends on the evaluation of performance, loyalty, and innovation carried out by these officials. However, some issues need to be considered regarding the placement of employees that are not always in line with the competencies required by the position. Many employees are placed in positions that do not match their qualifications. Limited competency development, especially for echelon III and IV levels, is one of the main causes of this discrepancy. Factors such as lack of individual career planning, lack of available training, and lack of job competency data and maps, also contribute to this problem. Employee development efforts are carried out through education and training, as well as by implementing a learning culture. However, there is still a gap between the competencies possessed by employees and the competencies needed in positions. Position competency development is hampered by administrative constraints, such as the lack of a comprehensive database on career development and job competency maps. To address these issues, steps such as improving employees' career planning, providing better access to training and education, and building a comprehensive database to manage job competency development are needed. Through this action, it is hoped that the placement of structural officials who are more in line with the competence of the position can be achieved, and employee development can run more effectively in achieving the work goals that have been set.

Acknowledgement

The author would like to thank the Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Halu Oleo University.

References

- [1] Almarri, K., & Gardiner, P. (2014). Application of Resource-based View to Project Management Research: Supporters and Opponents. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 119(March), 437–445. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.03.049>
- [2] Atmojo, M. E. (2019). Faktor-faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Penentuan Pejabat Struktural Eselpn II Di Pemerintahan Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta. *Kebijakan : Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi*, 10(1), 12–18. <https://doi.org/10.23969/kebijakan.v10i1.1419>
- [3] Barney, J. (1991). Firm Resources and Sustained Competitive Advantage. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), 99–120. <https://doi.org/10.1177/014920639101700108>
- [4] Chen, Y., Khurshid, A., Rauf, A., Yang, H., & Calin, A. C. (2023). Natural resource

- endowment and human development: Contemporary role of governance. *Resources Policy*, 81(103334), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2023.103334>
- [5] Dachner, A. M., Ellingson, J. E., Noe, R. A., & Saxton, B. M. (2021). The future of employee development. *Human Resource Management Review*, 31(2), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hrmr.2019.100732>
- [6] Delisle, D. R., Dajani, J., & Overton, L. (2021). An Integrated Model to Accelerate Patient Satisfaction Improvement. *American Journal of Medical Quality*, 36(4), 255–262. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1062860620953213>
- [7] Fredriksen, E., Thygesen, E., Moe, C. E., & Martinez, S. (2021). The digitalization of municipal healthcare collaboration with volunteers: a case study applying normalization process theory. *BMC Health Services Research*, 21(1), 410. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-021-06429-w>
- [8] Guo, Y. (2022). Digital Trust and the Reconstruction of Trust in the Digital Society: An Integrated Model Based on Trust Theory and Expectation Confirmation Theory. *Digital Government: Research and Practice*, 3(4), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3543860>
- [9] Hardiningsih, P., Udin, U., Masdjojo, G. N., & Srimindarti, C. (2020). Does Competency, Commitment, and Internal Control Influence Accountability? *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics, and Business*, 7(4), 223–233. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2020.vol7.no4.223>
- [10] Indiahono, D. D. (2022). Bureaucratic Neutrality Index in Direct Regional Head Elections: Optimism in Developing Professional Bureaucracy in Indonesia. *Public Policy and Administration*, 21(3), 249–261. <https://doi.org/10.5755/j01.ppa.21.3.31788>
- [11] Indriastuti, D., & Fachrunnisa, O. (2020). Achieving Organizational Change: Preparing Individuals to Change and their Impact on Performance. *Public Organization Review*, 21(3), 377–391. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11115-020-00494-1>
- [12] Latukha, M., Lisina, P., & Panibratov, Y. (2019). Developing sustainable competitive advantage of a firm through human resource management practices: a competence-based approach. *Global Business and Economics Review*, 21(1), 96. <https://doi.org/10.1504/GBER.2019.096855>
- [13] Meier, K. J., Compton, M., Polga-Hecimovich, J., Song, M., & Wimpy, C. (2019). Bureaucracy and the Failure of Politics: Challenges to Democratic Governance. *Administration & Society*, 51(10), 1576–1605. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0095399719874759>
- [14] Nadjib, A., Bafadhal, O. M., & Santoso, A. D. (2022). Social Capital, Bureaucratic Neutrality, and Regional Head Election in Indonesia. *Studia Regionalne i Lokalne*, 87(1), 37–50. <https://doi.org/10.7366/1509499518703>
- [15] Nazara, D. K. (2020). Pengembangan Kompetensi Aparatur Sipil Negara di Badan Kepegawaian Daerah Kabupaten Nias. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial*, 1(1), 224–233. <https://doi.org/10.38035/JMPIS>
- [16] Ofori, P. E., Asongu, S. A., Tchamyou, V. S., & Salahodjaev, R. (2023). The synergy between governance and trade openness in promoting female economic inclusion in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 96(November 2022), 102672. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2022.102672>
- [17] Prakasa, S. U. W., Asis, A., & Sahid, M. M. (2022). Reduce Corruption in Public Procurement: The Effort Towards Good Governance. *BESTUUR*, 10(1), 33. <https://doi.org/10.20961/bestuur.v10i1.51339>
- [18] Pribadi, U. (2021). Bureaucratic reform, public service performance, and citizens' satisfaction: The case of Yogyakarta, Indonesia. *Public Policy and Administration*, 20(2), 312–326. <https://doi.org/10.13165/VPA-21-20-2-13>
- [19] Purwaningsih, Y., & Supriyanto, R. (2020). Sistem Pendukung Keputusan promosi

- Pejabat Struktural Melalui Diklat Kepemimpinan IV Menggunakan Metode Profil Matching Studi Kasus di PPPPTK Bahasa Jakarta. *Jurnal Aplikasi Bisnis Dan Manajemen*, 6(1), 74–85. <https://doi.org/10.17358/jabm.6.1.74>
- [20] Quintana, A. G., Urquía-Grande, E., & Jalón, M. L. D. (2022). Strategic Conceptual Theories and Sustainable Cooperation Among Stakeholders in E-government, E-participation, and Social Media. *Central European Journal of Public Policy*, 16(2), 46–63. <https://doi.org/10.2478/cejpp-2022-0007>
- [21] Radaideh, R. M. H. (2022). The Impact of Good Governance on Human Development in Jordan: A Case Study. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 12(5), 81–95. <https://doi.org/10.36941/jesr-2022-0124>
- [22] Rosyida, L., Hakim, A., & Saleh, C. (2020). Competency Based State Civil Apparatus Structuring in The Framework of Bureaucracy Reform. *BISNIS & BIROKRASI: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Dan Organisasi*, 27(3), 130–140. <https://doi.org/10.20476/jbb.v27i3.12385>
- [23] Setyowati, E., & Hakim, A. (2022). The Perception of Administrative Staff on the Abolition of Echelon III and IV for Beauraucratic Reform in the Higher Education. *Pakistan Journal of Life and Social Sciences (PJLSS)*, 20(2), 187–201. <https://doi.org/10.57239/PJLSS-2022-20.2.003>
- [24] Tauhid, Mas'ud, M. T., & Yasin, H. (2023). Bureaucratic Reform in Organizing and Managing Adaptive, Accountable , and Competency-Based Civil Servants Based on ' World- Class Smart Civil Servants '. *Jurnal Studi Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 4(2), 1–14. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.35326/jsip.v4i2.3429>
- [25] Usunier, M. R. (2022). The Evolving Role of the External Search Firm in the Canadian Decanal Search. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 52(3), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.47678/cjhe.vi0.189323>
- [26] Vincent Simandjorang, B. M. T., & Kurniawan, A. (2022). Contextual Bureaucratic Reform in the Recruitment System of the State Civil Apparatus of Indonesia. *KnE Social Sciences*, 599–617. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v7i9.10967>
- [27] Wahyudi, H., Susbiyani, A., Qomariah, N., & ... (2021). Pengaruh Diklat Dan Komitmen Organisasi Terhadap Kinerja Dengan Motivasi Sebagai Variabel Intervening Pada Pejabat Struktural Pemerintah Kabupaten *Jurnal Sains Manajemen Dan Bisnis Indonesia*, 11(2), 108–123. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.32528/jsmbi.v11i2.4270>
- [28] Wahyurudhanto, A. (2020). Critical Reorientation of Bureaucratic Reform and Good Governance in Public Sector Administration in Indonesia. *Webology*, 17(2), 308–316. <https://doi.org/10.14704/WEB/V17I2/WEB17033>
- [29] Zigo, D., & Vincent, F. (2021). “Beneficial Owners” Policy: Comparison of Its Efficacy in the West with Prospects for Curbing Corruption in China. *DANUBE*, 12(4), 273–292. <https://doi.org/10.2478/danb-2021-0018>