Quality Criteria for Educational Games

P.M. Escudeiro¹,*, N.F. Escudeiro¹, R.M. Reis¹, A. Barata¹ and R.Vieira¹

¹ISEP – GILT, Rua Dr. António Bernardino de Almeida, 431, 4200-072 Porto Portugal

Abstract

The development of software products in general and educational games in particular is a very demanding process involving costly resources for long periods of time. Evaluating its quality throughout the development lifecycle contributes to the early identification of imperfections and to improved efficiency.

In this paper we discuss a set of quality criteria and a method to assess the quality of educational games. These quality criteria are based on the functional requirements of the system and structured into two groups: general and specific. General criteria refer to the set of criteria that are common to all educational games in a given study area. Specific criteria refer to those criteria particularly addressing a specific educational purpose. We also present a quality model that is based on the software engineering paradigms. This model, called Quantitative Evaluation Framework, provides a quantitative measure for the quality of an educational game.

Keywords: Game-Based Learning, Assessment; Quantitative Evaluation; Educational Software, Educational Games, Quality Criteria Classification for games.

Received on 30 October 2012; accepted on 09 January 2013; published on 20 March 2013

Copyright © 2013 Escudiero *et al.*, licensed to ICST. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution licence (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/), which permits unlimited use, distribution and reproduction in any medium so long as the original work is properly cited.

doi: 10.4108/trans.gbl.01-06.2013.e3

1. Introduction

The development of digital learning content, especially the development of educational games, is a very demanding process requiring efficient control throughout its development cycle.

Our proposal allows assessing quantitatively the quality of a software product, in general, at a final pre-release stage as well as at any moment during the development lifecycle (Bates, 2000). In this paper we discuss the application of our proposal to a particular type of software product: educational games.

Our proposal is based on a quality measure addressing the user needs related to the educational game objective. The quality is based on a set of requirements that are grouped in general and specific requirements. These requirements constitute the set of criteria that will be used to assess the quality of the educational game (Scalet et al., 2000).

General requirements are those that support the functionalities that are common to any educational game.

Specific requirements are those that assist the specific functionalities of each particular type of game being developed, such as adventure, action or serious games.

All the functional requirements of the educational game being developed are expected to be represented either as general or specific, thus contributing to assess the quality of the educational game. These are supposed to be identified and/or validated by an expert in the game design area at an early stage of the development.

Once identified, the quality criteria/requirements are assigned to factors. Each factor groups the subset of all the criteria that are relevant to it. A given requirement may be assigned to more than one factor. The relevance of a requirement to a concrete factor is established by a weight.

Factors on their own are grouped in dimensions. These dimensions define the quality space where the educational game will be evaluated.

A quantitative quality model is used to assess the quality of the educational game in this quality space at any stage during the development lifecycle. This model, called Quantitative Evaluation Framework (QEF), is suited to be applied to the development of any product. The quality space in QEF is adapted to a specific system though the

^{*}Corresponding author. Email: pmo@isep.ipp.pt

identification of proper quality dimensions, factors and requirements (quality criteria).

In the remainder of this paper we describe the QEF methodology, in Sections 2 and 3, followed by a description of the quality criteria defined to assess educational games, in Section 4. In Section 5, we present the application of QEF to a specific educational game. In Section 6, we present our conclusions.

2. Evaluation model philosophy

A simple question for any educational software should be, "can this product actually teach what it is supposed to?" It is a simple question to ask, but often difficult to answer because the product may have so many beguiling features. It requires the evaluator to recognize his/her own view of the way in which students learn, to relate that view to the learning objectives and to determine how and whether those objectives are accomplished by the educational game under development.

The application of QEF throughout the development lifecycle of a game highlights the flaws that are present in the current version at the time of evaluation (Bloom, 1964).. It allows the development team to focus on those flaws, guiding the development process towards the desirable outcome. Moderating the development of an educational game with QEF promotes the quality of the final product (Oliver, 2000).Moreover, it allows the early identification of flaws that can be corrected early in the development process thus avoiding unnecessary costs due to the effects of error propagation.

The QEF quality space is an n-dimensional Euclidean space. Each dimension represents one particular major quality aspect to consider taking into consideration the type of product being developed, its end use and objectives. For educational games we consider a three-dimensional space. The dimensions assumed to be of relevance for educational games are: Pedagogical; Technical and Organizational.

Every dimension aggregates a set of factors deemed to be relevant from its own perspective. A factor is a component that represents the system performance from a particular point of view. The dimensions and the factors that constitute the quality space are defined by the content expert, in our example by the Game Learning expert.

Quality is directly dependent on the perceived differences between deployed and designed functionality.

3. Quality assessment methodology

The quality of the educational software, especially educational games, depends on the context and the target aimed by the learning system. These characteristics set the relevant evaluation factors. In concrete, the quality of a given educational software system, q, is defined in a tridimensional quality space, Q. Quality is computed in comparison to an hypothetic ideal system, I, whose quality is assumed to be 100%.

The fitness of the deployed educational software system, with regards to its final purpose, is evaluated over a set of core properties that it must exhibit to fulfil its purpose and achieve its aims. These desirable properties are the evaluation criteria that we rely on.

The quality of a given system is computed from the distance between the ideal system, I, assumed to have the coordinates (1,1,1) in our quality space, and the coordinates representing the system under evaluation at the evaluation moment.

Each dimension aggregates a set of factors. The coordinates of the real system are weighted means of the factors contributing to each quality dimension, Dim_i .

$$Dim_i = \sum_n (p_n \times factor_n), \sum_n p_n = 1, \forall_n p_n \in [0,1]$$
(1)

Where n is the number of relevant factors for the Dim_i dimension.

Each factor is computed by Equation 2 as the weighted mean of the fulfilment of the evaluation criteria directly contributing to it, pc_m . The weight of a given criterion, pr_m , is its relevance to the factor. These weights, defining the ideal system, are assigned by the content expert during the design stage of the educational game.

$$Factor_n = \frac{1}{\sum_m pr_m} \times \sum_m (pr_m \times pc_m)$$
(2)

The global deviation of the real system, which is represented by the coordinates (Dim_1, Dim_2, Dim_3) in our quality space, w.r.t. the ideal system, represented by the coordinates (1,1,1), is computed by the Euclidean distance between these two points in the quality space, according to Equation 3.

$$D = \sqrt{\sum_{j} \left(1 - \frac{Dim_j}{100}\right)^2} \tag{3}$$

The real system quality is then computed by Equation 4:

$$Q = 1 - \frac{D}{\sqrt{n}}, Q \in [0, 1]$$
 (4)

Or, in percentage (Equation 5):

$$q = \left(1 - \frac{D}{\sqrt{n}}\right) \times 100, q \in [0, 100]$$
 (5)

When defined this way, the quality, Q, is in the inverse proportion of the distance, D, between the ideal system and the real system, measured in the quality space. When D=0, then Q=1, and when D=D_{max}= \sqrt{n} , then Q=0.

3.1. Quality measurement process

The process to measure the quality of a given system includes the following steps:

- Setup phase, under the responsibility of the content experts
 - 1. Definition of the relevant dimensions of the quality space.
 - 2. Definition of the relevant factors for each dimension.
 - 3. Definition of the relevant requirements/ evaluation criteria given the system context and aims.

- 4. Tuning of weights, including p_n , the weight of factors to dimensions and pr_m , the weight of requirements/evaluation criteria w.r.t. factors.
- Deployment phase, under the responsibility of the content experts, system evaluators and development team
 - 1. Evaluation of the fulfillment percentage of each requirements/evaluation criteria, pc_m .
 - 2. Compute the performance achieved by each dimension (Equation 1).
 - 3. Compute global deviation in quality space (Equation 3).
 - 4. Compute quality (Equations 4 and 5).

Setup phase

In this phase, previous to any evaluation, we must define the ideal system, our golden standard for the system/content to be evaluated.

Dimensions and Factors

The definition of the quality space structure, including the quality dimensions and factors, are determined by the field domain and context of the system/content being developed. Once defined, the same quality space structure can be used to evaluate any system in the same domain.

Relevance of factors to dimensions

For each dimension we must set the importance of the relevant factors. Each factor being relevant to a dimension will contribute to it with a weight that is proportional to its importance for the dimension. These weights are such that each has a value between 0 (the factor is not relevant to the dimension) and 1 (the factor is the only one being relevant to the dimension). The weights associating factors to a dimension sum to 1 (see Equation 1 above).

Factors and evaluation criteria

The requirements/evaluation criteria might be relevant or not to each factor. Their relevance are more dependent on the specific system/content being developed than factors or dimensions. There are probably some generic criteria, that are valid for all the systems in a given domain, but there are probably also many more that are specific to a given system in particular. These requirements/evaluation criteria must be set by experts in the domain and in the specific area addressed by the system under evaluation.

The criteria weights w.r.t. factors are volatile with a rather subjective nature. To assure some robustness to the quality measure we have restricted these weights to a limited set of discrete values ranging between 0 (non-relevant criteria) and 10 (core criteria) according to the following scale:

10- Fundamental, crucial

- 8 Very important
- 6 Important
- 4 Necessary
- 2 Optional
- 0 Non-relevant

3.2. Deployment phase

Having the evaluation framework previously set at the setup

phase, including the quality space structure (dimensions and factors) and the corresponding evaluation criteria, we may now use it to evaluate the system and compute its quantitative quality value.

The evaluation is based on the percentage of fulfilment that is achieved by the system under evaluation for each of the evaluation criteria previously set.

The task to be performed by the evaluators of the system is the assignment of these fulfilment percentages to each of the evaluation criteria. Once this is performed, the rest is automatic and the several quality indicators become be immediately available.

It is very important to have a very good selection of the evaluation criteria. These criteria, when evaluated, should provide a correct view of the system performance.

4. Quality criteria for games

Regarding to educational software in general we have had previously establish a common definition for the quality space (Escudeiro and Bidarra, 2006)that is adapted in this paper for educational games in particular.

The dimensions of our quality space for educational games in particular are: Pedagogical; Technical and Organizational. The **Pedagogical dimension** reflects the characteristics of the educational game related to the teaching/learning procedure supported by the learning criteria. Learning is determined by several factors involving the interrelationship between individuals. This dimension aggregates three factors: Pedagogical Approach; Content Organization and Trainee's tools.

The **Technical dimension** reflects the technical characteristics of the educational game related to software design and development. These are the characteristics that might guarantee overall performance, easy and safe use (Wisner, Fialho & Santos 1995) i.e., the aspects that are directly related to the technical and ergonomic aspects of the educational game. This dimension adds, among others, the following factors: User Interface; Interaction; Game Play and Socio-Cultural aspects.

The **Organizational dimension** reflects the characteristics of the educational game regarding to its operational aspects.

This dimension is determined by one factor: Administration Tools.

Table 1 presents the general quality criteria that contribute to each evaluation factor. General quality criteria are those supporting common functionalities to any educational game.

Table 1. General quality criteria for educational games

Dimensions	Factor	Quality Criteria
Pedagogical	Pedagogical Approach	Learning objectives are clearly defined and focused on the specific learning domain to be addressed (eventually referring to Bloom's taxonomy: Cognitive, Affective, and Psychomotor)



PedagogicalSelf-assessment tools are available (diagnostic evaluation, summative evaluation, summative evaluation and self- assessment)User interface (screens) contribute to motivate the trainees information Graphics and pictures provide useful informationSelf-learning training is provide useful definedThe pedagogical prerequisites were definedThe sound used enhances information The padagogical methodologiesContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trastworthy.The content is valid and trastworthy.The pedagogical methodologiesThe content is valid and trastworthy.The content is valid and trastworthy.The organization objectives.The content is valid and timely addressing the learning objectives.The chain corresponds to the target group needsThe presentation of concepts is clear and timely addressing the learning objectives.TechnicalThe torkic is clear, simple and degibleThe chain clear, sccurate, and conciseThe torkic is dear, simple and degibleThe torkic idear, simple and degibleTrainee's toolsTrainee are allowed to usonitie help technicalTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progress		D. 1	Q 10		II I C	TT1
Pedagogical Approach ar available (diagnostic evaluation, formative evaluation, summative evaluation, summative evaluation and self-assessment) the user inferface Self-learning training is provided if required The pedagogical Text enhances provide if required The pedagogical The same can be integrated in different pedagogical methodogies The gram can be integrated in different pedagogical methodogies The content is valid and trastworthy. The content is valid and trastworthy. The content is reflective addressing the learning objectives. The content orresponds to the target audience. The index or intimities of the target audience. The organization The content is reflective addressing the learning objectives. The content is reflective addressing the learning objectives. The content is reflective learning objectives. The training process The technical errors. The technical errors. The user and league without reading the manuals or instructions are clear, accurate, and concise Written Spocks and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistent throughout the course and is carried out easily applied. The technical errors. Trainee's tools Trainee has access to his/hers grading and progress. The baser and and progress. Written Specas Trainee has no runtime errors. The baser and provide to use and provide oreas and proses to his/hers grading and progress.		Pedagogical	Self- assessment tools		User Interface	The items presented in
Processesevaluation, formative evaluation and self- assessment)(encrems) contribute to motivate the trainces informationSelf-learning training is provided if required The pedagogical prerequisites were definedThe polagogical previde useful informationThe pedagogical prerequisites were definedThe polagogical previde useful informationThe content organizationThe content is valid and trastworthy.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content is cellceive addressing the learning objectives.The content is cellceive addressing the learning objectives.The organizationThe organization of concepts is clear and timely and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe content supports an effective learning processWriten/spoken content supports an effective learning processThe chical terminology of the field being taught is propriate and consistent terminology of the field being taught is propriate and consistentTraince's toolsTraince are allowed to use online help to bishers grading and progressTraince's toolsTraine has access to his/hers grading and progressThe symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentThe is traine has access to his/hers grading and progress	Pedagogical	Approach	are available (diagnostic			the user interface
cvaluation, summative evaluation and self- assessment)motivate the trainees informationSelf-learning training is provided if required The pane can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe same can be informationContent Organization The content is valid and trustworthy.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content orresponds to the torresponds to the torresponds to the torresponds to the target group needs.The is adequateThe organization structuring and sequencing of content supports a clear, accurate, and conciseThe is adequateThe torse of grammatical and system is first clear, simple and legibleThe isones are allowed to use online help carried out casify applied.Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe symbols and/or mative for help target auging and provided in each screen (cg. next, provious page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progress			evaluation, formative			(screens) contribute to
evaluation and self- assessment)Text enhances informationSclf-learning training is provided if required integrated in different pedagogical prerequisites were definedThe sound used enhances informationThe game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe video used enhances informationContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trastworthy. The content corresponds to the target group needs. The content is cellective addressing the learning objectives.InteractionThe organization, sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalTrainee's toolsThe text is clear, simple and consistent trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressTechnicalTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game san or runtime croros			evaluation, summative			motivate the trainees
Self-learning training is provided if requiredinformationThe pedagogical pedagogical methodologiesThe sound used enhances informationOrganizationThe game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe content is valid and trustworthy.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content of the content or organization objectives.The ferent is valid and trustworthy.The content is reflective addressing the learning objectives.The interaction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content is approvidedTechnicalThe text is clear, simple and legible The text is clear, simple and legible The text is clear, simple and consistent throughout the course and consistent throughout t			evaluation and self-			Text enhances
Self-learning training is provided if required The pedagogical prerequisites were definedGraphics and pictures provided useful informationThe game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe video used enhances informationThe video used enhances informationContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.The content organization of the target group needsThe content is effective addressing the learning objectives.The interaction with the target addienceThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning grocessThe interaction are conciseThe user can play the game without reading the manualsWritten/spoken content is fire of granmatical and egibleThe text is clear, simpla and consistent through the proprivid applied terminology of the field being target is providedSequencing of content sing providedTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each traine has access to his/hers grading and progressFereback of user actions is providedTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpEach traine has access to his/hers grading and progress			assessment)			information
Image of the symbolsImage of the symbols			Self-learning training is			Graphics and pictures
The pedagogical perequisities were definedinformationThe game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe video used enhances informationContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.The content corresponds to the target group needsThe content corresponds to the target audienceThe content corresponds to the target group needsThe content corresponds to the target audienceThe content corresponds to the target group needsThe content corresponds to the target audienceThe content corresponds to the target group needsThe content corresponds to the target audienceThe content is effective addressing the learning objectives.The content is effective tegame without reading the game without reading the game without reading the game without reading the game without reading the manualsThe test is clear, simple and legibleThe test is clear, simple and legibleThe test is clear, simple and legibleThe test is clear, simple and legibleTraince's toolsTraince are allowed to use online help Each traine has access to his/hers grading and providedTraince's toolsTraince has access to his/hers grading and providedTraince's toolsEach traine has access to his/hers grading and providedTraince's toolsTraince has access to his/hers grading and providedTraince's toolsTraine has ac			provided if required			provide useful
prerequisites were defined The game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe sound used enhances informationContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.The interaction with the system is intuitive for the target group needs.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content is effective addressing the learning objectives.InteractionThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyThe character and timelyThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors. The tect is clear, simple and legibleThe trust is clear, simple and legibleThe technical terminology of the field being tanght is properly appliedTrainees are allowed to use online help Each trainec has access to his/hers grading and progressTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each traine has access to his/hers grading and progress			The pedagogical			information
Image: defined The game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesinformation The video used enhances informationContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy. The content orresponds to the target group needs The content orresponds to the target group needs The content or foresponds to the target group needs The content or foresponds to the target audienceInteraction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedThe symbols and/or metaphor is appropriat and legibleThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseTraince's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each traince has access to his/hers grading and progressThe instruction as providedTraince's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe isacess to his/hers grading and providedTraince's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe isaces accurate, and consistentTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe bas norunime errors			prerequisites were			The sound used enhances
The game can be integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesThe video used enhances informationContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content is valid and trustworthy.The content is effective addressing the learning objectives.InteractionThe interaction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyThe interaction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The trust is clear, accurate, and conciseThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, accurate, and conciseThe text is clear, simple and consistent throughout the course and consistent throughout the course and consistent throughout the course and consistent throughout the course and consistent throughout is consistent throughout			defined			information
Integrated in different pedagogical methodologiesinformation The commutication speed between user and game is adequateContentThe content is valid and trustworthy. The content corresponds to the target group needsInteractionThe conton with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe content is offective addressing the learning objectives. The presentation of concepts is clear and timelyInteractionThe interaction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleMultiple types of navigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			The game can be			The video used enhances
pedagogical methodologiesThe communication speed between user and game is adequateContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.InteractionThe content corresponds to the target group needsInteractionThe content is effective addressing the learning objectives.InteractionThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processThe chinition of technical errors.Written/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and syntactical errors.Traince's toolsTrainces are allowed to usephoris a consistent throughout the conset advanced, etc.)Traince's toolsTraines are allowed to usephoris are allowed to to is/hers grading and progressTraines's toolsTraines has access to his/hers grading and progress			integrated in different			information
methodologiesspeed between user and game is adequateContent OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.InteractionThe content corresponds to the target group needs to the target group needs to the target group needs addressing the learning objectives.InteractionThe content is effective addressing the learning objectives.The offentiation of concepts is clear and timelyThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and consistentThe text is clear, simple and consistentTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to us/spressTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to us/spressEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			pedagogical			The communication
Content OrganizationThe content is valid and trustworthy.game is adequateOrganizationThe content corresponds to the target group needsInteractionThe interaction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe content is effective addressing the learning objectives.The content is effective addressing the learning objectives.InteractionThe interaction with the system is intuitive for the target audienceThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyTechnicalThe offinition of technical expertise required from the user is providedThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content is processTechnicalThe user can play the game without reading the manualsThe is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedNavigation is consistent mavigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedTrainee's toolsEach traine has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			methodologies			speed between user and
Organizationtrustworthy. The content corresponds to the target group needs The content is effective addressing the learning objectives. The presentation of concepts is clear and timelyInteractionThe interaction with the system is intuitive for the target addience The definition of technical expertise required from the user is providedThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors. The text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and syntactical errors. The text is clear, simple and legibleRaig and syntactical errors. The text is clear, simple and source of the field being taught is properly appliedRaig and syntactical errors. The text is clear, simple and consistent throughout the course and consistent and consistent throughout the course and consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use conline helpCe., next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors		Content	The content is valid and			game is adequate
The content corresponds to the target group needssystem is intuitive for the target audienceThe content is effective addressing the learning objectives.The definition of technical expertise required from the user is providedThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyTechnicalThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalThe user can play the game without reading the manualsWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and legibleThe player can change the difficulty levelThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleMavigation is consistent throughout the course and scarried out easily terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedgame play (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpEach traine has access to his/hers grading and progressThe basic navigation accusators providedTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors		Organization	trustworthy.		Interaction	The interaction with the
to the target group needs The content is effective addressing the learning objectives.Target audienceThe ortent is effective addressing the learning objectives.The definition of technical expertise required from the user is providedThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyTechnicalThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.TechnicalThe user can play the game without reading the manualsThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly and consistent throw is appropriate and consistent the symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistent this/hers grading and progressThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainees access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			The content corresponds			system is intuitive for the
The content is effective addressing the learning objectives.The definition of technical expertise required from the user is providedThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and legibleThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedgame playNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easily.Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpThe play can shown on untime terminology and progressThe play the game vithout reading the manualsTrainee's toolsTrainees access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			to the target group needs			target audience
addressing the learning objectives.technical expertise required from the user is providedThe presentation of concepts is clear and timelyThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalWritten'spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and legibleThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedgame play throughout the course and consistent throughout the course and consistent The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistent to his/hers grading and progressgame playNavigation is consistent (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			The content is effective			The definition of
objectives.The presentation of concepts is clear and timelyThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The technicalThe technicalterminology of the field being taught is properly appliedTraince's toolsTraince's toolsTraince'			addressing the learning			technical expertise
The presentation of concepts is clear and timelyprovidedThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.TechnicalThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe tight is properly appliedThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe tight is properly appliedTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)The game has no runtime progressThe game has no runtime errors			objectives.			required from the user is
concepts is clear and timelyThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalThe instructions are clear, accurate, and conciseWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and is carried out easilyThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and is carried out easilygame playMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Multiple types of navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpThe back crean extremance has access to his/hers grading and progressThe syndiag and progressEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			The presentation of			provided
timelyTechnicalclear, accurate, and conciseThe organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalThe user can play the game without reading the manualsWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			concepts is clear and			The instructions are
The organization, structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processTechnicalconciseWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The player can change the difficulty levelThe player can change the difficulty levelThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame play and is carried out easilyNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame play and is carried out easilyNavigation is consistent and is carried out easilyThe text is providedgame play and is carried out easilyMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			timely			clear, accurate, and
structuring and sequencing of content supports an effective learning processThe user can play the game without reading the manualsWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The player can change the difficulty levelThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame playThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame playNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe text is properly appliedgame playThe symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			The organization,	Technical		concise
sequencing of content supports an effective learning processgame without reading the manualsWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The player can change the difficulty levelThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleFeedback of user actions is providedThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedgame playNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpGe.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			structuring and			The user can play the
supports an effective learning processmanualsWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.The player can change the difficulty levelThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame playNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedgame playNavigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedThe symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedThe game has no runtime errors			sequencing of content			game without reading the
learning processThe player can change the difficulty levelWritten/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.Feedback of user actions is providedThe text is clear, simple and legibleMavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainee sare allowed to use online helpEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedThe game has no runtime to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			supports an effective			manuals
Written/spoken content is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.the difficulty levelThe text is clear, simple and legibleFeedback of user actions is providedThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame playThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			learning process			The player can change
is free of grammatical and syntactical errors.Feedback of user actions is providedThe text is clear, simple and legibleThe text is clear, simple and legibleRechnical throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainees are allowed to use online helpThe symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentTrainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			Written/spoken content			the difficulty level
and syntactical errors.is providedThe text is clear, simple and legiblegame playNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			is free of grammatical			Feedback of user actions
The text is clear, simple and legiblegame playNavigation is consistent throughout the course and is carried out easilyThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpReach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			and syntactical errors.			is provided
and legiblethroughout the course and is carried out easilyThe technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainees are allowed to use online helpEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is provided			The text is clear, simple		game play	Navigation is consistent
The technical terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedand is carried out easilyMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentTrainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			and legible		0 1 9	throughout the course
terminology of the field being taught is properly appliedMultiple types of navigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			The technical			and is carried out easily
being taught is properly appliednavigation are supported (e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			terminology of the field			Multiple types of
applied(e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistent(e.g. for beginners, advanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpincluded in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			being taught is properly			navigation are supported
The symbols and/or metaphor is appropriate and consistentadvanced, etc.)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpTrainees are allowed to use online helpincluded in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			applied			(e.g. for beginners.
metaphor is appropriate and consistentThe basic navigation activators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online help(e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			The symbols and/or			advanced, etc.)
and consistentactivators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpactivators (buttons) are included in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			metaphor is appropriate			The basic navigation
Trainee's toolsTrainees are allowed to use online helpincluded in each screen (e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			and consistent			activators (buttons) are
use online help(e.g. next, previous page, return to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors		Trainee's tools	Trainees are allowed to			included in each screen
Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressreturn to home)Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			use online help			(e.g. next, previous page.
to his/hers grading and progressA help button is providedEach trainee has access to his/hers grading and progressThe game has no runtime errors			Each trainee has access			return to home)
progress provided Each trainee has access to his/hers grading and progress The game has no runtime errors			to his/hers grading and			A help button is
Each trainee has access The game has no runtime to his/hers grading and errors			progress			provided
to his/hers grading and progress			Each trainee has access			The game has no runtime
progress			to his/hers grading and			errors
			progress	L		

		The software has an	
T 1 1 1		efficient programmatic	
Technical		structure	
	Socio-Cultural	The game is easily	
	aspects	converted to several	
	-	languages	
		No offensive content or	
		stereotypes in terms of	
		gender, race, religion,	
		cultural diversity is	
		included	
		No content inciting to	
		violence is included	
		The language used is	
		suitable for various races	
		and cultures	
	Administration	Crash recovery tools are	
	tools	included	
		Backup procedures are	
		included	
		There are tools that	
		prohibit unauthorized	
		access to the game	
		The administrator is able	
		to determine access	
		rights for trainers and	
		trainees	
		Usage statistics are	
Organizational		provided	
		Game content can be	
		efficiently updated	
		The number of	
		simultaneous online	
		users is configurable	
		Terms and conditions for	
		using the learning	
		resources are included	
		Remote access is	
		included	

These generic requirements together with the specific requirements still under validation are being the base for the design of the educational game being presented in this paper.

5. Game engine supporting the game-learning document

The general quality criteria presented above are defined and validated during the initial stage of the development lifecycle of the educational game. In parallel, the development team produces the design document, which presents the analysis and design of the educational game to be developed.

The game engine supporting the final product is not a constraint for the application of QEF. In our case, the game is being developed using the e-Adventure game engine (Adventure Game Engine - Copyright © 2012 Sylvain

Seccia) This game engine is directed to assist the development of adventure educational games.

The development lifecycle (Figure 1) is guided by a set of learning objectives previously established. These objectives supply guidelines to define the programming classes used in the development of the educational game (Figueiredo 2005). The first stage of the development lifecycle is to set the target audience and then the general learning objectives. In the following step the specific learning objectives are set on the basis of the previously defined general objectives.

Once the specific learning objectives are set, we start to build the Game-Learning Document. This document establishes a relationship between the Pedagogic Domain and the Game Domain.



Figure 1. Development lifecycle

The Game-Learning Document is built according to the model supported by the e-Adventure game engine. By filling in this document the developers assure a direct association between the learning objectives and the technical development supported by this game engine. Figure 2 shows exactly the breakdown of these elements and how they are associated.



Figure 2. Relationship between pedagogic and game domains

The model also contemplates the hidden curriculum associated with gaming and pedagogical activities. Its objectives are deeply associated not with the game structure in itself but rather with graphics, audio and interaction Figure 3.

Annex I shows a sample of a Game-Based Learning Document, and of what can be extracted from it.



Figure 3. Behavioural domain relationship with digital game elements

6. Conclusion

This paper discusses a model and a set of criteria aimed to assess the quality of educational games. These criteria were established to assist the quality control of any educational game throughout its development lifecycle. Quality criteria are organized in two distinct groups: general and specific requirements.

These criteria are the base of a quality model that supports a quantitative assessment of the quality of any educational software. We show how to tailor it to the specific case of educational games. We demonstrate the application of this model to control the quality of a specific educational game designed to stress the importance of digital arts to present concepts like architecture in the Old City of Jerusalem.

Acknowledgements.

This research was supported by GILT (Graphic Interaction and Learning Technology).

References

- A. Dias Figueiredo (2005), Context Engineering: And is Development Research Agenda, Universidade Coimbra, 2005
- [2] Bates Tony, (2000), A. W. Tony Managing Technological Change: Strategies for College and University Leaders. San Francisco, 2000
- [3] Bloom Bertram B. Mesia, and David R. Krathwohl, (1964), Bloom B. S. Taxonomy of Educational Objectives,: The Affective Domain & The Cognitive Domain. New York: David McKay Co Inc.
- [4] Escudeiro, Paula; Bidarra José, (2006), X-TEC: Techno Didactical Extension for Instruction/Learning Based on Computer – A new development model for educational software, Setúbal, Portugal, WEBIST 2006.
- [5] Oliver 2000, Oliver M, Evaluating online teaching and learning, Information Services and Use, vol 20 (2/3)
- [6] , Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, 1991.
- [7] Scalet et al, 2000, ISO/IEC 9126 and 14598 integration aspects: The Second World Congress on Software Quality, Yokohama, Japan, 2000.
- [8] W, Fialho & apoud Santos 1995 Manual de análise ergonômica no trabalho. Curitiba:Gênesis, 1995.



GAME-BASED LEARNING DOCUMENT						
Pedago Doma	Pedagogical Domain Game Domain					
Didatical Unit	Digital Art	Game	Serious Game about Digital Art			
General L Object	earning tive	Know the sub-part of the digital art process development process concerning its exhibition placement	Chapter Name		Find the spot	
		Locate a suitable place for the exhibition of a digital art artifact knowing its essence and associated restrictions			Answer the phone call to know the essence and restrictions associated with the artifact exhibition	
Specific L Object	Specific Learning Objective Take the place location to the producers of the artifact Action/Item			Gather the GPS coordinates of the exhibition place		
					Go to the production studio and deliver the coordinates	
Hidden Curriculum						
Recognize the typical architecture of the Old City of Jerusalem			Bac	Background based on pictures of the Old City of Jerusalem		
Quotidian movement of the Old City of Jerusalem		Typical sounds and images of people and places of the Old City of Jerusalem				

ANNEX I - Game-Based Learning Document