

Narrative Text: Hate Speech on Female Celeb-gram's Account @Rachelvennya

Primada Qurrota Ayun¹, Hedi Pudjo Santosa², Triyono Lukmantoro³
{primada.qurrota@live.undip.ac.id¹}

Universitas Diponegoro, Indonesia^{1,2,3}

Abstract. Celebs-gram or celebrities on Instagram try to show a new identity by showing their daily life through their social media. Unfortunately, many female celebrities receive insinuation and hate speech from netizens in their posts. This cannot be separated from the women stigma regarding to their assessment to them through religion, social, and the value of politeness in society. One of them is the @rachelven account. Her decision to open the veil has made this celeb-gram close the comment column to be limited to his followers. This research is a descriptive textual study using a narrative approach. Narrative in this context refers to updated status on Instagram. Narratives are understood as "small stories" that capture the whole variety of narrative activities that are not represented in the big or canonical narratives. The results of this study indicate that hate speech against female celebrities means that those celebs-gram receive negative judgments and comments from netizens by using religious statements and social norms. The netizens provide comments by quoting verses from the scriptures, giving bad labels, and giving judgments for the celeb-gram's attitudes.

Keywords: Celebrity, Instagram, Narrative Text, Hate Speech

1 Introduction

With the development of information technology today, artists do not only come from someone who is famous in conventional media, but also those who are in cyberspace can be called as artists because of the large number of people who follow them (followers). In 2020, according to the data released by *Napoleon Cat*, in the period of January-May 2020, Instagram users in Indonesia reached 69.2 million (69.270,000) users. This achievement is an increase from month to month on the use of this photo-sharing platform [1].

Through celeb-gram, a new discourse tries to fuse the realm of youth lifestyle. These celebs-gram present luxurious lifestyle, which is different from the daily lives of these teenagers. Their character is highly praised. This can be seen from the number of likes they generate every time they upload their photos on social networks. Celeb-gram also indirectly wants to show a reality that exists in society, forming an ideal identity for teenagers through fashion and life style.

Instagram is a social media with a photo sharing format for one user to other users. It makes a new means of displaying self-expression through internet media. Unfortunately, artists and celebrities who fond of presenting their lives often get hate speech from netizens who follow the artist's account.

Firmina Astuti conducted research on 40 people who have Instagram accounts. The results show that the behaviour shown by teenagers when viewing hate speech content on Instagram

is to let the content, stay silent, ignore the content, and report the content. Some respondents claimed to have been influenced by the content on hate speech accounts and had commented on hate speech, because they were influenced by the content [2].

Hate speech is an act of communication carried out by individuals or groups in the form of insults, provocations, body shaming, and incitement aimed at a group of people or individuals. The results of the latest survey conducted by the Digital Civility Index 2020, Indonesian netizens are the most disrespectful in Southeast Asia. The politeness of Indonesian netizens is even one of the worst out of 32 countries in the survey. The politeness of Indonesian netizens also ranks 29 out of 32 countries surveyed by Microsoft [3]. Hate speech conveyed by someone is based on prejudice against the identity of a person or group. Women become one of the easy targets in hate speech behaviour, and so on.

These celebs-gram often show their glamorous lifestyles and their private lives. One of the things that had gone viral in early 2021 was the hype in Rachel Venny's personal life in her account *@rachelven*. Rachel Venny is one of the celebrities who reportedly removed her hijab and prosecuted the divorce from her husband. Though, this couple was labelled as couple goals.



Fig. 1. Netizens' comments when *@rachelvenny* posted removing veil

Many female artists are used as objects by netizens in venting their dislike through comments in the Instagram column. Unfortunately, most celebs-gram and female artists are the targets of these negative comments compared to male artists. This study wants to analyse the expression of hatred from netizens towards artists and celebrities on Instagram social media.

2 Method

This research is a descriptive textual study using a narrative approach. Narrative in this context refers to various updated status (status updates) on Instagram. Thus, narrative is understood as “small stories” which capture the whole variety of narrative activities that are not represented in the grand or canonical narratives. These small stories are events that have just happened or are taking place. These small stories contain bits and experience and appear as a need to be shared or maybe bits of gossip that are considered uninteresting. Those small stories in everyday language can be considered as something completely meaningless. For strangers, these small stories involving various interacting parties contain "about things which are not important". However, in this context, the small stories are not understood as the subject matter of the whole or nothing. These small stories also include various moments of interactively oriented narrative [4][5][6].

Because the small stories in this study contain and show specific moral views or judgments, the researchers need some considerations. Those considerations are the interrelationships between the ways of telling stories, the sites used to speak, and person who tells them in the circulation that occurs on social media. This concept is known as narrative stance taking which shows how speakers decide on narrative forms and index that can be considered appropriate to the storytelling and/or circulation of ongoing discourse activities [7]. Stance refers to personal beliefs/attitudes/evaluations, social morality, and public actions that can be recognized, interpreted, and subject to the evaluation of other parties [8]. In addition, stance is a general evaluative structure, positioning, and processes that organize action [8]. Stance is a position of partiality that is deliberately taken by the author of the status on Instagram to support or against certain characters. The stance shows how the moral judgments displayed by the followers of certain female celeb-gram.

3 Result

3.1 Narrative: Misogyny Against Female Celebrities

Misogyny can be interpreted as hatred to women. Misogyny is not just a form of sexism or displeasure to women, but hatred of women as a group. In the digital era, misogyny is easier to be expressed. In various blogs and other online forums, women are referred to as “prostitutes” and “social cancer” [9]. Women in this negative point of view are labelled as bad and disgusting social objects. It gets worse when the digital media have become various spaces for men (manosphere) who have such strong misogynistic urges. This misogynistic view can be considered as men's desire to improve women's morality. They want women to carry out various moral and religious norms. Their demand to women is that women must obey men, based on the naturalist ideology.

These misogyny narratives, in the context of the celebrities' life, occur on social media. The term social media in this article refers to new forms of media that involve interactive participation. As a medium in the interactive era, social media is on the contrary to the broadcast age. The characteristic of media in the broadcasting era is that it is almost exclusively centred on a single entity, such as a radio, television station, a newspaper company, or a film studio, which distribute messages to many people. With the advent of digital and mobile technologies, interactions on a larger scale are easy to carry out. Interactivity is also an important feature of this new media [10]. Interactivity refers to a communicative relationship that takes place quickly from one party to another. Delayed

messages can also be resolved. This is what makes this new media become social in nature, namely the exchange of messages can take place more quickly and more personas are involved in it.

Other characteristics that can be seen in social media are: (1) information and cognition, which means that social media allow the flow of information and the introduction of the device itself as a social activity; (2) communication, which means that social media become a site for a reciprocal process between at least two humans, which involves the exchange of symbols and all partners involved in the interaction give meanings to the various symbols; (3) community, which shows that communication occurring on social media is not just social relations, but involves mutual equality or friendship; and (4) collaboration and cooperative work, which shows that the messages displayed on social media are the result of joint work [11]. All of these characteristics of social media indicate that togetherness is the most important value that occurs in social media. It is as if the interactions which take place on social media are full of harmony and without conflict.

However, the friendship that occurs on social media is not always in good condition and takes place comfortably. Even though Instagram users interact with other users as friends, the interactions that occur may be full of conflictual and hostile tones. Once again, it shows that social media have become a “war” site. Moreover, when mutual support for certain celebrities occurs on social media, the opponents convey negative or rude statements. All statements take place there. Social media are no longer arena for sharing information which are full of knowledge and truth, but they have become sites for opposing information. Social media are no longer positioned as area that allow the continuation of interactive relationships, but they have position as a network to spread hatred.

Moreover, the relationship on social media is determined by homophily. This means that individuals will make connections if they have the same attributes. The principles of homophily show that various distributed relationships follow the characteristics of the actors involved there, whether people, organizations, or other entities. People based on gender, ethnicity, language, class, values, or nationality tend to cluster in the same social networks. The dynamics of homophily are based on two important things, namely social selection which makes individuals have similar attributes and the influence of close friends that determine the continuity of interactions with other parties who are considered significant [12]. Moral preferences, towards certain interests, ideologies, and celebrity figures, especially those of celebrities who have high popularity, are things that really lead to the homophily that occurs on social media. These social selections are seen in the groupings that occur in response to a particular issue. Meanwhile, the influence of close friends who are considered to have similar political preferences also determines the continuity of friendships that occur on social media. The formation of friendships or its opposite acts of breaking friendships are based on moral choices and is quite common to take place on social media.

3.2 Verbal Stories

Instagram is one of the social media that is widely accessed by the people in Indonesia. According to the data released by Napoleon Cat, in the period of January-May 2020, Instagram users in Indonesia reached 69.2 million (69.270,000) users. This achievement is an increase from month to month on the use of this photo-sharing platform. In January there were around 62.23 million users and in February the users rose to 62.47 million. Then, in the following month (March) there were more and more users and reached 64 million users. A month later, the number of users reached 65.7 million. It was in May with a record of 69.2 million users. Hansal Savla, Senior Director of TNS Indonesia which is a market research

company, several years ago explained that his party found facts from the results of a survey they conducted. It was about 63 percent of women tend to actively use Instagram every day. It contrasts with the number of men who regularly use the platform as much as 37 percent. The majority of Instagram users are 'well educated' users. They are smart and come from college graduates. The users from college graduates are 69 percent. In fact, the majority of Instagram users can be judged to be 11 times as smart as Indonesian smartphone users in general [1].

Although the results of the survey show that women who use Instagram are said to be smarter, their comments tend to be negative when we look at the celeb-gram's social media accounts and those negative comments obviously attract attention. One of the social media accounts belongs to Rachel Vennya *@rachelven* is a social media account which grabs rude comments because of her activities of removing the hijab after divorced from her husband.



Fig. 2. *@rachelvennya* first picture after removing veil

In Fig. 2, it is the first image of *@rachelven* taking a picture without a hijab which was posted on December 22, 2020. The caption written was the emoticon "love" and she was seen looking at the camera with a flat expression without wearing her hijab. Judging from her expression, she looks normal in making the decision not to wear her hijab anymore.

3.3 Narrative stance taking

Stance is a position of statement that is deliberately chosen by the author of the status on Instagram to support or against certain characters. The stance shows the moral judgments displayed by the followers of certain female celeb-grams. Narrative stance-taking can be shown by how netizens give their stance in the form of comments on their opinions in the captions which have been written by the celeb-gram in his/her account.

Some netizen comments in negative narrative stance-taking tend to give a picture of hate speech. The netizens hate to the attitude of the celebgram was expressed by writing a few sentences as follows:

@Noura.aureli*.**: after she divorced, she did not wear hijab. It means that she wore hijab because of her husband, not for Allah. (248 likes) (*Semenjak cerai buka hijab,, berarti dia itu memakai hijab karna suami bkn karna Allah*)

@Alikabeaute ***: her good character disappears when she did not wear hijab. How pity she is. She did not seem cheerful or beautiful even though she applied make up on her face. Her present character is totally different from it was when she wore hijab. (12 likes) (*Auranya hilang ya ketika sdh lepas hijab...sayang sekali bener2 redup biaroun dandan secantik apapun sdh gak ada auranya jauh hh sekali dibanding mash berhijab*)

@Jelitachydi**: netizen: "have you ever thought for not wearing hijab while your friends do not wearing hijab?" Rachel: "no.." several months later, she did not wear hijab anymore. (29 likes) (*"kaka pernah ga kepikiran lepas hijab sedangkan temen2 kaka ga pake hijab?" rachel: "nggak" bbrp bulan kemudian... 🌟dibuka 🌟*)

@Semutberante***: gee... after you get good luck, then you forget your God. (13 likes) (*Wisshhh udh sukses ya bund, Tuhan dilupakan*)

@Ani***: perhaps she will create mental health quotes. (55 likes) (*Paling bntar lgi bikin quotes mental health*)

---@komporbak****: @anisj, you are talkative. You acted wisely but your action is fake. (10 likes) (*@anisj ember sok bijak tapi topeng doan*)

---@imhaginat***: anisj (laughter emoticon)

@Erviam***: why did you uncover your hijab, dear. (disappointed emoticon) (*Lah ngapa lu buka jilbab tong*)

@Arunda***: you deserve to post picture together with the dog. (*Pantes posting bareng guguk*)

Netizen comments tend to be hate speech. Hate speech is defined as a bias-motivated, hostile, malicious speech at a person or a group of people because of some of their actual or perceived innate characteristics. It expresses discriminatory, intimidating, disapproving, antagonistic, and/or prejudicial attitudes toward those characteristics, which include gender, race, religion, ethnicity, color, national origin, disability, or sexual orientation. Hate speech is to injure, dehumanize, harass, intimidate, debase, degrade, and victimize the targeted groups and to foment insensitivity and brutality against them [13]. The hate speech is shown through the way that netizens do not support what the celebgram is doing. They gave a judgment by saying that the action made the character of the celeb-gram dim and stated that the celeb-gram had left their God.

In addition, there were also netizens who commented by giving advice for the celeb-gram to use the hijab again and citing several arguments from the holy book regarding the celeb-gram's decision to remove the hijab.

@sumayyahbintikhuba****: Dear Rachel, I feel sad seeing your decision now. That is so pity. Why did you open you're your hijab? Rachel looks more beautiful and gorgeous wearing hijab. Wish you wear hijab again dear Rachel and hope you be *istiqomah* with your hijab, amen.

(Ka Rachel 😏😏 Ko ngerasa sedihh aja gituu ngeliat Ka Rachel dengan pilihan yg skrg 😏 saying banget padahal, kenapa harus dilepas jilbabnya? Ka Rachel lebih cantik dan anggun pakai jilbab .. Smoga lekas kembali pakai yaa Ka Rachel, dan smoga bisa istiqomah dengan jilbabnya aamiin .. ❤️😊)

@djfar_n***: "O son of Adam. We have sent down to you clothes to cover your body and beautiful clothes for adornment. The best cloth is your faith. That is part of the signs of Allah's power, hopefully they will always remember."

(Ditulis dalam bahasa arab) "Hai anak Adam, sesungguhnya Kami telah menurunkan kepadamu pakaian untuk menutup auratmu dan pakaian indah untuk perhiasan. Dan pakaian takwa itulah yang paling baik. Yang demikian itu adalah sebagian dari tanda-tanda kekuasaan Allah, mudah-mudahan mereka selalu ingat." (67 likes)

@nurma****: hallo... how come that you proud of a person who is less faith... and you do support her to decrease her faith. Very pretty, gorgeous, beautiful. Oh my God! You said that with the reason of personal choice. Everybody has her own personal option but they may not disobey God's rule.

(Hey heloooo org lg turun imannya malah dibangga2in loh ini, malah byk yg support utk lbh turun lg imannya. Cantik bgt, gorgeous, beautiful. Astagfirullah Allah Ya Rabb..! Dgn dalih setiap org punya pilihannya masing2. Ya memang setiap org punya pilihannya masing2 tp tdk dgn melanggar perintah Allah. (65 likes)

@meino***: only human that causes your heartbreak, why do you keep your distance to Allah, dear? (95 likes)

(yg bikin sakit hati manusia, knp yg dijauhin Allah ka?:((95 likes)

@aldyyiy: do not blame your hijab, because hijab does not have any mistake. May Allah bless you the best thing.

(jangan pelempiaskan jilbab mu, karena jilbab nda ada salah nya , semoga kamu di kasih kan yang terbaik chel oleh Allah 🙏🙏 (33 likes)

@remahardi***: I think, not wearing hijab when we have problem is bad attitude. Moreover, she has been a mom for her two kids. She is really temper and not really faithful. The best thing to do when you have problem in life is being faithful and ask help from God. You may not make any sin by opening hijab. God, sorry for it. May God bless her. Amen. You have to tell her about this. (2 likes)

(Kayanya kalau untuk lepas hijab jika ada masalah tidak baik banget ya, apalagi udh jadi ibu ibu punya anak 2,labil banget, iman nya tipis, harusnya kalau emg ada masalah atau apapun dihidup makin diperkuat imannya minta ke Allah, eh malah berbuat dosa dengan lepas hijab astagfirullah,semoga diberi hidayah ya aamiin @rachelvennya, wajib beri tahu nih @okintph (2 likes)

@kloro***: you are sinful!

(Berdosa kau!!!!)

The above comments seem to give judgment on what the celeb-gram did in her action of removing the hijab. Quoting verses from the holy book, then hoping to return to the right path, as if hinting at what the celeb-gram did in his decision to take off the hijab is something that is

not commendable. Thus, it must refer to the holy book again. There is also a phrase giving judgment that what she did was a sin.

Besides that, there are also hate speeches that invite others to disagree with their comments who are in a positive narrative stance-taking position. Their comments regretted the account users who supported Rachel Vennya's celeb-gram decision by writing some comparison sentences as follows;

@brave.pits : those who support her are in the same ideology. They do not wear veil. It is so true that bad people will support bad person. (29 likes)

(Rata rata yg dukung yg sejenis dia alias sm" gk berhijab...ia dong yg sesat bakal dukung sesat 🤔) (29 likes)

@pandu_winata27 : Nikita Mirzani, Rina Nose, Salma do not wear veil anymore and you give bad comment from top to toe... you act as if you were the sinless people.. but then, when Rachel Vennya does not wear veil anymore... what's wrong with you all?

(Nikita Mirzani, rina nose, salma lepas Hijab Kelen hujat sampe Ke akar...seolah netijen adalah manusia Paling Suci...Giliran Rachel Vennya yg lepas Hijab? Knp lu pada?)

@ticaaaaw : why do many people admire when Rachel Vennya does not wear veil anymore? While all of you insult Rina Nose and Nikita Mirzani when they do not wear veil anymore? Really want to ask.

(Kenapa waktu Rachel vennya lepas hijab, banyak orang pada muji. Sementara pas rina nose atau nikita mirzani lepas, semua org pada ngehujat? Wk #benerannanyabun)

@laylaalf.21 : Salmafina did not wear veil anymore and all people in Indonesia insulted her, but they support Rachel Vennya when she did not wear veil anymore. How funny people in my country. (27 likes)

(Salmafina lepas hijab di hujat se indo, rachel vennya lepas hijab di dukung, lucunya people di negeriku ini 🤔🤔🤔) (27 likes)

The comments above show that it is very unfair if an artist who removes the hijab gets support. This is because there were several previous artists who removed their hijab and they got a bad response and even blasphemy. They asked about the reason why they were different, even though they did the same thing.

4 Conclusion

The purpose of this study is to describe the forms of hate speech against female celebrities, commonly referred to as celeb-gram, judged by society. The results of this study indicate that hate speech against female celebrity @rachelven is that she received negative judgments and comments from netizens by using religious statements and social norms. The netizens provide comments by quoting verses from the scriptures, giving bad labels, and giving judgments for Rachel Vennya's attitude.

Misogyny or hatred of women in this digital era is getting easier to express. This hate speech is shown by how the netizens convey their disappointment by regretting the celeb-gram's decision. Then, there are many statements which adopted from the verse in the holy book and state that the actions taken by the celebrity are sinful. There were also dislike

comments regarding support comments to the celebrity @rachelven when removing the hijab and they gave a comparison that some artists were insulted when removing the veil while she is supported. A statement appears that those who are good looking will receive support.

References

- [1] M. Imam, "Pengguna Instagram di Indonesia didominasi Wanita dan Generasi Milenial," 2020. <https://www.goodnewsfromindonesia.id/2020/06/14/pengguna-instagram-di-indonesia-didominasi-wanita-dan-generasi-milenial>.
- [2] Nickysky, "Maraknya Komen Negatif di Media Sosial," *Kumparan.com*, 2020. <https://kumparan.com/nicky05tan/maraknya-komentar-negatif-di-sosialmedia-1uTNMS8NJ5Y/full> (accessed Mar. 14, 2021).
- [3] Kumparan.com, "Netizen Indonesia Paling Enggak Sopan di Asia Tenggara," 2021. <https://kumparan.com/kumparantech/netizen-indonesia-paling-enggak-sopan-di-asia-tenggara-1vEtxsSJaE/full> (accessed Mar. 14, 2021).
- [4] A. Georgakopoulou, "Thinking big with small stories in narrative and identity analysis," *Narrat. Inq.*, vol. 16, no. 1, pp. 122–130, 2006.
- [5] M. Bamberg and A. Georgakopoulou, "Small stories as a new perspective in narrative and identity analysis," 2008.
- [6] A. De Fina and A. Georgakopoulou, "Analysing narratives as practices," *Qual. Res.*, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 379–387, 2008.
- [7] A. Georgakopoulou, "Small stories research & social media: The role of narrative stance-taking in the circulation of a Greek news story," *Working Papers in Urban Language & Literacies*, vol. 100. King's College London, pp. 1–18, 2013.
- [8] R. Englebretson, *Stancetaking in discourse: Subjectivity, evaluation, interaction*, vol. 164. John Benjamins Publishing, 2007.
- [9] J. T. Wood and N. Fixmer-Oraiz, *Gendered lives*. Cengage Learning, 2018.
- [10] J. Manning, "Social media," *Defin. Classes*, 2014.
- [11] C. Fuchs, *Social media: A critical introduction*. Sage, 2021.
- [12] I. Maya-Jariego and D. H. Ramos, *Homophily*, vol. 2. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publication, 2014.
- [13] R. Cohen-Almagor, "Freedom of expression v. social responsibility: Holocaust denial in Canada," *J. Mass Media Ethics*, vol. 28, no. 1, pp. 42–56, 2013.