

How Overtourism in Bali Destroy Balinese Women's Livelihood

Leonardus Aditya Krisnadi¹ and Septiana Dwiputri Maharani²
{leonardusaditya@mail.ugm.ac.id¹, septiana.dm@ugm.ac.id²}

Faculty of Philosophy Universitas Gadjah Mada, Sleman 55281, Indonesia¹
Faculty of Philosophy Universitas Gadjah Mada, Sleman 55281, Indonesia²

Abstract. This study aims to explain the impact of overtourism in Balinese women livelihood with literature study method. Tourism in Bali is developing very fast. The rapid increase of tourists has led to the escalation of overtourism in Bali. Overtourism demands more infrastructure to fulfill tourist's need. As a result of this demand, overtourism poses a threat to the sustainability of Bali. In a patriarchal society like Bali, women will be the group that is more affected by overtourism. This study shows that Bali tourism industry failed to empower women and enforce their position as second class citizen. Gender discrimination and exploitation in tourism industry have become a daily reality for Balinese woman. For Balinese women, overtourism destroy their livelihood. This situation called for total reform in Bali tourism industry to prevent the return of 'old normal' overtourism.

Keywords: overtourism, women, exploitation

1 Introduction

Tourism has become an inseparable part of Balinese livelihood. Before the Covid-19 pandemic disrupts the tourism industry, the growth of tourists in Bali tends to increase. The development of tourists shows the economic benefit from the Bali tourism industry. [1] The increase in tourists also requires a workforce in the tourism industry. Tourism in Bali creates 409 jobs to accommodate the needs of 1000 foreign tourists. [2] To encourage the growth of tourism in Bali, the government of Indonesia facilitates a visa-free policy.[3]

While tourism in Bali continues to bring profit in the economic report, not everyone can enjoy the benefit. Non-Bali business people mainly own the Bali tourism industry. This situation weakens the bargaining power of the local government and the Balinese people to control tourism on their own island.[4] To prevent uncontrolled tourism development in Bali, the provincial government proposed a new concept of Cultural Tourism.[5] Cultural Tourism is rooted in the Balinese philosophy of Tri Hita Karana, and this concept aims to prevent cultural exploitation in the tourism industry. Tourism should provide empowerment and sustainability in community building.[6] Unfortunately, the local government's effort to avoid uncontrolled tourism often has to give in for the sake of national economic growth. As a result

of uncontrollable tourism, the Bali tourism industry is now facing overtourism. Overtourism is a condition where unruly tourism triggers a conflict between local communities and tourists. [7] [8] Although overtourism brings excellent economic benefits through increasing tourist visits, overtourism pose a significant danger to Balinese livelihood. In a patriarchal society like Bali, Balinese women will be increasingly affected by over-tourism.

In the Bali tourism industry, women are not prohibited from participating, but most jobs available to women are still identical to domestic roles.[9] [10] This condition has not changed much since 1998.[11] Another option for Balinese women to enjoy tourism is entrepreneurship, but their husband's domination also hampers this option. [12] Gender discrimination in the Bali tourism industry shows that tourism does not always empower women. [13] Another impact of overtourism on Balinese women is sex tourism growth. Balinese women are trapped in exotic stigma since the beginning of Bali tourism development. As a result of this stigma, many Balinese women are trapped in sex tourism since their childhood. [14] Sex tourism in Bali was born from tourist demand for Balinese women's exoticism. Some erotic local dancers fulfill this demand in Joged Bumbung dance. [15] This condition shows that women are not empowered in the Bali tourism industry. The tourism industry exploits them. This study tries to discuss how overtourism destroye Balinese women's lifehood.

2 Research Methods

This research is a literature study with philosophical hermeneutics method. This study aims to explain the problem of overtourism in Balinese women lifehood. This research is qualitative research with a descriptive approach. The elements from this research analysis as follows:

2.1 Description

Explain the problem of overtourism in Balinese women lifehood.

2.2 Interpretation

Interpret the problem of overtourism in Balinese women lifehood.

2.3 Critical Reflection

Explain the critical reflection on the problem of overtourism in Balinese women lifehood.

3 Results and Discussion

3.1 A Brief History of Bali Tourism Industry

The development of the Bali tourism industry began shortly after the Dutch East Indies occupation in the early 20th century. The first international tourist in Bali is divided into two

categories, the wealthy Westerner who seek exotic islands as an escape from the horrors of World War I and Western artists who seek new experiences. [5] Some renowned artists such as Walter Spies, Miguel Covarrubias, and Gregor Krause write about their experiences in Bali.

To regulate the Dutch East Indies tourism industry, the colonial government established Vereeniging Touristenverkeer/VTV as the new tourism office in 1908. VTV became the authority to promote Bali tourism with an exotic image such as "island of shipwreck looters"-the law of Tawan Karang and "bare-chested island." [4] Books by Westerner artists in Bali also played a significant role in promoting Bali to European and American tourists. Bali tourism disrupts for the first time during World War II and the Indonesian War of Independence. [4]

After Indonesia's independence, the new government began to developed Bali to attract international tourists. The new construction project of I Gusti Ngurah Rai International Airport and Bali Beach Hotel in 1963-1969 increased international tourist arrival in post-independence Bali. [1] Under the New Order regime, the Indonesian government collaborated with French consultant Société Centrale pour equipment Touristique Outre Mer/SCETO to develop a blueprint for Bali tourism modern development. SCETO consultants, in their master plan, develop a long-term plan to prevent cultural exploitation in Bali tourism development. [5] SCETO recommends the cultural tourism pattern where tourists are invited to experience Balinese culture. The SCETO's master plan became the basis of New Orders' Repelita on Bali tourism development.

After Bali tourism brings a tremendous economic benefit, this situation triggers a shift from cultural tourism to mass tourism. [5] To promote Bali in a mass tourism pattern, the image of Bali as an exotic island is maintained to attract tourists in large numbers. This kind of promotion is the exploitation of Balinese culture. Nowadays, the Balinese community faces a dilemma between economic benefit from mass tourism that exploits culture or maintains Bali's sustainability. [4] In the mass tourism-oriented industry, Bali is facing a new problem: overtourism. Overtourism is an urgent problem that must be solved for the future of Bali.

3.2 Overtourism in Bali

The word "overtourism" originated from Skift's article in 2016. [8] Since 2016, several experts in the tourism industry have attempted to explain over-tourism. The World Tourism Organization defines over-tourism as a result of the lack of good management and regulation in tourism development. Overtourism is described as a condition when the increasing number of tourists disrupts local communities. Overtourism is an excellent problem in several renowned tourist destinations, and this problem triggers local communities' refusal of tourism. [7]

The tourism industry interprets overtourism differently. The tourism industry prefers to replace overtourism with "overcrowded." "Overcrowded" shows a sign of success, not a sign of a problem. [7] When the tourism industry interprets overtourism as overcrowded, the public awareness of overtourism is decreasing. This denial to face over-tourism as a problem also weakens the efforts to develop a new regulation. Current research by World Tourism

Organization concluded that "overcrowded" tourism in 8 renowned European cities does not require tourist restrictions. [8] This conclusion from World Tourism Organization's research shows that the efforts to sustainable tourism are still prolonged.

Overtourism is affected by the shift in the tourism industry's patterns from cultural tourism to mass tourism. In Bali, the tourism industry prefers mass tourism patterns because it brings more significant and faster profit. Bali's mass tourism causes damage to Bali, an increase in waste due to tourism, and overcrowding in some areas. [3] The rise in tourists also demands a plentiful supply of water, which triggers a conflict between the tourism industry and local communities. [16]

The reason why the Bali tourism industry prefers mass tourism is for economic benefit. Mass tourism also easier to bring profit than cultural tourism, as suggested by SCETO. Mass tourism is seen as a successful method to increase tourists in Bali. The visa-free policy applied to 30 major countries also contribute to the increase of foreign tourists in Bali. [3] Before the Covid-19 pandemic, tourists visit in Bali show a growing trend.

Table 1. Number of Foreign Visitor to Bali, 2010-2020. Source: BPS Bali [17]

Number of Foreign Visitor		
Year	Total	Growth (%)
2010	2 576 142	8,01
2011	2 826 709	9,73
2012	2 949 332	4,34
2013	3 278 598	11,16
2014	3 766 638	14,89
2015	4 001 835	6,24
2016	4 927 937	23,14
2017	5 697 739	15,62
2018	6 070 473	6,54
2019	6 275 210	3,37
2020	1 069 473	-82,96

Table 2. Number of Domestic Visitor to Bali, 2010-2020. Source: BPS Bali [18]

Number of Domestic Visitor		
Year	Total	Growth (%)
2010	4 646 343	31,96
2011	5 675 121	22,14
2012	6 063 558	6,84
2013	6 975 536	15,06
2014	6 394 307	-8,35

2015	7 147 100	11,77
2016	8 643 680	20,94
2017	8 735 633	1,06
2018	9 757 991	11,70
2019	10 545 039	8,07
2020	4 596 157	-56,41

The increasing number of tourists in Bali has proven to produce a tremendous economic benefit. Mastercard, in their report, shows that the Bali tourism industry supported 409 jobs to accommodate 1000 tourists. [2] In the same information, Mastercard offers the average tourist spending in Bali: USD 125/night. Under these circumstances, mass tourism will tend to be maintained because it brings excellent economic benefits. Although data from Mastercard shows substantial economic benefits for Bali's tourism industry, these benefits are enjoyed mainly by entrepreneurs from Jakarta and abroad. [4] It is estimated that 85% of economic profits from Bali tourism go to non-Balinese entrepreneurs. [3] The dominance of tourism entrepreneurs from outside Bali weakens the bargaining position of the Balinese people towards the future of Bali tourism.

The tendency to apply the pattern of mass tourism in the Bali tourism industry does encourage economic growth. Still, it must be monitored as a power shift from the local community to the tourism industry. The domination of the tourism industry, in the end, brought Bali tourism to over-tourism. Overtourism in Bali is a miserable condition where the Balinese are alienated from their island. Tourism has exploited Balinese culture and nature through mass tourism patterns. Overtourism shows the paradox of Bali being a leading tourist destination through its unique culture and losing its cultural identity. [5]

4 Results and Discussion

The over-tourism problem in the Bali tourism industry is a way of domination over Balinese livelihood. [5] In a patriarchal society like Bali, the impact of over-tourism is increasingly oppressed, Balinese women. Overtourism, born from profit-oriented over women empowerment, creates gender discrimination in the Bali tourism industry. The oppression of Balinese women due to overtourism also increases from preserving the Balinese women's image as exotic beings. This image triggers a steady demand from sex tourism that traps women as a sexual objects to satisfy tourist's demand for exoticism.

4.1 Gender Discrimination in Bali Tourism Industry

In the tourism industry, women make up the majority of the worker in tourism. [19] It is estimated around 54% of workers in the tourism industry are women. However, World Tourism Organization's 2010 study found that women workers in the tourism industry earned 10-15% less than their man counterparts. [11] Part-time and low-skilled jobs still dominate

most women workers in the tourism industry. This situation contradicts the tourism industry's presentation, where tourism is always described to benefit both men and women economically. [13]

This condition also occurs in the Bali tourism industry. World Tourism Organization found income gap between men and women in Indonesia tourism is 30%. [11] This gap arises from many career restrictions applied to women in the tourism industry. [20] Although tourism creates jobs, not all vacancies are available to women. Jobs vacancies open to women are still identical with domestic roles such as waiters, maid, and finance staff. [10] This kind of job is seen as aligned with the Balinese's traditional values. Balinese communities demand that Balinese women prioritize their domestic duty such as taking care of their children and preparing offerings. [9]

Although the job vacancies for women are often still identical with domestic roles, some domestic-related jobs such as room cleaners are dominated by men. [10] Balinese women are also restricted to work the last shift, which lasts from night to morning. The night shift and room cleaners have great potential to get tips from tourists. This problem prevented Balinese women from pursuing their career potential.

Gender discrimination in the tourism industry has not changed much since 1998. [11] This alarming condition shows that the Bali tourism industry does not empower women. Tourism strengthens Balinese women's position with domestic roles. Another option for Balinese women to economically empower themselves is entrepreneurship in the tourism industry. Balinese women mainly take this option after they get married.

Most married Balinese women who work in hotels and restaurants tend to resign and choose to open a stall. [12] This option is considered to be the best choice for married Balinese women because it allows them to carry out domestic tasks and at the same time earn a living. The problem with this option is their husband still dominates the business decision. Tajeddini noted that this condition arises from the assumption of patriarchal Balinese society, which considers women tend to be more emotional to make logical decisions. [12]

The entrepreneur's option in the tourism sector is still very dependent on tourist visits and tourism conditions. [12] When the tourist's visits increase, they will have many clients, but if there is a disruption in tourism, they will lose a client. The dependence of Balinese women entrepreneurs shows the unequal power relations between local communities and the tourism industry. When the tourism industry prioritizes tourists' growth and ignores the reality of tourism workers, gender discrimination and unequal power relations will continue to oppress Balinese women.

Tourism should encourage women's empowerment by not restricting women's potential in the tourism industry. [19] The economic benefit from tourism should be used to improve tourism worker's livelihood. [13] Nor should Balinese women get trapped in the invisible wall that limits their career potential. Ideally, tourism is an equal encounter between tourists and the local community, and tourism should empower local people-including women. [6] To create an ideal tourism industry, tourism development should place women as an equal part, not exploit them. This effort to improve the tourism industry is a long-term plan that requires us to continue discussing how the ideal gender power relation can be realized. [20]

4.2 Sex Tourism in Bali

In Bali tourism development, Balinese women have been used as a part of tourism promotion. VTV used the image of bare-chested Balinese women to form Bali's exoticism image. [5] After Indonesia's independence, the idea of bare-chested Balinese women in the promotional poster is prohibited by the Indonesian government. [4] However, Balinese women are still trapped in the stigma of exotic sexual objects through promotions by the tourism industry.

One of the art performances that often exploit as an erotic show is joged bumbung. Joged Bumbung as a folk dance is used as an erotic dance to entertain the tourist. [15] Joged Bumbung dance was initially a part of sacred folk performances, but the tourist's demand for exotic Balinese art triggers the increasing erotic Joged Bumbung shows. Balinese community, in general, rejects erotic Joged Bumbung shows. This performance is considered taboo in Balinese culture. Erotic Joged Bumbung dance also finds a form of Balinese women and culture exploitation by tourism. As a result of rejection from the Balinese community, most erotic Joged Bumbung are mainly shown only to tourists. [15]

Economic needs cause the increase of Joged Bumbung performances. Most of the dancers and musicians involved in erotic Joged Bumbung performances because of their financial needs. The financial benefit from this erotic dance show makes it harder to solve the increasing sex tourism in Bali. Significant economic benefits from sex tourism are contributing to the growth of prostitution and human trafficking in Bali. [14]

Throughout 2017, Bali and Batam became the top sex tourism destinations in Indonesia. [14] The problem of sex tourism increasingly concerns because children become victims of sexual exploitation by tourists. In 2017 there was 404 victims of child sex tourism in Indonesia, 71% of the victims are girls. [14]

Sex tourism perpetrators are taking advantage of Balinese women's need to improve their family economic condition. A standard pattern by sex tourism perpetrators is promised to provide educational assistance such as school supplies and scholarships. [14] In current technological advances, sex tourism in Bali is growing fast in overtourism. The increasing number of tourists also increases the demand for sex tourism.

Weak regulation and supervision on Bali sex tourism combined with high dependence on tourism are the causes of vulnerability to Balinese women exploitation. [14] The steady growth in Bali sex tourism demand must be adequately addressed. The increasing sex tourism is the result of unequal power relations between Balinese women and tourism. The wealthy tourists have a high bargaining position against Balinese women. This unequal power relation is getting worse in overtourism.

5 Conclusion

This study tries to discuss the impact of overtourism in Bali on Balinese women. The focus of this research is how tourism failed to empowered women and enforce women's domestic role. Another problem of over-tourism is increasingly sex tourism in Bali. The tourism dominance over Balinese people has resulted in overtourism in Bali today. To formed sustainable tourism in Bali, reform in the tourism industry is urgently needed. The covid-19 pandemic that stopped tourists visit should be the right moment to realize reforms in the tourism industry and formed a new regulation to prevent "old normal" overtourism that oppresses Balinese local-especially women.

References

- [1] Made Antara and Made Sri Sumarniasih. Role of Tourism in Economy of Bali and Indonesia. *Tour Hosp Manag.* 2017; volume 5 (2): 34-44.
- [2] Mastercard. *Global Destination Cities Index 2019*. New York: Mastercard; 2019. 16 p.
- [3] Ka Leong Chong. The Noble Impacts of Mass Tourism on Bali Island: A Local Perspective. *JTHCA.* 2019; volume 11 (2): 82-94.
- [4] Michel Picard. *Bali: Pariwisata Budaya dan Budaya Pariwisata*. Jakarta: Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia; 2006. 352 p.
- [5] Jan Hendrik Peters and Wisnu Wardana. *Tri Hita Karana*. Jakarta: Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia; 2013. 456 p.
- [6] I Gede Ardika. *Kepariwisata Berkelanjutan: Rintis Jalan Lewat Komunitas*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama; 2019. 254 p
- [7] Tanja Mihalic. Conceptualizing over-tourism: A sustainability approach. *Ann Tour Res.* 2020; volume 84: 1-12.
- [8] World Tourism Organization. *Overtourism? – Understanding and Managing Urban Tourism Growth beyond Perceptions, Executive Summary*. Madrid: UNWTO; 2018. 12 p.
- [9] Judie Cukier, Joanne Norris, and Geoffrey Wall. The Involvement of Women in the Tourism Industry of Bali, Indonesia. *J Dev Stud.* 1996; volume 44 (2): 248-270.
- [10] I Nyoman Darma Putra. Masih Identik dengan Peran Domestik?: Implikasi Perkembangan Pariwisata pada Dinamika Relasi Gender di Bali. In Ni Ketut Srie Kusuma Wardhani, editor. *Harmonisasi Gender dalam Keluarga pada Zaman Now. Proceedings of the Seminar Nasional Gender dan Anak*; 19 April 2018; Denpasar. Denpasar: IHDN Press; 2018. 1-15.
- [11] World Tourism Organization. *Global Report on Women in Tourism – Second Edition*. Madrid: UNWTO; 2019. 192 p.
- [12] Kayhan Tajeddini, Vanessa Ratten dan Mela Denisa. Female tourism entrepreneurs in Bali, Indonesia. *Tour Hosp Manag.* 2016; volume 31: 52-58.
- [13] Lucy Ferguson. Promoting gender equality and empowering women? Tourism and the third Millenium Development Goal. *Curr Issues Tour.* 2011; volume 14 (3): 235-249.
- [14] Alwafi Ridho Subarkah. Peran ECPAT dalam Menangani Child Sex Tourism di Indonesia (Studi Kasus: Bali). *Transborders.* 2018; volume 2 (1): 67-82.
- [15] I Nyoman Winyana. Seni Tradisi Joged Bumbung diantara Tontonan Estetik dan Etik. *Vidya Samhita.* 2015; volume 1 (1): 118-131.
- [16] Ka Leong Chong. The side effects of mass tourism: the voices of Bali islanders. *Asia Pac J Tour Res.* 2020; volume 25 (2): 157-169.
- [17] Badan Pusat Statistik Bali. *Jumlah Wisatawan Asing ke Indonesia dan Bali 1969-2020* [Internet]. Denpasar: BPS Bali. [cited 2021 June 20]. 1 p. Available from: <https://bali.bps.go.id/statictable/2018/02/09/28/banyaknya-wisatawan-mancanegara-ke-bali-dan-indonesia-1969-2020.html>

- [18] Badan Pusat Statistik Bali. Kunjungan Wisatawan Domestik ke Bali per bulan 2004-2020 [Internet]. Denpasar: BPS Bali. [cited 2021 June 20]. 1 p. Available from: <https://bali.bps.go.id/statictable/2018/02/09/29/banyaknya-wisatawan-domestik-bulanan-ke-bali-2004-2020.html>
- [19] World Tourism Organization. UNWTO Inclusive Recovery Guide – Sociocultural Impacts of Covid-19 Issue 3: Women in tourism. Madrid: UNWTO; 2021. 12 p.
- [20] Hazel Tucker and Brenda Boonabaana. A critical analysis of tourism, gender, and poverty reduction. *J Sustain Tour*. 2012; volume 20 (3): 437-455.